What are the trends in migration to Scotland?

1. It is tremendously difficult to find accurate, comprehensive, information on migration in Scotland (see section below) and much comment is, unfortunately, anecdotally based. It would appear however that the following trends are emerging:
   - In terms of migration, Scotland had less than other parts of the UK up until the late 90s and so had a lower base line in terms of provision of services and support. However, MHL believe that it has more than caught up and some of the best work in the UK is taking place in Scotland.
   - Numbers of dispersed asylum seekers coming to Scotland are falling
   - EU migrants continue to arrive in declining numbers in Scotland but significant numbers are returning to their country of origin or to other EU countries where work is more plentiful or more lucrative. Net numbers are difficult to establish but overall inwards migration to Scotland is believed to be declining. Worker’s Registration Scheme (WRS) data reveals that the number of migrants arriving in Scotland rose annually from 2004 but began to decline in 2007-8. The number of National Insurance numbers (NINO) applications made by foreign nationals in Scotland increased from 2003-4 but that growth slowed in 2006-07. According to the General Registrar’s Office for Scotland (GROS), net migration was down 7,000 in the year to mid-2008 compared to the previous twelve months. Those arriving tend to be in the younger segment of the demographic and have relatively low ratios of dependants.
   - Insignificant numbers of refugees from the Gateway Protection Programme (GPP) (including Iraqi Interpreters) have arrived
   - The numbers of destitute migrants (particularly asylum seekers and EU nationals who are No Recourse to Public Funds (NRPF) appears to be rising
   - There may be a relatively insignificant rise in the number of Nepalese arriving in Scotland.

2. Reliable data does exist but it is far from comprehensive. There are a number of sources of information available on migration in Scotland:
   - NINO allocations
   - Take up of WRS
   - UKBA managed migration statistics from Manchester
3. It is felt that the placing of the following information in a wider public sector domain would be useful:
   • Data from the UKBA concerning the operation of the points based system
   • UKBA eBorders information

4. Scotland may also wish to consider the following:
   • The use of the MOSAIC software and databases. MOSAIC is a commercial software system from the business and marketing sector that (typically) classifies households in the United Kingdom into 12 Mosaic Groups and 52 sub-groups called Mosaic Types. These Groups and Types are formed on the basis that the households comprising them share certain characteristics. Mosaic can be used to collate information on ethnicity and give indicators of ‘hidden’ ethnic populations. It has been successfully used by various universities, local authorities and police forces.
   • After adequate legal and data protection investigations have taken place the use administrative data sources, such as council tax records, registrations with General Practitioners and police crime and incident reports
   • A drive to improve the data capture of the NHS. It is understood that the best-performing health board in Scotland has about an 84% data capture, while the figures for the worst-performing boards are no better than 2%.
   • Previously work on the economic impact of migration was commissioned from the Fraser of Allander Institute by COSLA and this may be worth revisiting.

5. It is also suggested that a more detailed audit of public sector spending is necessary to tease out what expenditure is directly or indirectly linked to migration. At present a meaningful Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) is difficult to arrive at due to the opacity of the financial data.

What is the contribution of migration to the Scottish economy?

6. It is predicted that Scotland’s total population will decline markedly from 2031 onwards as a result of the demographics of an ageing population. A major issue for Scotland to consider is the importance of migration as a key to population growth which is a driver of economic activity. The Scottish Government has set ambitious population growth targets around a desire to match the EU15 average population growth by 2017. Local government in Scotland also recognises the importance of population growth and in many areas are already experiencing significant demographic issues such as a growing elderly population; a decreasing working age population; pockets of
social and economic deprivation and a declining fiscal base which impacts on the delivery and sustainability of services. Migration is a prime option for achieving population growth because fertility rates (the other potential driver of population growth) are too low at present among the indigenous population and difficult, not least ethically, to influence or manipulate.

7. If migration is seen to be a key to population growth then retention of migrants is a major issue because efforts to attract migrants into Scotland will not effectively contribute to population growth unless they are encouraged to settle and integrate here. The COSLA Strategic Migration Partnership is in the final stages of producing a toolkit which will help local authorities and their partners to develop strategies to retain migrants in their area and this type of work is to be commended.

8. However the benefits of migration in terms of re-balancing Scottish demographics needs to be weighed against the costs and impacts on migration in order to arrive at some form of CBA.

9. For example there are obvious extra costs around translation, interpretation and language support in schools and the public sector needs to adequately resourced if they are to be provided. As another example interpreting and translation costs have risen by 265% over the last few years for Strathclyde Police and Grampian Police.

10. The impact of migrants’ pay and pay scales and the methodology under which they are employed needs to be examined carefully. Migrant workers are often employed by agencies or Gangmasters or on temporary contracts. This often produces low wages and accusations of under cutting indigenous work forces. It may contribute, overall, in driving wages down in certain sectors or in maintaining them at artificially low levels. This in turn may create prosperity gaps and pockets of deprivation.

11. When wages are held at low levels migrants may end up working long hours with consequent health problems and an incidental lack of time to use in integration work such as learning English or joining community activities. There may also be gender inequalities in the distribution of migrant work and hours worked that retard current progress being made within the indigenous population.

What is the contribution of migrant communities to Scottish culture, society and civic society?

12. The non economic and demographic benefits of migration traditionally become apparent only some years after the migration event. Certainly experience elsewhere, and historically in Scotland, indicates that culture, society and the arts are all enriched by cross fertilisation with migrant inflows. See below for some remarks on the emergence of migrant community organisations.
How does the media portray the contribution of migrant communities in Scotland?

13. Sadly the media is largely negative with one or two exceptions such as an occasional article in The Herald and this needs to be worked on. The message is too often, erroneously, that migrants take jobs and housing. Some suggestions to improve matters are made below that may be worthy of consideration. An interesting quote from a member of MHL staff:

“Media coverage is almost universally negative and more should be done to combat this by pushing positive stories about migrants and what they bring to Scotland and ensuring that complaints are made when obviously "made up" material, a la Daily Record, is published.”

How can positive messages regarding the contribution of migrant populations to Scottish society be effectively disseminated?

14. Some suggestions to improve matters are:

- Improve the data (see above) – at present a far from comprehensive, balanced picture of migration is available – this allows the media to select random facts and figures out of context and present them in sensationalised terms.

- A ‘myth busting’ campaign should be considered. This approach has been used with some success in the area of asylum seekers and it may be adaptable to a wider remit. Schools and community awareness sessions are possibilities. The Scottish Refugee Council has already done some work on this in respect of refugees and asylum seekers, the extension of these schemes to cover EU workers should be considered.

- More ‘headline’ information on migrants entitlement to benefits should be placed in the public domain so that the paucity of recourse to public funds becomes more widely known.

- A selected campaign aimed at politicians and local councillors might reap a large reward for a small investment in terms of influencing public opinion.

- Better dissemination of best practice across the public sector might yield better results.

- Migrants themselves should be involved in this PR, myth busting, image changing work. The migrants’ own community organisations can play an important role in this work. A nascent network of migrant organisations, at present largely Polish but with some Lithuanian and other groups, is beginning to emerge in Scotland. Many of these have been set up by migrants anxious to play more than just an economic part in Scottish life. They are often ambassadors for the culture they represent and good facilitators in the sharing of Scottish culture and values with the community they represent. There has been some useful cooperation along these lines with Polish groups in Govan exploring the shared ground of food, dance, music and a common patron saint.

- When asylum seekers and refugees first arrived in Glasgow the Positive Images programme involving Oxfam, Amnesty International...
and other organisations, was created to help journalists become better informed on the issues. Oxfam also established an awards scheme for journalists, which continues to reward positive reporting every year. Amnesty run a similar scheme and it has reported favourably on Congolese migrants to Motherwell.

- It may be possible to revisit the lessons learnt from OP Reclaim in the Sighthill area of Glasgow. The arrival of asylum seekers in the area created some community friction and initiatives were put in place, largely around sport, to identify shared interests and common ground.

15. The challenge for all such work is sustainability. Too often measures such as those outlined above have been single interventions of transitory value.

What is the degree of alignment of Scottish public services with migrant populations?

16. In order to achieve full alignment of services the key will be to ensure that funding follows the migrant and not that migrants have to follow funding. This may not always have been achieved to date. There is still a major issue as regards to funding for the services required to support migrants in Scotland and this should continue to be high on any agenda. The funding formulas need to be reviewed because as things stand the funding may be at least two years behind the arrival of migrants. In addition, some funding formulas do not take account of migrants.

17. Undoubtedly Scotland has made significant effort to meet the needs of migrants and there are many examples of good practise and quality, integrated services that are far superior to many aspects of the English scene although there is also room to learn from experiences south of the border.

18. Services seem fully aligned to deal with asylum seekers and refugees within the parameters of a system, that is, in Migrant Helpline’s view, inherently flawed

19. There have been some examples of good practise in the Govanhill area of Glasgow in trying to align services with the needs of the migrant population and those of the indigenous community. Whilst this has been largely reactive rather than proactive it may serve as a learning model for further work in Scotland. With a population of c16,000 the area has a significant migrant population of 3-5,000 the majority of whom appear to be Slovak Roma with some Romanian Roma and Polish. Largely housed in private rented accommodation the group has presented particular challenges around health and destitution. Govanhill has, historically, been the setting for previous waves of immigration around the Irish, Jewish and Asian communities. In response to the current migration pattern there has been:

- Neighbourhood partnership working
- The establishment of drop in centres for periods of time
- Extra health visiting
- The recruitment of two workers from the Slovak republic facilitated by Oxfam
• The development of Polish community organisations
• A drive to register migrants with GPs (with a 50% or more success rate)
• A drive to increase the take up of education

20. The Govanhill response, possibly like every other response to migration, has highlighted the essential need to gain the trust of the incoming community. Many EU nationals will come to Scotland with backgrounds of deep mistrust of the authorities, statutory bodies and the police.

21. Public services in Scotland are poor, as is the rest of the UK in engaging with the difficult to reach parts of the migrant community with some evidence that migrant use of services is only 60% of that of the indigenous population. Some particular hard to reach groups are:
- Women particularly those from patriarchal cultures
- Those living in rural communities (where access to ESOL is a particular issue)
- Those without access to the internet
- Those who do not speak English
- Those who are functionally illiterate in their own language
- Those from minority migrant communities such as: Lithuanians, Latvians, Bulgarians and Romanians

22. To enhance alignment the following suggestions are made:
- Further provision of easily accessible, free at the point of delivery ESOL
- The provision of mobile outreach services to rural communities
- Initiatives aimed specifically at women

What is the effectiveness of public sector responses to changing migration patterns?

23. Earlier the difficulties of forecasting future migration trends were noted and this, of course, affects the ability of the Public Sector to respond in a timely and effective manner. Something is, however, known around the following areas and some preliminary work may be possible:

- Later in 2010 UKBA will be reviewing the refugee status of a considerable number of people granted it and the following unanswered questions create some concern:
  - How will these refugees be informed of the need to apply for continued leave to remain when the five year period elapses?
  - What expectation is held of Local Authority and Voluntary Sector involvement in assisting refugees to apply for continued leave?
  - What steps will be taken to continue the integration of this group into full participation in the Scottish economy?
- Every should be made to ensure funding streams such as the MIF are exploited and used for dealing with the impact of migration and not diverted elsewhere
24. The following are perhaps areas of good practice in aligning services with the needs of migrants:

- The Association of Chiefs of Police Officers in Scotland’s (ACPOS) community safety approach to the integration of migrant communities is a positive model. Despite many feelings of mistrust towards the police held by migrants, based on experiences in their home country, the model provides a means of positive engagement. The Strathclyde Police’s work with the Polish community and the Fife Police’s multi agency advice book for migrants are examples of good practice.
- The welcome to migrants pack issued by Aberdeenshire Council.
- The COSLA Migration Policy Toolkit to be issued, hopefully, in May of this year. The toolkit groups local authorities together who are facing the same demographic and migration challenges. The toolkit will provide guidance to groups of local authorities on: creating an evidence base, creating policies to attract, retain and integrate migrants in their area. It will cover topics such as employment, education, community cohesion and integration, health and social care, housing and homelessness, and humanitarian programmes.

25. The following are further suggestions:

- Public bodies may wish to look at the overlap of, and potential commonalities amongst, the plethora of asylum seeking, EU, refugee, BME, equality and diversity services offering advice, information, advocacy and services. In this time of limited resources some rationalisation may be beneficial.
- A rationalisation of interpretation and translation services for the public and voluntary sector is long overdue and a robust procurement exercise by the Scottish Government on behalf of others would drive prices down and quality up.
- The English experience should be studied. There is much existing good practice that could be plagiarised. For example:
  - The East of England web site for migrants
  - The work of Migrant Helpline in Kent around advice, integration and reaching difficult to engage with communities

What is the degree of awareness of the rights of migrants?

26. We have answered this question in two ways – the awareness of their rights amongst migrants and the awareness of others of the rights of migrants.

Amongst Migrants

27. This is generally poor and particularly so amongst difficult to reach rural and agricultural communities.

Amongst Others

28. Undoubtedly within the statutory bodies and the voluntary sector knowledge of migrants’ rights is increasing and this is to be applauded. However, further awareness raising around the rights and entitlements of new
migrants delivered to local authorities, housing associations and others would not be unwelcome.

29. The public knowledge of migrants’ rights is deplorable and this, and possible remedies, were discussed earlier.

30. Overall there may be a significant piece of work to be done in ensuring potential migrants have access to clear, simple, but detailed, information on their rights in their home country before departure. This information should cover both entry and continued stay rights. It could be combined with information on the economy and jobs.

**What is the scale of the trafficking issue, in terms of the number of people involved and the geographical areas which people trafficked tend to be sourced from?**

NOTE: The following submission is only pertinent to adult victims of trafficking and does not include any information passed to Migrant Helpline in confidence by a third party.

31. Trafficking is by its very nature a criminal and concealed activity (see below) and any attempt at quantifying the problem will meet with severe difficulties. However, Migrant Helpline (MHL) firmly believes an attempt should be made to establish as far as possible a hard evidence base and that too often the subject has been reported on anecdotally or subjectively to further single issue agendas or organisational positions or services.

32. The subject of trafficking is also further confused by definitional issues with multiple understandings of the term, loose language and variant legal definitions in place. MHL believes that trafficking is defined in the source documents of the UN Palermo Protocol.

33. Since beginning work in Scotland on 1 April 2009 supporting victims of human trafficking MHL has dealt with the following:

34. 60 Potential Victims of Trafficking (PVOT) of whom 6 have, to date, been granted Reasonable Grounds (RG) decisions under the National Referral Mechanism (NRM).

35. Of these there were no victims of sexual exploitation, 3 victims of domestic servitude and 54 victims of forced labour. 36 were male and 24 female. 3 dependants of victims have also been looked after. They came from the following countries:
   - Slovak Republic (47)
   - Zimbabwe (1)
   - Nigeria (3)
   - Kyrgyzstan (1)
   - Lithuania (6)
   - India (2)
36. Lebov (2009)\textsuperscript{ii} writing on behalf of the Scottish Government’s Analytical Services reports that between April 2007 and March 2008 79 victims, largely of sexual exploitation, came to the attention of various agencies in Scotland.

37. During Operation Pentameter 1 in 2006 police forces in Scotland discovered 10 female PVOT 5 of whom were confirmed as trafficking victims.

38. During Operation Pentameter 2, which ran from late 2007 to early 2008 59 PVOT were dealt with of whom 15 were adjudged to be victims. These 15 were from SE Asia and the remainder of the 59 largely from Eastern Europe and West Africa.

39. Between 2003 and 2009 25 victims were referred to TARA\textsuperscript{iii}.

40. In 2003, Lothian and Borders police detained 14 Chinese workers after they were discovered picking cockles at Cramond Bay. They were not at the time treated as PVOT. Two of these same Chinese workers were later arrested during the tragedy at Morecambe Bay in February 2004 where 23 trafficked workers drowned.

41. At the beginning of 2010 the Scottish prison estate held 70 Vietnamese nationals, MHL suspects that a significant number of these, particularly those held for offences connected with marijuana cultivation are PVOT.

42. ACPOS estimate that in demographic terms Scotland has a 10% share of the UK crime statistics but 13.5% of the human trafficking trade\textsuperscript{iv}.

43. There is strong evidence of links between trafficking and other forms of organised crime, such as drug distribution, cannabis cultivation, money laundering and other serious fraud.

44. There appears to be some evidence that the following are the source countries of those trafficked to Scotland

- Czech Republic
- Poland
- Slovak Republic
- Kyrgyzstan
- Lithuania
- People’s Republic of China
- Nigeria
- Zimbabwe
- Venezuela
- Brazil
- Vietnam
- Mexico
- Latvia
- Romania
- Ukraine
- Albania
45. The following appear to be methods used by traffickers to control or coerce victims:

- Debt bondage
- Bogus employment agencies
- Physical threats and actual violence in Scotland
- Physical threats and actual violence to victims and families in the country of origin
- Control of travel and ID documents

46. Routes into Scotland appear to be:

- Via Stranraer from Northern Ireland (Northern Ireland often being a transit country or one of a number of transit countries including the Republic of Ireland)
- Via Glasgow and Edinburgh’s airports
- Across the Scottish-English border

47. Victims have been found in:

- Glasgow
- Stranraer
- Aberdeen
- Kirkaldy
- Edinburgh
- Dumfries and Galloway
- Falkirk
- Grangemouth
- Stirling
- Tayside

**What is the nature of the problem? Are people trafficked primarily for reasons related to sexual exploitation or with regard to false (sic) labour?**

48. People are trafficked to make money for the traffickers. The artificial categorisation of victims into labour exploitation, sexual exploitation or domestic servitude is unhelpful and unnecessary. MHL has considerable experience of victims moving around these categories and of sexual abuse being widespread within the categories. If someone is trafficked into Scotland and placed as a family servant, expected to work in a shop and raped repeatedly by their ‘employer’ it is difficult to know which of the artificial categories they come under. Is someone trafficked into Scotland working as a maid in a brothel a sexual exploitation or a forced labour case? Trafficking is often a narrative journey and those trafficked into prostitution may later find
themselves moved into forced labour vice versa. The removal of these
categorisations from the agenda of trafficking would be a helpful move that
removed the trafficking debate – which is about crime and human suffering –
away from some of the highly politicised debates around gender and
prostitution. In addition trafficking is not the only gateway to sexual
exploitation and other forms of exploitation and illegal activity involving
migrant workers. Many exploited people are migrants for whom the migration
has gone wrong, whilst it is important to focus on trafficking it would be well to
acknowledge that it is not the only gateway to exploitative activities in
Scotland.

49. In terms of the type of exploitation victims of trafficking are involved in the
following seem to be well identified:

- Work in the sex trade as prostitutes or maids
- Benefit and tax credit fraud
- For identity theft and the establishment of bank accounts for laundering
  purposes
- Cultivation and guarding of marijuana crops
- Agriculture, fisheries and shell fish
- Petty but organised crime and street ‘life’ – begging, sales of papers,
  pick-pocketing, shop lifting, selling pirate CDs and DVDs
- Domestic servitude
- Home working such as assembling and packing factory items
- Factory work particularly in processing food products
- The catering industry
- Involvement in leaflet distribution
- Involvement in bogus charities particularly those collecting second
  hand clothing for the ‘third world’ which actually end up in Eastern
  Europe.

50. It is suggested that trafficking for domestic servitude is probably the
smallest element of the trade followed by sexual exploitation, with trafficking
for forced labour as by far and away the biggest category. (However see
earlier for an opinion on the categorisation of the nature of trafficking.)

51. As there appears to be a particular interest in sexual exploitation some
specific comments follow. In terms of trafficking for sexual exploitation the
situation in Scotland (as in the remainder of the UK) has been difficult to
assess because of the pollicised and emotive atmosphere in which debate
has taken place. The subject of trafficking has been linked with the issue of
prostitution and wider agendas than the suppression of trafficking have been,
often, to the forefront. This situation has been exacerbated by deeply held but
divided approaches to how prostitution should be dealt with – with for instance
Glasgow and Edinburgh holding divergent views on an approach to be taken.
Mackay and Schaap (2000) highlighted these issues in their work. Glasgow
tends to follow an abolitionist approach seeing the issue as one of ‘social
welfare’ and Edinburgh, seeing the issue as a ‘health’ problem, historically at
least, favours regulation. Discourses of ‘work’ and ‘choice’ predominate in
Edinburgh and discourses of ‘vice’ and ‘abuse’ in Glasgow. This situation has
been exacerbated by strongly entrenched and dogmatic views held by secular and faith organisations with conflicting viewpoints held by organisations such as TARA and SCOT-PEP.

52. Accepting that prostitution can be seen as an economic activity through the prism of supply and demand there are also significant disagreements on whether it is supply, demand or both that need to be addressed vi.

53. The sex trade in Scotland is certainly not insignificant but probably per capita of population no greater than in the remainder of the UK. Emberson (2002) vii attempted an overview highlighting the concentration of the activity as follows:

“Scotland

McCoy (2003) lists the following:
Aberdeen – Two massage parlours (Bodyline Sauna (10) viii and Regent Quay House (21)).
One working woman (Sally).

Dundee – One unofficial massage parlour (Isla Street Massage (3)).

Edinburgh – 18 massage parlours (Ambassador Sauna (14), Atlantis (6), Blair Street Sauna (22), Carol’s (6), Cher’s Private Club (8), Executive Sauna (21), Fingerprintz (13), The Gentle Touch (7), The Gentleman’s Club (8), The Highland Club (6), Kareen’s (16), London Street Sauna (30), Merchant Street Sauna (11), Newtown Sauna (10), Orchid House (12), Paradise Sauna (12), Scorpio Leisure (24) and Sunbed Sauna (10)). One unofficial massage parlour (Fountainbridge Massage (10)). One Escort Agency (Elegant Escorts). One working woman (Sally). Thomas (2003) also report that 504 Edinburgh prostitutes contacted SCOT-PEP during the first nine months of 2001, 212 of whom were street workers.

The situation in Edinburgh has changed dramatically in the last few years since the closure of its Leith non-harassment zone in April 2001. The tolerance zone was said to have achieved – greater use of sexual health services by prostitutes, less transmission of HIV, increase in prostitutes accessing mainline care and support services, an eradication of under age 16 prostitution, a marked decrease in violence against prostitutes and a reduction in the involvement of organise crime. Since 2001 SCOT-PEP report a dramatic move by large numbers of prostitutes back to their town of origin (largely Glasgow), a reduction in percentages of prostitutes accessing services, the return of under-age girls and increased drug use and dealing. The issue around the proposed re-instatement of the zone and creation of others in Scotland through a Prostitution Tolerance Zones (Scotland) Bill are well debated in Sale (2003), Khan (2003), Matthews (2004) and (Coats and Blackford 2002).
**Falkirk** – One massage parlour (Bubble’s Health Spa (7)).

**Glasgow** – Eight massage parlours (Aquarius Sauna (29), Bubbles Health Sauna (14), Carlton Club (20), New Blythswood Sauna (12), Parkgrove House (40), Royale Sauna (25), St Enoch Club (16) and Venus Aromatherapy Club (12)). Two unofficial massage parlours (South Side Massage (5) and Tradeston Massage (7)). Two Escort Agencies (Butterfly Escorts and Fantasy Girls). Six working women (Agatha Lorenfeller, Aimee Alexander, Caitlin, Helen, Nikki and Tinkerbell).

**Inverness** – One working woman (Janice).

**Kirkaldy** – Two working women (Davina and Honey).

**Stirling** – One working woman (Jordan).”

54. As an example of anecdotal, subjective reporting on the issues concerning trafficking and the difficulties of establishing the truth about trafficking females for sexual exploitation is exemplified by Devine, Musson and Mathieson (2010) writing in the Daily Record:

“TRAFFICKED women and teens are being prostituted in Scotland on a string of online brothels. Crime gangs are plying their trade in the relative "safety" of websites after major police crackdowns on street hookers. The Record can reveal some of the flood of internet sites selling sex with trafficked women which are aimed at Scots punters. Women brought illegally into the UK from eastern Europe, South America, China and south-east Asia are among those being sold online. Senior police sources say that in the past two years, Scotland has become a target for Brazilian mafias and up to one-in-four women in Scots brothels is from Brazil. Numerous Scots hookers also have a web presence, some using social networking sites or classified advertising websites. One of the most notorious online brothels was yesterday offering 534 women or girls across Scotland.

Campaigners say girls as young as 17 have been lured from their homes around the world by criminals with the promise of a better life. But once they get to Scotland, many are held captive and abused by gangsters while being sold for sex. Linda Thompson, from Women’s Support Project charity in Glasgow, said: "The rise in internet advertising for prostitution is worrying - not least because it could make women, whom services already find it difficult to engage with, more invisible. "The increase in off-street prostitution may make it appear that prostitution has disappeared but all it means is that it is no longer visible to communities. "The harm and levels of violence from punters will go on - but behind closed doors rather than on street corners or in cars." Authorities believe there are hundreds of women in Scotland who have been trafficked for sexual exploitation. However, there have been no successful prosecutions. Police sources say gangs shift
women around different cities every month or so to evade detection. Many of the listings sites, which range from amateur set-ups to professional operations, are crammed with woman linked to online pimps masquerading as "escort agencies". Websites, which carry girls who could be underage, try to avoid police attention by stating all their women are over 18. The sleazy sites include phone numbers. On some, men "rate" the prostitutes. A woman called Paola, based in Perth, was offered on one website yesterday for £100 an hour. She is described as a "sexy and hot Venezuelan girl". Another hooker in Perth, called Pietra, is described as a "petite Mexican blonde". The growth in internet sex is not confined to online brothels and escort services. Sex-for-sale saunas in Edinburgh - where authorities have long turned a blind eye to "massage parlours" - are now blatantly offering lists of services on websites.

The website for Angels in Rose Street states the explicit sexual services which staff will provide for customers. And the pen portraits of the girls who ply their trade at the capital's Abacus, Gentle Touch and Paradise saunas leave nothing to the imagination. Abacus Fantasy's website advertises the services of Latvians Lulu, 18, and Sandra, 19, and Romanian Simone, 22. Rates range from £30 for a new 15-minute "quicky" service to £650 for an overnight. Carol's Sauna in Leith also advertise their girls online - and has dozens of reviews by punters.

Police in Edinburgh have in the past rescued a number of women who were trafficked into the country to work as sex slaves in private flats being run as brothels. The women - mainly from eastern Europe and south-east Asia - had been brought here to sell sex against their will. Many disappeared after being placed in safe houses and police fear they may have gone back to their captors out of fear. The Lithuanian Embassy and Ukrainian Consulate yesterday offered help to any of their nationals who were forced into the sex trade...

55. Any objective, knowledgeable reader of the above would immediately raise the following questions:

- What are the Record's sources for these claims and have those sources agreed to speak to the police?
- Why is the statement that one in four women in brothels are Brazilian not reflected by other research?
- Are we genuinely to believe that every foreign national engaged in the sex trade is a victim of trafficking?
- Are we genuinely to believe that with the level of trafficking suggested here (over 25% of brothel workers) that the police are content to ignore the situation?

56. It is an example of the worst of the anecdotal evidence and uninformed reporting that feeds into the hysteria around the subject. Trafficking does exist in Scotland, some of it is around the sex trade but its extent and the numbers involved are far from established, at least not within the public domain.
Given the degree of criminality that tends to be involved in human trafficking what problems does this present for public sector agencies seeking to assist the victims of this activity?

57. There are obvious problems relating to dealing with trafficking caused by its covert and concealed nature however there are also some established methodologies of working in this field which provide some positive ideas to develop and take forward. MHL has responded to this question in three parts – what is needed, good practice and future trends.

What is needed

58. Amongst obvious gaps in the response to trafficking the following are noted:
   - It is disappointing that there are still effectively no residential services for female victims of sexual exploitation in Scotland – at present some victims have to be sent to England to be cared for by the Salvation Army
   - There need to be better information sharing protocols to enhance the prospects of prosecution and to refine the evidence base
   - A single gateway to victim support services for agencies should be established
   - There should be better use made of existing mainstream resources such as the Women’s Aid network of refuges
   - There is some scope for overseas preventative work although the validity of many of the traditional approaches are currently being challenged
   - The GLA needs further resources to expand its work
   - More needs to be done to identify and deal with victims in the criminal justice system
   - More needs to be done to identify victims in the asylum system and in Dungavel detention centre
   - Prosecutions for human trafficking need to be secured in Scotland. There have been over convictions in the UK outside of Scotland.
   - The Croydon Community Against Trafficking (CCAT) has developed a paradigm of grass roots action against trafficking and the model is directly transferrable to Scotland
   - More community awareness raising on the issue would be beneficial and the UKHTC’s Blue Blindfold campaign should be considered

Good Practice

59. The following are thought to be examples of good practice already taking place:
   - The Crimestoppers confidential reporting arrangements
   - The establishment of human trafficking resources within SCDEA
   - The establishment of a human trafficking resource within Strathclyde police’s serious crime unit
Operation Mockday led by HMRC has shown how a large scale operation can disrupt serious crime

The funding streams provided by the Scottish Government are more realistic than those provided in England and Wales

**Future Trends**

60. The following points are made in respect of the future of anti-trafficking work in Scotland:

- The Olympic and Commonwealth Games *may* present particular challenges
- There is a move to a wider use of the Internet for the purposes of prostitution – it remains to be seen the effect this will have on police enquiries
- The recent changes to the prostitution laws may make the reporting of suspicions by the customers of prostitutes less frequent
- There appears to be a significant rise in the number of Lithuanians being trafficked

**Migrant Helpline**

April 2010

---

7. Numbers in brackets refer to the number of women believed to be working at a particular establishment.

**Further References of Interest**


