STANDARDS, PROCEDURES AND PUBLIC APPOINTMENTS COMMITTEE

AGENDA

9th Meeting, 2010 (Session 3)

Tuesday 14 September 2010

The Committee will meet at 2.15 pm in Committee Room 4.

1. Decision on taking business in private: The Committee will decide whether to take items 3 and 4 in private.

2. Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland: The Committee will take evidence on the Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland's draft Revised Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland and then on the Commissioner's report CPA/2010/04 from—

   Karen Carlton, Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland.

3. Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland: The Committee will consider evidence taken from the Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland on the draft Revised Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies.

4. Work programme: The Committee will consider its work programme.

5. Commission on Scottish Devolution (in private): The Committee will consider a draft report.


Gillian Baxendine / Alison Walker
Clerks to the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee
Room TG.01
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
Tel: 0131 348 5239
Email: sppa.committee@scottish.parliament.uk
The papers for this meeting are as follows—

**Agenda item 2**

PRIVATE PAPER  
Revised Code for Consultation  
Consultation questionnaire  
PRIVATE PAPER

**Agenda item 4**

PRIVATE PAPER

**Agenda item 5**

PRIVATE PAPER  
PRIVATE PAPER

**Agenda item 6**

PRIVATE PAPER
Revised Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland

Consultation Version
June 2010
Revised Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland

Foreword

The value of public bodies

Public bodies play a crucial and valued role in the provision of advice to the Scottish Ministers and in the delivery of our public services. From delivering frontline health services to regulating and protecting our environment, from deciding on prisoners' parole to providing expert advice on building standards, from promoting tourism to funding and developing the arts, public bodies have a significant impact on our lives. Effectively governed public bodies led by able and engaged board members will go about their business in a way that best serves the people of Scotland.

Why scrutinise appointments to their boards?

The link between effective board appointments and effective service delivery should not be underestimated. The roles and responsibilities of board members are demanding. The process that results in the appointment of their non-executive board members must be thorough. It must also be one that people have confidence in and one that encourages participation. The independent scrutiny provided by the Public Appointments Commissioner for Scotland offers external validation of a process of appointment on merit that is open and fair.

Why do we have a code of practice?

The Public Appointments and Public Bodies etc. (Scotland) Act 2003 (the Act) created the position of Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland. The Act requires the Commissioner to prepare and publish a code of practice covering appointments made by the Scottish Ministers to non-executive positions on the boards of many of Scotland's public bodies. In a small number of cases Scottish Ministers do not make the appointment – it is made by HM the Queen on their recommendation. This document is the code in question. A full up-to-date list of the bodies covered by this code may be viewed on my website: www.publicappointments.org.
**Who is the code for?**

Everyone interested in the way the Scottish Ministers appoint people to the boards of our public bodies is welcome to read this code. It is designed for use by:

- the Scottish Ministers
- civil servants who implement the public appointment process on behalf of the Scottish Ministers
- members of selection panels who select and recommend to the Scottish Ministers applicants for positions on the boards of Scotland’s regulated public bodies.

**What guidance is available?**

This code is supported by comprehensive guidance produced by my office. The code outlines what is required to provide the people of Scotland with a public appointment process that is open, is fair and provides the Scottish Ministers with a choice of quality applicants.

The guidance provides information on:

- the rationale behind the requirements of the code
- the options open to the Scottish Ministers and civil servants when implementing the code
- how to apply the code’s requirements.

**How does the code support appointment?**

Scotland’s ministerial public appointment process is evolving. Gone are the days when appointment was based solely on the contacts a person has. Nowadays, appointment to a board is made on the basis of merit. Those applicants most able to demonstrate how they meet the requirements of a board role are the people who will be selected for appointment.

The Scottish Ministers must decide how best to attract the people they need to serve on a board. Publicity will be targeted at those people. The Scottish Ministers may choose whatever method of application best suits the post and the potential applicants - there is no need for cumbersome application forms. Applicants may be assessed using whatever method is most appropriate, perhaps through a traditional interview, or by using case-study methodology or an assessment centre approach. Again, the Scottish Ministers may choose whatever method of assessment best suits the post and the potential applicants.

The code offers flexibility, so that the most appropriate approach may be taken to publicity, application and assessment on every occasion, within the framework provided here.
How is implementation monitored?

This code and the accompanying guidance are straightforward documents. To make sure they are applied, I or my representative will scrutinise the approach planned and the processes used to make every non-executive appointment to a public body board. Independent scrutiny is part of every appointment, to make sure that the process complies – and is seen to comply – with the code’s principles and practices.

What happens if the requirements of the code can’t be – or aren’t – met?

There may be occasions when the requirements of the code do not fit with the particular circumstances of an appointment round. Whilst such occasions will be rare they must be considered. The Scottish Ministers and I will discuss the options available in the particular circumstance faced and I will advise on appropriate action.

When the requirements of the code are not met I will intervene. Depending on the circumstances, I may stop a round and ask the appointing minister to take corrective action, or I may be required to report the appointing minister to the Scottish Parliament. The fact that the Scottish Parliament has given me and my successors the powers to do so indicates the importance they place on a fair, open and merit-based public appointment process.

Karen Carlton
Public Appointments Commissioner for Scotland
June 2010
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Principles of the code</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section A  The code in context</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section B  Responsibilities</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section C  The skills and knowledge needed by the board are articulated by the appointing minister</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section D  The gaps in skills and knowledge are identified</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section E  The right people are attracted to apply</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section F  Appropriate assessment methods are used</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section G  The right people are recommended for appointment</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section H  The right people are appointed</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section I  Appointment decisions meet the needs of the board</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Annexes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annexes</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One  The planning meeting</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two  Requirements for information for applicants</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three  Glossary of terms</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Principles of the code

Two key principles underpin this code. They are the foundation of Scotland’s ministerial public appointment process. The principles balance the needs of applicants and potential applicants with the requirements of the public body and the expectations of the appointing minister who is ultimately responsible for the work of that body.

The two key principles are set out below with descriptions of what each means in practice.

**Applicant-focused**

Applying for a public appointment will be a positive and constructive experience. It will provide applicants with a fair and open opportunity to demonstrate their merit. Feedback will offer valuable information and will encourage applicants to take appropriate action in relation to future appointment opportunities. Applicants will:

- be treated professionally and with respect
- experience equality of opportunity and be treated fairly according to their specific needs
- be provided with clear and accurate information to enable them to assess their suitability for a role
- be given the opportunity to demonstrate their suitability
- be assessed in a way that is appropriate to the role
- have access to constructive and accurate feedback about their application
- have any concerns about their application or experience of the appointment process dealt with efficiently and courteously.

**Outcome-focused**

The Scottish Ministers will specify what they need the person to be appointed to bring to the board to support the public body. They will then appoint – and be seen to appoint – the person with the necessary skills and knowledge who is most able to contribute effectively to the work of the board in question. This will be achieved by:

- specifying and publicising the requirements of the public body in a way that encourages suitable people to apply
- using methods of application and assessment tailored to the post and to the people who apply
- ensuring that the people assessing applicants are skilled in analysis and assessment using the chosen methods
- appointing people on merit following a fair, open and appropriate selection process
- maintaining public confidence that selection decisions are transparent and meet the needs of boards
- making efficient and effective use of resources.

Together these principles form the basis of an appointments system designed to offer the Scottish Ministers a choice of suitable applicants, so that, on every occasion, they may appoint the applicants who best meet the needs of the board and the body in question.

The code provides information on what is required during every appointment round to translate these principles into practice.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
Section A – the code in context

A1 A purpose of the Act is to provide the people of Scotland with an open and fair ministerial public appointments system and, as far as is reasonably practicable, to afford everyone the opportunity to apply for a board position.

A2 The purpose of the public appointments system is to attract and appoint able people to lead Scotland’s public bodies in the delivery of efficient and effective public services.

A3 The purpose of this code is to ensure that public appointments are made on merit following an open and fair process.

A4 This diagram depicts the key activities that together create an open, fair and merit-based public appointment process.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments.
Section B - responsibilities

The Scottish Ministers

B1 Appointments to the boards of non-departmental public bodies are the responsibility of the Scottish Ministers who will

i. ensure that the requirements of relevant legislation are reflected in all appointment activity.

ii. ensure that all appointment activity meets the requirements of this code.

iii. be satisfied that practices applied at each stage of an appointment round are appropriate for the size and purpose of the public body and the post to be filled and that these practices make efficient use of resources. To confirm that appropriate practices have been applied, and have resulted in the required outcomes, a review on completion of a round will identify improvements to be made and good practice to be shared during future appointment rounds.

iv. ensure a full and complete audit trail is maintained for every appointment in relation to the requirements of this code. The record will consist of all relevant paperwork and electronic communications generated during an appointment round, with key decisions and actions clearly recorded. These records will be contemporaneous. Relevant paperwork will include minutes of meetings and notes of telephone conversations.

v. provide the Commissioner with whatever information he or she reasonably requires to perform his or her functions.

B2 If the requirements of the code are considered inappropriate for a particular appointment, the Scottish Ministers will discuss with the Commissioner the options available in the particular circumstance faced. The Commissioner will decide whether variation from the requirements of the code is appropriate and, if so, will inform the Scottish Ministers of the action they may take.

The Scottish Government

B3 The Scottish Government will have in place an effective system for making public appointments. Officials will

i. announce publicly all appointments, reappointments and extensions to appointment at the time they are made. Announcements will include:
   a) a short description of the body to which the appointment, reappointment or appointment extension has been made
   b) a brief summary of the skills and knowledge the individual brings to the role
   c) the length of term of the appointment, reappointment or extension

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
d) whether the appointment is remunerated and, if so, the remuneration amount

e) a statement indicating the extent to which to the appointment, reappointment or extension was made in line with the requirements of this code.

f) the activity noted in the political activity form completed by the successful applicant.

ii. maintain a list of regulated public appointments made. The list will be in the public domain and will be made available in accessible formats on request by members of the public. The list will set out:

a) all public bodies regulated by OCPAS
b) the names of the board members whose board member positions are regulated
c) the date of their initial appointment
d) the date, where applicable, of their reappointment
e) their term of appointment
f) the date on which their current appointment ends
g) the amount of remuneration received for that appointment.

iii. have in place an effective system for handling, and recording details of, all complaints about the appointment process. Records relating to complaints and to the investigation of complaints will be made available to the Commissioner on request.

**The Commissioner**

**B4** The Commissioner will ensure proportionate independent scrutiny of the methods and practices employed by the Scottish Ministers for appointments, reappointments and extensions to appointment terms. The Commissioner

i. will scrutinise any appointment activity in the way he or she believes to be most appropriate. This will normally be by assigning a representative to monitor compliance with this code at all, or selected, stages of an appointment or reappointment process.

ii. will inform the Scottish Ministers when the code is not being or has not been complied with and will ask that corrective action be taken.

iii. will take such action as deemed appropriate under the Act when material non-compliance with the code is not addressed by the Scottish Ministers.

iv. will refer complaints about the appointment process to the Scottish Government for resolution. The Commissioner will investigate all relevant and competent complaints that complainants believe have not been resolved following investigation by the Scottish Government.

**B5** Interpretation of the requirements of this code is a matter for the Commissioner. From time to time the Commissioner may issue guidance to clarify the code’s requirements; any such guidance has the statutory force of this code.
The selection panel

B6 Every appointment will involve a selection panel whose role is to identify suitable applicants and recommend the most suitable to the Scottish Ministers for appointment.

B7 Membership of the selection panel will normally include the Commissioner’s representative. The Scottish Ministers will decide on the remaining membership of the selection panel.

B8 Members of the selection panel will

i. remain the same throughout the appointment process.

ii. be familiar with the requirements of the code.

iii. be competent to fulfil their role on the panel.

iv. participate in a planning meeting at the start of an appointment round. They will ensure that the requirements of the planning meeting, outlined in annexe one, are met.

v. declare to their fellow panel members any conflicts of interest they may have that are relevant to their participation as a panel member. Where the conflict is considered significant enough to have an impact on either the outcome of the round or public perception of the outcome of the round, the matter will be referred to the Commissioner for consideration before the round can proceed.

B9 If a member of the selection panel knows, or knows of, one or more of the applicants, he or she will declare this, as well as the nature of the relationship, to their fellow panel members.

B10 Applicants to be invited for interview will be asked to inform the selection panel chair if they know one or more of the selection panel members.

B11 If the nature of any relationship between a selection panel member and an applicant means it may be inappropriate for the panel member to interview the applicant the panel chair will consult the Commissioner and agree appropriate action.
Section C – the skills and knowledge needed by the board are articulated by the appointing minister

C1 In advance of every appointment, reappointment or extension to a board member’s appointment term the Scottish Ministers will decide the skills and knowledge that are required on the board of the public body concerned to deliver its strategic objectives.

C2 The Scottish Ministers will consider whether the needs of a board will most effectively be met by an appointment, reappointment or extension to an appointment term. They will balance each decision to fill a place on a board through reappointment or term extension against the opportunity to increase the range of applicants and, ultimately, the diversity of the board by making a new appointment through open competition.

C3 Unless there is a statutory or other legally binding provision, the Scottish Ministers will determine the period for which the appointment, reappointment or term extension is to be made.

C4 When making an appointment the Scottish Ministers will review the current board members’ skills and knowledge, identify any gaps to be filled and communicate to the selection panel their requirements of the person to be appointed. For board member appointments this will require meaningful consultation with the chair of the public body.
Section D – the gaps in skills and knowledge are identified

D1 Selection panel members will ensure that the Scottish Ministers’ requirements are translated into clear statements of:

i. what the person appointed will be required to do.

ii. the skills and knowledge they will be required to demonstrate to be effective in the role.

D2 Selection panel members will agree with the Scottish Ministers an appointment plan designed to provide a choice of suitable applicants who meet their requirements.

D3 Once the plan has been agreed the Scottish Ministers may be kept informed about the progress of the appointment round. They will not be actively involved again until presented with a summary describing the applicants who meet their requirements and whom the selection panel recommend as most suitable for appointment.

D4 The Scottish Ministers may reappoint a board member to the same position once. Decisions to reappoint will be based on:

i. evidence of effective performance during the current term

ii. evidence that the member has the skills and knowledge required on the board at the time of reappointment and for the foreseeable reappointment period.

D5 The Scottish Ministers may extend a member’s appointment term. Before doing so they will obtain the written agreement of the Commissioner. Decisions to extend terms will be based on the relatively short term needs of the board and on:

i. evidence of effective performance during the current term

ii. evidence that the member has the skills and knowledge required on the board at the time of the extension and for the foreseeable period of the extended term.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
Section E – the right peoples are attracted to apply

E1 Publicity content and appropriate, resource-efficient publicity methods will be agreed by the selection panel.

E2 Publicity will explain that the appointment is regulated by OCPAS.

E3 Publicity will be designed to ensure as wide and diverse an audience as appropriate is made aware of the appointment opportunity.

E4 Publicity will be designed to attract applications from people most likely to meet the requirements of the role.

E5 Publicity will be designed to enable potential applicants to make an informed decision about whether they meet the requirements of the role. It will accurately reflect the skills and knowledge required of the individual to be appointed, the requirements of the role and the time commitment required and will state whether the position is remunerated; if remunerated, the amount will be indicated.

E6 Information about the role, the appointment timetable and the application and assessment methods will be available to everyone who expresses interest in the position. It will be made available on request in alternative accessible formats to reflect the differing needs of applicants.

E7 Publicity will make clear the fact that:

i. all information can be made available in alternative formats

ii. support will be available for anyone who reasonably requires help to apply.

E8 The appointment opportunity will be publicised once the Commissioner has approved the final versions of the material to be used in publicity. The minimum requirements for the material to be provided or otherwise made available to applicants are set out in annexe two.

E9 No individual from any source will be considered after the advertised closing date without the agreement of the selection panel and the Commissioner. Any change to the closing date will be fair to applicants and potential applicants.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
Section F – appropriate assessment methods are used

F1 The methods used to assess applicants will:
   i. be agreed by selection panel members
   ii. be open and transparent
   iii. remove, as far as is practicable, the impact of personal bias on selection decisions
   iv. provide applicants with fair and equal opportunities to demonstrate their merit.

F2 Assessment methods will be designed to ensure that the criteria for the role are met and will be capable of demonstrating that the criteria for the role have been met. The reasons for the particular assessment methods chosen will be recorded.

F3 Selection panel members will assess the merits of applicants against the criteria for the role using the methods they have agreed. New criteria will not be introduced during the appointment round.

F4 Assessment will be undertaken by individuals who are:
   i. competent to assess using the methods chosen
   ii. consistent in their assessment of individuals for each position to be filled
   iii. knowledgeable about equality and diversity issues and the impact that the chosen assessment methods may have on the outcome of the round.

F5 No individual may be appointed on the basis of written evidence alone.

F6 The selection panel will invite to interview those applicants who have demonstrated that their skills and knowledge most closely match the criteria specified as essential to merit interview.

F7 The collective decision made by the selection panel about which applicants to interview and which not to interview will be fully documented.

F8 At interview the selection panel will question to ensure that:
   i. each applicant is a fit and proper person to be appointed to the role for which they have applied
   ii. each applicant will be able to meet the time commitment required of the post.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
Section G – the right people are recommended for appointment

G1 The selection panel will collectively agree a summary of each applicant's performance during the appointment round. The applicant summary will set out the panel's decisions on how each applicant met, or failed to meet, each of the criteria for the role. The applicant summary will be sufficiently detailed to:

i. identify to the appointing minister the applicants who most closely match the criteria for the role and whom the panel recommend for appointment

ii. provide evidence that the panel decision is valid

iii. provide accurate and constructive feedback to each applicant who requests feedback on the panel's view of their suitability.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
Section H – the right people are appointed

H1 The applicant summary will be the basis of the minister’s appointment decision. To assist in the decision-making process the minister may wish to meet some or all of the recommended applicants. To underlin the openness of the appointment process the minister will involve the Commissioner in these meetings.

H2 There will be a written summary of:

i. the basis of the minister’s decision on whom to meet and not to meet

ii. the content of the meetings.

This information will form the basis of additional feedback provided on request to applicants who are recommended to the minister.

H3 There will be a written summary of the minister’s decisions on:

i. whom to appoint and whom not to appoint

ii. the reasons for these decisions.

This information will form the basis of additional feedback provided on request to applicants recommended to the minister.

H4 The selection panel and the minister will make their assessment on the basis of the information provided by each applicant during the appointment round.

H5 If at any point from the beginning of a round information about an applicant becomes known to a member or members of the selection panel that:

i. calls into question an applicant’s suitability for appointment

ii. may affect the credibility of the appointment process

iii. may affect the credibility of the public body concerned

they have a responsibility to share this with their colleagues on the selection panel. The panel will consider the potential impact of the information if the applicant were to be appointed.

H6 The consideration of such matters will take place openly and involve transparent investigation to establish the facts. The applicant concerned will be given an opportunity to respond before any final decision as to their suitability for appointment is made.
Section I – appointment decisions meet the needs of the board

I1 The Scottish Ministers will ensure that the person to be appointed is a fit and proper person for the role to which they are to be appointed. In practice, this requires:

i. verification of relevant information provided by the applicant

ii. confirmation that the individual’s conduct to date has been compatible with the principles of public life in Scotland

iii. confirmation that the individual has no inappropriate or unmanageable conflicts of interest incompatible with their appointment

iv. determining that the individual’s appointment is not barred by reference to the constitution of the body concerned by way of, for example, criminal offences or other relevant matters

v. ensuring that the individual agrees to be bound by the Members’ Code of Conduct for the body concerned.

I2 The minister will appoint the applicant whom he or she considers to be the closest match for the publicised requirements and who is most able to contribute effectively to the work of the board.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
Annexe One

The planning meeting

The chair of the selection panel will arrange a planning meeting of all panel members. Providing all panel members agree, this meeting may be conducted by video or teleconference. The purpose of this meeting is to ensure, to the satisfaction of all of the panel members, that:

i. the criteria for the role accurately reflect the requirements of the appointing minister and the position to be filled.

ii. the chair of the public body (or the representative of the body who will sit on the panel) has the opportunity to include the body’s specific requirements in the criteria.

iii. the criteria for the role are not unnecessarily restrictive.

iv. the methods used to publicise the opportunity are appropriate to the position/s to be filled.

v. the methods to be used to assess applicants are appropriate to the position/s to be filled.

vi. all panel members understand how to assess the merits of applicants objectively against the publicised criteria for a role.

When the panel determines it appropriate to delegate any assessment activity they must satisfy themselves of the ability to assess of the person or people to whom they delegate.

The panel chair is ultimately responsible for ensuring that the requirements of the code have been met. The Commissioner will assess compliance both at the planning meeting and for the remainder of the appointment round.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments
Annexe Two

Requirements for information to be provided as an application pack or otherwise made available to applicants

The minimum requirements are:

i. contact details for a named person whom applicants may approach with any specific queries regarding the post.

ii. information about what will happen at each stage of the appointment round; this will include reference to the fact that the minister may choose to meet applicants identified by the selection panel as suitable for appointment. If the selection panel has decided that it may seek further information from applicants during the first stage of assessment, applicants will be advised of this and of the potential arrangements and timescale.

iii. the appointment timetable.

iv. a copy of the publicity.

v. the role description.

vi. the person specification.

vii. specific documentation relevant to the post and/or the public body including details of any disqualifications from membership.

viii. information on the method of assessment that will be used to identify appointable applicants.

ix. material appropriate to the chosen assessment method, such as an application form.

x. information on probity and conflicts of interest and a declaration to be signed by the applicant acknowledging their understanding of these matters and confirming that their application is appropriate in this context.

xi. the Scottish Government’s monitoring form.

xii. a statement about Disclosure information where such information is required.

xiii. information on what will happen to documentation generated during the appointment round, advising that all information provided by the applicant will be provided to the Commissioner on the request of the Commissioner and advising that in applying the applicant is deemed to have consented to this.

xiv. the leaflet provided by OCPAS describing what an applicant can do if he or she wishes to make a complaint.

xv. information on how the appointment will be announced. This will include the requirement to publicise information about the individual appointed and his or her political activity within the past five years.

xvi. details of reimbursement of expenses incurred if the applicant is invited for interview.

Please refer to the glossary for definitions of terms specific to public appointments.
Annexe Three – glossary of terms

**Act**
The Public Appointments and Public Bodies etc. (Scotland) Act 2003.

**Applicant**
An individual who has applied for a role on a public body.

**Applicant summary**
A written summary of the performance of each applicant assessed that describes the selection panel’s combined view on how each applicant meets the criteria noted in the person specification.

**Application form**
A form which is completed by an individual to describe how he or she meets the requirements described in the person specification.

**Application pack**
A pack containing a range of documents relating to a specific appointment (see Annexe Two of the code for contents).

**Appointment plan**
A plan that sets out the actions to be taken and the timescales for this action for a specific appointment round.

**Appointment round**
The process of selecting an individual or individuals for appointment to the board of a public body.

**Assessment**
Any process agreed upon by the selection panel for the assessment of applicants.

**Code/Code of practice**
The Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland.

**Collective decision**
A unanimous decision that has been agreed by each member of the selection panel.

**Commissioner**
The Public Appointments Commissioner for Scotland. The first Commissioner in Scotland was appointed by Her Majesty the Queen on the recommendation of the Scottish Parliament as defined at section 1 of the Public Appointments and Public Bodies etc. (Scotland) Act 2003. Subsequent appointments to the role of Public Appointments Commissioner are made by the Scottish Parliamentary corporation, with the agreement of the Scottish Parliament, in accordance with the Scottish Parliamentary Commissions and Commissioners etc. (Scotland) Act 2010. Unless it is otherwise clear from the wording or context, references to the Commissioner should be taken to refer to the Commissioner’s representative(s).

**Disclosure information**
Information provided by Disclosure Scotland under Part V of the Police Act 1997 about an applicant’s criminal history which is relevant for assessing the applicant’s suitability for appointment.
Members’ code of conduct
Document produced by the Standards Commission for Scotland and adopted and adapted by public bodies. The Members’ code of conduct is underpinned by nine principles of public life and sets out standards of conduct with which members of public bodies will comply.

Merit
The combination of skills, knowledge and other relevant attributes that most closely meet the person specification set by the appointing minister.

Minister (also appointing minister)
The minister responsible for making an appointment at the end of a specific appointment round.

Non-executive board member
An individual appointed to a board to provide an external objective view, to guide and challenge a public body’s executive; they may also be known as a non-executive director, trustee or commissioner. Non-executive board members are referred to in the code as “members” throughout.

Open competition
A publicised appointment round which is open to a wide and diverse range of applicants; anyone who becomes aware of the opportunity may choose to apply.

Personal bias
Decisions made on the basis of information that does not relate to an applicant’s ability to meet the criteria in the person specification and role description. Personal bias may relate to information such as name, home location, age, gender, ethnicity, educational establishments attended and qualifications gained (unless qualifications are specified as a requirement of the post).

Person specification
A document that describes the particular skills, knowledge and any other attributes required of the person to be appointed. The person specification will state the minimum requirements for the post – the essential criteria - and may include desirable criteria.

Person to be appointed
References to the person to be appointed should be taken to mean references to the people to be appointed where a minister plans to make multiple appointments to a board during one appointment round.

Political activity
Information about political activity during the previous five years in so far as that information is already in the public domain. This does not include personal or private information such as membership of political parties or voting preferences.

Political activity declaration form
A form used to monitor the political activity during the previous five years of those appointed to public bodies in so far as that activity is already in the public domain. The form does not ask for personal or private information such as membership of political parties or voting preferences.

Principle
A principle of the code as set out on page 1.
Principles of public life in Scotland
The nine general principles upon which the Members’ Model Code of Conduct are based. These can be downloaded from the Standards Commission’s website: www.standardscommissionscotland.org.uk/

Public body
A body, established by the Scottish Government that has a role in the processes of national Government, but is not a Government directorate or part of one, and which operates at arm’s length from ministers. All public bodies that fall within the Commissioner’s remit are noted in schedule 2 of the Public Appointments and Public Bodies etc. (Scotland) Act 2003 as amended by statutory instrument. A list of the bodies currently regulated by the Commissioner is available on the Commissioner’s website: www.publicappointments.org/regulating-appointments/regulated-bodies

Publicity
The process of making an appointment opportunity known publicly. This may be through advertising, or through the use of websites or other electronic communications, and may include informing individuals or organisations of the appointment opportunity.

Role description
A document which describes the nature, purpose and responsibilities of the role in connection to the public body. It will state the length of the appointment term, any remuneration, allowable expenses and a realistic indication of the time commitment required. Specific requirements particular to the appointment, for example the location of an applicant’s home or place of work, will be included.

Schedule 2
Schedule 2 of the Public Appointments and Public Bodies etc (Scotland) Act 2003 that (as amended by statutory instrument) lists the public bodies that fall within the Commissioner’s remit.

Scottish Government
The Scottish Ministers and their civil servants. The Scottish Executive as defined in the Scotland Act 1998. Appointment rounds are handled by individual units within sponsor directorates known as sponsor teams. Compliance with the code is the responsibility of the appointing minister and is delegated to the Director General whose remit includes sponsorship of the public body concerned.

The Scottish Ministers
Ministers of the Scottish Government responsible for recommending and/or making appointments to public bodies within the Commissioner’s remit.

Scottish Parliament

Selection panel
Those people responsible for assessing applicants and identifying applicants who they believe are suitable for appointment.

Selection process
The process of assessing applications, interviewing applicants and identifying applicants whom the selection panel believes are suitable for appointment.

Term
The length of an appointment as specified in the role description.
Revised Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland

Consultation Questionnaire
June 2010
We are seeking views on the proposed revised Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland. The revised code is designed to develop the regulatory framework established by the Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland. The questions contained in this response form arise from some of the differences between the current code and the proposals for the revised code. We would welcome your opinions on the changes proposed.

How to access copies of the code

Copies of both the code currently in use in Scotland and the proposed code may be accessed:

- on the Commissioner’s website - www.publicappointments.org
- by telephone - 0131 718 6058
- by email - info@publicappointments.org
- by writing to

Karen Carlton
Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland
9-10 St Andrew Square
Edinburgh
EH2 2AF

The text of the code can be made available in alternative formats; requests for alternative formats should be made to the Commissioner’s office as above.

How to respond

Please indicate your opinions about the proposed code and any other comments you wish to make on this questionnaire. If you wish to complete and submit the questionnaire electronically you can do so by downloading a copy of a Word version at:

www.publicappointments.org/regulating-appointments/a-new-code-of-practice

Timeframe for consultation

We are inviting written responses to this consultation by **15 October 2010**.

Thank you for your interest.
The Principles of the Code of Practice

The current code is underpinned by a set of principles, drawn from the Members’ Model Code of Conduct adopted under the Ethical Standards in Public Life etc. (Scotland) Act 2000 and adapted for the public appointments process. The current principles are:

**Ministerial Responsibility**
The ultimate responsibility for appointment and recommendation for appointment rests with Scottish Ministers, who will be provided with a choice of candidates from which to make the appointment.

**Merit**
All public appointments are governed by the overriding principle of selection based on merit. Individuals selected will be those who have demonstrated that they best match the skills, knowledge and personal qualities required for the appointment in question.

**Equality**
Accessibility to appointments is a fundamental requirement and the appointments process will promote and demonstrate equality of opportunity and treatment to all applicants.

**Probit and Respect**
Everyone engaged in the public appointments process will act with integrity and will demonstrate respect for all others involved in the process.

**Independent Scrutiny**
Independent scrutiny is vital to the public appointments process. An OCPAS Assessor will be involved at each stage of the selection process and must confirm that this Code has been followed before an appointment can be made.

**Openness and Transparency**
The practices employed at every stage in an appointment round must be transparent. Decisions taken at each stage will reflect this Code of Practice and be fully documented.

**Proportionality**
The practices employed during each appointment round will be appropriate for the specific post and the nature and function of the public body concerned.
The proposed code has only two principles, applicant-focused and outcome-focused. The existing principles are incorporated in the descriptions of what the new principles require.

The new principles are designed to underline the importance of addressing the needs of applicants and of Scotland’s public bodies within the ministerial public appointments process.

Please see the Principles section of the proposed revised Code

**Question one**
Do you agree that the proposed principles reflect the requirements of the public appointments process? Please give reasons.

**Response:**
A risk-based and proportionate approach to regulation

The current code requires a representative of the Commissioner, known as an OCPAS Assessor, to scrutinise each of the key stages of every appointment round. Currently OCPAS Assessors do not scrutinise the process used to make reappointments. Under the proposed code the Commissioner will scrutinise any appointment activity in the way he or she believes to be most appropriate. This will normally be by assigning a representative to monitor compliance with this code at all, or selected, stages of an appointment or reappointment.

The Commissioner’s intention in making this change is to make the extent of oversight, and the processes chosen for oversight, appropriate for the positions to be filled. This is intended to address concerns that the regulatory framework for public appointments is unnecessarily burdensome in some areas and insufficiently rigorous in others.

The Commissioner’s decision on the appropriate levels of scrutiny will take into account the risks attached to inappropriate appointments, reappointments or other appointment activity.

Please see section B paragraph B4 of the proposed Code

Question two
Do you agree that this form of proportionate and risk-based scrutiny is appropriate for the public appointment process? Please give reasons.

Response:
Alternative application methods

The current code anticipates that every applicant completes an application form, the content of which determines whether or not the applicant is selected for interview. The Commissioner has observed that this process appears to favour applicants who are good at completing forms and that it serves as a barrier to people from currently underrepresented groups. This view has been reinforced by stakeholders, including the chairs of public bodies. To address this, the proposed code allows a selection panel to choose any fair, open and transparent method of selection for interview that it considers appropriate given the position(s) to be filled and the people to be attracted.

Please see Section F paragraphs F1 to F3 of the proposed code

Question three
Do you agree that encouraging selection panels to consider application methods other than the traditional application form will make the public appointment process more accessible and attractive? Please give reasons.

Response:
Competent and knowledgeable

The current code requires selection panel members to be familiar with its content but does not specify that panel members must be competent to assess applicants using the assessment methods chosen. Nor does it require panel members to be knowledgeable about equality and diversity issues and how such matters may affect the outcome of appointment rounds. During pre-consultation on the revised code, stakeholders, including the chairs of public bodies, raised concerns about the competence of participants. The Commissioner believes that requiring panel members to be knowledgeable and competent in these areas should have a tangible impact on the experience of people who apply for roles and, ultimately, on the make up of boards. The Commissioner has therefore proposed that these become code requirements.

Please see Section F paragraph F4 of the proposed code

Question four
Do you agree that requiring panel members to be

- competent to assess applicants using the assessment methods chosen
- knowledgeable about equality and diversity issues and
- aware of how equality and diversity matters may affect the outcome of appointment rounds

should be included in the proposed code? Please give reasons.

Response:
**Ministers’ reasons**

The proposed code specifies that ministers will keep a written record of the reasons for their appointment decisions. The Commissioner plans to introduce a requirement to address concerns that this part of the process has not been sufficiently open. The Commissioner believes that this new requirement accords fully with the Ministerial Code and more generally with the principles of open government. It does not constrain the Scottish Ministers’ power to continue to make their choice from the applicants presented as suitable for appointment.

**Please see Section H paragraph H4 of the proposed Code**

**Question five**

Do you agree that the Scottish Ministers should be required to give reasons for their appointment decisions? Please say why.

**Response:**
Fit and proper person

The current code states that the Scottish Government will decide at the planning stage of an appointment whether or not to take up references and whether a disclosure check is necessary. The proposed code requires Ministers to ensure that the person to be appointed is a fit and proper person for the role for which they have applied.

Please see Section I paragraph I1 of the proposed Code

Question six
Do you agree that Scottish Ministers be required to confirm that the person to be appointed is a fit and proper person for the role for which they have applied? Please give reasons.

Response:
Format of the code

The current code takes the reader through the appointment process specifying what is required at each stage. The proposed code is not set out chronologically. Instead it sets out the responsibilities of the people who assess and appoint applicants and who scrutinise the way this is done, then moves on to describe what is required to provide an open, fair and merit-based public appointment process. It is a shorter document that focuses on the key requirements of the process. It will be supported by detailed guidance.

Question seven
Do you agree that the new format of the code is helpful in clarifying the requirements without focusing on the detail of the appointments process? Please give reasons.

Response:
The proposed code contains a diagram on page 2 designed to summarise the purpose and key stages of the ministerial public appointment process.

**Question eight**
Do you agree that such a diagram is helpful in clarifying what the process requires and in specifying the key activities? Please give reasons.

**Response:**
Any other comments

Question nine
Do you have any other comments that you wish to make? Please set these out below.

Response:
How your response will be used

All responses will be analysed and considered along with any other available evidence to inform the work of the Commissioner in finalising the code.

Confidentiality

Copies of all responses received will be placed on the OCPAS website and/or made available to the general public in the OCPAS office. The views expressed may be quoted or referred to in any future review of responses. All responses which do not indicate a requirement for confidentiality will be checked for any defamatory material before being made publicly available. If you do not wish your response to be made public, please ensure that you indicate clearly that all or part of your response is to be treated as confidential. We will endeavour to maintain such confidentiality subject to the provisions of the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002. We will still count confidential responses in any statistical analysis and your views will be taken into account in the same way as for non-confidential responses.

Process following consultation

Following consultation the Commissioner’s Office will write to all who have participated in the consultation to indicate the outcome of the consultation exercise and its impact on the formation of the Code.

Your information

Please complete the details below and attach with your response.

1. Are you responding as (please tick appropriate box):

   an individual?  
   (go to 2a/b, 3)

   on behalf of a group or organisation?  
   (go to 2c/d, 3)

Individuals

2a. Do you agree to your response being made public (on the OCPAS website and in the OCPAS office)?

   Yes  
   Go to 2b below

   No

   If you wish part of your response to remain confidential please indicate which part or parts:
2b. Where no confidentiality is requested, we will make your response available to the public on the following basis (please tick one box):

- Make my response and name available
- Make my response available, but not my name

**On behalf of groups or organisations**

2c. Do you agree to your response being made public (on the OCPAS website and in the OCPAS office)?

- Yes  Go to 2d below
- No

If you wish part of your response to remain confidential please indicate which part or parts:

- Q1
- Q2
- Q3
- Q4
- Q5
- Q6
- Q7
- Q8
- Q9

2d. Where no confidentiality is requested, we will make your response available to the public on the following basis (please tick one box):

- Make my response and organisation’s name available
- Make my response available, but not my organisation’s name

**Further Contact**

3a. We may wish to contact you again in the future to clarify comments you make in your response. Are you content for us to do so?

- Yes
- No
3b. We may wish to contact you again in the future for consultation or research purposes. Are you content for us to do so?

Yes [ ]
No [ ]

Name

Address

Email address

Tel no

Please return this questionnaire to:

Consultation Response
OCPAS
MWB Business Exchange
9-10 St Andrew Square
Edinburgh
EH2 2AF

OR

ian.bruce@publicappointments.org

If you have any comments about how this consultation exercise has been conducted, please send them to the same address.