ECONOMY, ENERGY AND TOURISM COMMITTEE

AGENDA

14th Meeting, 2010 (Session 3)

Wednesday 28 April 2010

The Committee will meet at 9.30 am in Committee Room 5.

1. **The public sector's support for exporters, international trade and the attraction on inward investment:** The Committee will take evidence from—

   John McGlynn, Founder and Chairman, Airlink Group of Companies;

   and then from—

   Ken Richardson, Scottish Advisor, Chemical Industries Association Scotland;

   Ray Mountford, Site Commercial Manager, INEOS;

   Peter Hodgson, Site Manager, Dow Chemicals;

   Scott Johnstone, Director, BioIndustry Association Scotland;

   Dr Deborah O'Neil, Chief Executive and Scientific Officer, NovaBiotics Ltd;

   Gordon Hay, General Manager, Bio-Rad Laboratories.

2. **Budget Strategy 2011-12:** The Committee will take evidence on the Scottish Government's Budget Strategy 2011-12 from—

   Philip Riddle, Chief Executive, VisitScotland.

3. **Annual report:** The Committee will consider a draft annual report for the Parliament year from 9 May 2009 to 8 May 2010.
The papers for this meeting are as follows—

**Agenda item 1**

Note by the clerk  
EET/S3/10/14/1

Note by the clerk  
EET/S3/10/14/2

PRIVATE PAPER  
EET/S3/10/14/3 (P)

**Agenda item 2**

Note by the clerk  
EET/S3/10/14/4

PRIVATE PAPER  
EET/S3/10/14/5 (P)

**Agenda item 3**

Note by the clerk  
EET/S3/10/14/6
Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee

14th Meeting, 2010 (Session 3), Wednesday, 28 April, 2010

The public sector’s support for exporters, international trade and the attraction on inward investment

Background

1. The Committee received the following written evidence submission from John McGlynn of the Airlink Group of Companies.

2. The submission is attached in the annexe to this paper and Members are invited to take it into account in their deliberations when questioning today’s witness.

Stephen Imrie
Clerk to the Committee
April 2010
1. I am delighted to have been asked for some thoughts on the inquiry into the public sector’s support for exporters, international trade and the attraction of inward investment.

2. I am extremely keen on Internationalisation as Scottish Entrepreneurs and Scottish Companies have a natural competitive advantage as Scots are generally welcomed the world over!

3. This has been my absolute experience since 2001 when I made my first overseas trip to Tallinn in Estonia. Subsequent markets for us have been China, Hong Kong, Australia, USA and Canada.

INTRODUCTION

4. The Committee for Economy, Energy and Tourism has established an inquiry into the public sector’s support for exporters, international trade and the attraction of inward investment.

5. Insofar as this submission is concerned I will focus my remarks and observations towards the first two areas of exporting and international trade.

BACKGROUND

6. This submission has been written by John McGlynn who is the founder and Chairman of the Airlink Group of Companies whose head office is located in Paisley close to Glasgow International Airport.

7. John founded his first company at the age of 21 as a hobby whilst at university; he has degrees in Accounts and Law as well as a Diploma in legal Practice.

8. Since 1994 when Airlink Group was founded as a Park and Ride business it has diversified and achieved almost 100% per annum growth.

9. Airlink Group is now the largest Scottish Parking Company, it also owns business parks and industrial estates in the West of Scotland mainly around the Glasgow Airport area and the Commonwealth Games area, has divisions in Storage, Self Storage, IT, Digital Markets and an Investment Portfolio backing start up or management buyout businesses.

10. John holds various external appointments and declares them as follows:-

- Vice Chairman of IAPRA (Independent Airport Park and Ride Association in the UK)
- Chairman of SIAPRA (Scottish IAPRA)
- Member of the Business School Council University of Strathclyde.
- Director of the Entrepreneurial Exchange in Scotland
- Founding Director of the Entrepreneurial Exchange in London.
- Business Ambassador Business Club Scotland
- Business Ambassador Glasgow International Airport

11. John was the founder of Scotland House in Estonia in 2005 with other Scottish businessmen.

12. John has been involved in the markets of Eastern Europe, China and Hong Kong, Australia, USA and Canada.

ECONOMIC RATIONALE

13. The economic rationale for trade development and promotion in Scotland is to provide sustainable economic growth for Scotland that will come from Smart Successful Companies.

14. It is Johns’ experience that over the last 5 years there has been a marked upward trend in both Scottish companies engaging in International trade and those companies seeking to become involved in International Trade.

15. In the current economic climate it is evermore the time to embrace internationalisation and try to secure a more international outward looking focus for motivated and growth orientated Scottish Companies.

CURRENT STRATEGY

16. Whilst the leading public sector body for trade promotion is SDI, many businesses would believe that the lead organisation on International Trade is SCDI due to the highly visible international trade missions that have a proven track record over the last 2 decades or more.

17. It is John’s experience that the Multi sector mission style of SCDI is far more effective than the single sector missions adopted by other organisations and agencies.

18. With regard to 4.2 what is meant is that whilst there may be a good case made for single sector missions and there may of course be a place for such missions, it is John’s experience and that of all of the Entrepreneurs he has discussed this matter with that to go to for example a reception abroad and suitable guests are invited it can often be the place that there is a great deal of similar minded businesses seeking to talk to the same people.

19. With regard to the multi sector missions, it is John’s experience that not only does this style of mission work better for companies Scotland based as well as foreign based but the interaction and “mentoring" and sharing of business skills and contacts is much higher within delegates on such missions is much higher due to the lack of competition in the same sector amongst delegates.

20. With regards to the forward planning of any trade mission programmes, it is Johns experience that the forward plan is to short term and sporadic and there appears to be a lack of long term strategic planning. If you are looking to enter a new market it would encourage a greater number of companies to export to new markets if for example there was a 3 year rolling programme
that potential exporters could see longevity in the commitment to that market with 3 years worth of missions published.

21. It is John's experience that for the reasons outlined in 4.5 Scottish Companies are failing to make the commitment to new markets as they have uncertainty as to the ongoing commitment to that market from the public agencies due to the annual allocations of budgets for International trade.

**The Estonian Experience**

22. John was introduced to the Estonian market in late 2001 at this time exporting and / or investing in new markets was no more than a pipe dream.

23. By 2004 John was taking a more expansive view as to the generation of economic wealth and revisited the “Estonian Adventure”. A number of challenges were identified as being key to overcome; there was a language barrier, a culture barrier, a lack of understanding of local custom and practice, a lack of contacts on the ground and general information. After discussing these issues with fellow businessmen interested in the Eastern European Markets and after much investigation there appeared to be little support from any of the public agencies as to assisting with all of these critical issues.

24. Scotland House was created in 2005 and was completely funded by Scottish businessmen and entrepreneurs, there was never any intention that this should be a business in its own right but it should be a support mechanism for Scottish businesses where they would have an account manager on the ground that could help assist in the critical areas identified in 5.2 above.

25. Following meetings with SDI some years later on the lack of presence in the Baltic States they co-fund the account manager in Scotland House in Tallinn, Estonia.

26. When Scotland House was opened it was located in a building within the Old Town, it was very quickly realised that Scottish businessmen who were often on tight schedules didn’t have time to come to another office but instead they wanted to have back to back meetings in their hotels and required the assistance of the project manager at that venue to assist with meetings, accordingly it was deemed that a standalone physical office was not required and what was really adding value was the skills of the account manager and not a fancy office location.

27. The Scotland House Account Manager is now located at a hot desk location within an Estonian business that a Scottish Entrepreneur has interests in.

28. John has had conversations with Scottish Entrepreneurs in New York, Washington, Toronto Canada, Australia, The Cook Islands, China, Hong Kong, New Delhi, Poland and Dubai who would be willing to give something back to Scotland by providing a similar arrangement to ensure that every single pound invested in Scotland’s future goes the furthest.
OTHER ORGANISATIONS

29. In considering the whole area of exporting and Internationalisation John felt it was critical to look at what other organisations could perhaps play a role similar to Scotland House in being a key ingredient of any new recipe that the committee may consider appropriate.

30. For the purposes of this submission John has identified the three most suitable organisations that could add the maximum value as Globalscots, SCDI and Business Club Scotland.

31. The Globalscots network is one of the best kept secrets in Scotland yet has the potential to unlock one of the key components of creating real sustainable economic growth for Scotland. The vast network of members who have all committed dedication to Scotland could play a critical role as key local contacts and be part of a new recipe for delivering networking nodes for Scottish companies in new markets.

32. SCDI as previously outlined has a strong track record in delivering exceptional value for money in International Trade; John has not only been on many of these missions and had direct contractual success but can testify to the unstated economic benefit of non direct mission business being done directly and by referral between members who meet on such missions.

33. Business Club Scotland is perhaps the organisation that shows the most potential as it has cleverly and successfully modelled itself on Business Club Australia who have a proven track record in delivery of Sustainable economic growth.

34. It is John’s firm view that the skills required to deliver maximum impact International Trade and exporting opportunities exist between the models of Scotland House, SCDI, Business Club Scotland and Globalscots.

OTHER POINTS

35. Whilst there will always be “key sectors” it is John’s view that the multi sector missions are by a considerable way the most appropriate in delivering added value to both the participant companies directly and the economic growth of Scotland generally.

36. The Key test for participation and support is one of the desire of the participants to grow and internationalise on the back of a sound business plan to achieve this end.

37. As well as learning from the Business Club Australia model of success a great deal can be learned from the Irish model of expanding trade missions to become Trade, Education and Culture Missions, again this widening of activity on the ground, creates more interest on foreign soil in Scotland PLC and all things associated with it.
MINISTERIAL LEADERSHIP

38. It is John’s view that in these difficult times there is far too much emphasis on any foreign trips being viewed as junkets. It is John’s strong view that this is simply not true and is damaging the prospects of success for genuine Trade Missions.

39. John’s experience in Tallinn and beyond is that when a Minister or MSP is a participant or a leader of a trade mission the general interest in that mission increases by a considerable multiplier. This view is consistent with previous evidence given to inquiries in the Scottish Parliament by John and is simply a fact.

40. It is John’s view that wherever possible when any Minister or MSP is required to go abroad on official business they should be accompanied by a delegation of Scottish Companies and help facilitate meetings by either attending specific meetings if possible or by hosting a reception or breakfast seminar.

RECOMMENDATIONS

41. That the Economic Rationale for Internationalisation is made more clearly and embraced as one of the key tenants of creating Sustainable Economic Growth for Scotland.

42. That a new recipe for success is created perhaps allocating resource from SDI as the lead body in Internationalisation and adopting a greater “Scotland House” style method of delivery abroad to ensure maximum value for every pound invested and being an integral part of the Globalscots network. The majority of Globalscot members will be only too happy to give something back, this plan will help better target efforts to do so and often at little or no direct cost to the Globalscot. That Business Club Scotland be charged with delivering the message of Internationalisation to small, medium and new exporters in accordance with the tried and tested systems of Business Club Australia that are extremely successful.

43. That a minimum of a 3 year multi sector trade mission programme is developed providing certainty and longevity of commitment to the markets.

44. That when Ministers or MSP’s are making foreign trips they are accompanied by Scottish Companies and they play their part in fighting for Scottish business and in turn Scottish jobs.

John McGlynn BA, LLB, Dip LP
Founder
Airlink Group of Companies
February 2010
Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee

14th Meeting, 2010 (Session 3), Wednesday, 28 April, 2010

The public sector’s support for exporters, international trade and the attraction on inward investment

Background

1. The Committee received the following written evidence submissions from the following:
   - BioIndustry Association Scotland;
   - Gordon Hay.

2. The Committee also receive some key bullet points from Deborah O’Neil and copies of two overheads from presentations she used as part of the OLS road-show and Thistle 2010, which the Committee may find useful.

3. The submissions and bullet points are attached in the annexe to this paper and the overheads will be issued separately as a private paper. Members are invited to take them into account in their deliberations when questioning today’s witness.

Stephen Imrie
Clerk to the Committee
April 2010
SUBMISSION FROM THE BIOINDUSTRY (SCOTLAND)

1. Scottish Development International plays a key role in the success of the Life Sciences sector in Scotland and it essential that the organisation retains its levels of funding and remains fit for purpose.

2. SDI’s success in keeping Scotland’s reputation as a world leader in areas such as regenerative medicine is vital if we are to retain companies and attract companies to locate here. Scotland’s image internationally and branding is excellent and much of this is down to SDI’s efforts since being set up.

3. SDI also promotes Scotland as a leading academic environment and makes the link to Scotland’s SME base via trade missions e.g. the recent Regenerative medicine mission to Japan which included Professor Sir Ian Wilmut and some of Scotland’s emerging company base. Travel interventions are essential for the smaller companies as trips to places such as Japan can be very expensive.

4. SDI services our young/smaller company base very well and we would hope that this continues in the future.

5. One area that our larger more established companies feel that there is room for improvement in is in the retention of companies once they are located here. The retention of companies after they locate in Scotland, including, possibly, post-acquisition, is a key role that SDI or perhaps Scottish Enterprise plays. The BIA is in contact with the Innovation and Industries department of the Business Enterprise and Energy Directorate, part of the Scottish Government, to examine how this can be improved and the BIA is happy to work with the Government to do this. Having larger life sciences companies in Scotland is essential to maintain the cluster and critical mass for the sector. Having a global player such as Pfizer or Merck locally helps emerging companies to access markets and gain a better understanding of these before overseas trips to those markets are made. Having innovative funding mechanisms to help the smaller companies work with the larger companies is something that the BIA is working on nationally through fiscal mechanisms, such as consortium relief, but until this either becomes law or a devolved power, Scotland needs to look at economic powers to ensure that this moves forward in the short term.

6. Scotland lacks a major venture capitalist which is a barrier to growth for life sciences companies. In answer to this, Scotland’s business angel community has stepped in and Scotland can now boast one of the most sophisticated business angel communities in the world. This could be further enhanced by Scottish Development International helping to promote our angel community internationally and helping it to engage with new angels looking to invest alongside local angels in Scottish Life Sciences companies.

7. In summary: Scotland is excellent in promoting our companies internationally and in securing inward investment. What could be improved is the support given in the retention of companies and in leveraging international sources of finance to augment existing sources of capital in Scotland.

BioIndustry Scotland
21 April 2010
SUBMISSION FROM GORDON HAY

1. I have been informed that you are launching an enquiry into “the public sector’s support for exporters, international trade and the attraction of inward investment”

2. Before I begin I must point out that this letter is unsolicited and these are my personal views and not necessarily those of the Company.

3. Bio-Rad Laboratories Europe Ltd (BRLE) is a wholly owned subsidiary of the American multinational Bio-Rad Laboratories Inc. who supply instruments and reagents for research and diagnostic purposes to the Life Science community worldwide.

4. BRLE manufactures and distributes neonatal screening kits which are used to test newborn babies for inborn errors of metabolism. At our Perth facility we manufacture kits which are used to test over 7 million babies annually and more than 99% of the products we manufacture are exported. Our main markets are China, South America, South Korea and India. I have visited China and India as part of the overseas trade missions organised, mainly by Scottish Development International (SDI), but I have also been on missions arranged by the Scottish Council for Development and Industry (SCDI). I have found these trade missions to be an invaluable method of starting and growing our business in overseas markets. One of the reasons we have good growth in both China and India is because I was encouraged and assisted to travel to these markets by SDI. I also received from them good tailored marketing information wherever I went. I doubt whether we would have been so successful in these markets without the assistance of SDI.

5. As an indication of how well we are doing I can tell you that our sales in China have been growing at 20% since my visits and last year our sales to India grew by 60%.

6. I cannot pass judgement on whether SDI and SCDI are providing optimal service to the few of us who are still manufacturing in Scotland but I can say that the assistance I have received has been of the highest quality and has been instrumental in our success in these key developing markets.

7. I would be happy to supply you with numerous examples of the help and encouragement which SDI have given me over the years should you wish this information.

8. Before closing I really hope that you are not trying to use SDI and SCDI as a political football and that you haven’t set up this enquiry with a view to slashing their budgets in some pre-election gesture to show that you are “saving the country money”. In the current economic climate Scotland’s manufacturers need all the support that is available to help them start or grow in overseas markets. By all means make suggestions to improve the great service that they give to exporters but please don’t destroy a world class
organisation which is the envy of many countries including our neighbours to the south of us.

9. If you have any questions or require any additional information please let me know and I will do what I can to help.

Gordon D. Hay
January 2010
Key points from Deborah O’Neil

- Opportunities afforded in Scotland to ‘test the commercial waters’ of scientific concepts encourages the spin out process for NovaBiotics (Proof of Concept fund, RSE Fellowship scheme, SMART funding, local Scottish Enterprise pre-seed grant support etc.). More easily accessed funding & support and a different spin-out culture than most/rest of UK (2000/2001).

- Scottish Enterprise play a major role in driving this.

- Strength of the academic science base and clinical practice in Scotland – pedigree and systems recognised by and attractive to the pharmaceutical/biotechnology industry.
  - Scotland is the second highest ranking country (behind Switzerland) in delivery of life science measurable outputs.

- Scotland’s super-cluster of complementary regional clusters of excellence (e.g. biologics drug discovery in Aberdeen, regenerative medicine in Edinburgh, cell signaling in Dundee) that work well together (SULSA alliance etc.)

- Ability for Scotland to provide a ‘complete package’ of drug discovery, CRO and clinical development opportunities (but lacking manufacturing offerings) is unique.

- Infrastructure and resources of spin-out companies need to be further improved Scotland-wide (strategically versus purely geographically) and to attract more ‘big pharma’ players to Scotland.

- Funding culture (private sector) completely at odds with the strength of the sector and focused on other sectors.

- Quality of life a major selling point when attracting people from the sector elsewhere into the country and once here, they stay which means key staff retention usually not an issue.

Deborah O’Neil
Novabiotics
April 2010
Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee  

14th Meeting, 2010 (Session 3), Wednesday, 28 April 2010  

Budget Strategy Phase 2011-12 - Approach

Introduction

1. As part of its agreed approach to the Budget Strategy Phase (BSP), the Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee will today take evidence from VisitScotland. This will be followed on 12 May by the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Sustainable Growth. Written submissions of evidence have been requested from all of these public sector bodies.

Background

The Committee’s general approach to evidence taking

2. The Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee’s scrutiny as part of the BSP will focus on identifying the Scottish Government’s priorities for financial year 2011-12 and beyond, determining whether the budget is delivering on these priorities and making suggestions for alternative strategies. Of particular interest is the public sector’s response to the predicted reductions in future Scottish budgets.

3. As such, evidence has been sought around the following points: spending priorities, whether any future spending should be ring-fenced, contributions that can be anticipated from further efficiency savings and delivery of the various policies and initiatives in the Scottish Government’s economic recovery plans and business plans of the various agencies.

Evidence from VisitScotland

4. The central theme to explore with VisitScotland is what situation does the national tourism body expect to face in terms of budgets from 2011-12 and beyond, and how will it adapt to the expected tightening of public sector expenditure.

5. In addition, the Committee may wish to revisit some of the issues which it has previously explored with VisitScotland where they are relevant to the budget scrutiny phase. For example:

- Progress with delivering efficiencies outlined during evidence for the 2010/11 budget scrutiny process and any impact these have had and future efficiencies could have on front-line services or connectivity for Scotland’s businesses or tourism;
- Tourism figures - what impact the recession has had on tourism and how VisitScotland is adapting its focus in response;
- Homecoming – any legacy effect that will allow VisitScotland to make savings now that these large investments are complete;
Tourism bank, the national tourism investment plan and reforms under Tourism Framework For Change – the progress that is being made with these initiatives and the resources that VisitScotland requires to secure future progress.

**Recommendation**

6. Members of the Committee are asked to note this approach paper for taking evidence from VisitScotland as part of the Budget Strategy Phase within the Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee.

Joanna Hardy  
Senior Assistant Clerk  
April 2010
Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee

14th Meeting, 2010 (Session 3), Wednesday, 28th April 2010

Committee Annual Report

Background

1. Under Standing Order Rule 12.9, all mandatory and subject committees in the Parliament are required to submit a report to the Parliament containing details of its activities during that Parliamentary year, including details of its meetings and the number of times the committee has met in private, and how the committee has taken account of equal opportunities in its work.

2. This year’s annual report covers the period 9 May 2009 to 8 May 2010. A copy of the draft text is set out in the annexe to this paper.

Decision/recommendation

3. Members of the Committee are asked to review the draft annual report and agree a final version. The clerk will arrange for this to be published at the same time as the reports from other committees.

Stephen Imrie
Clerk to the Committee
April 2010
DRAFT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT

Introduction

1. During the parliamentary year from 9 May 2009 to 8 May 2010, the Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee has again been busy. During this period, the Committee concluded two major inquiries, launched a third, and also considered a number of bills and other forms of legislation.

Inquiries and reports

Determining and delivering on Scotland’s energy future
2. Lasting nearly a year, this major study into energy supply and use in Scotland came to a conclusion with the publication of the Committee’s report in June 2009. The comprehensive inquiry set out the challenges and opportunities facing Scotland in the coming years. A detailed vision of Scotland’s energy future was agreed by the Committee along with a political action plan to spell out the decisions that need to be taken if this future is to be realised. During the inquiry, the Committee heard from 120 witnesses who came and gave evidence to us and considered over 125 written submissions.

3. The Committee’s vision for Scotland’s energy future and its recommendations were built around four inter-locking principles: maximising the efficiency of energy supply and use, minimising environmental impact, ensuring social justice and maximising the economic and employment benefits within the energy industries.

The way forward for Scotland’s banking and financial services industry
4. The Committee’s second major inquiry of this year looked at the ramifications of the problems in the banking sector and the impacts on the wider economy. The inquiry report was published in March 2010. The report looked at the lessons that need to be learned as well as the challenges ahead in terms of the ongoing reform of the banking and financial services industry and what is in Scotland’s best interest.

5. The Committee considered that in addition to being an important business in its own right, the banking and building society sector in Scotland has to support the production of goods and services in the rest of the economy. Its view was that the events of 2007-8 represented a catastrophic failure against this objective. The financial crisis and the resulting recession have undermined the economic growth agenda in Scotland. Unemployment has risen and further cuts in the public sector to reduce the national deficit seem inevitable. The Committee considered that it was important to manage the legacy of the financial crisis, ensuring that it never happens again and to develop a sustainable financial services industry that supports the rest of the economy.

---

1 Available at: http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/s3/committees/eet/reports-09/eer09-07-vol01-01.htm
2 Available at: http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/s3/committees/eet/reports-10/eer10-03-vol01.htm
Scottish economy both as an employer and as a provider of capital and other financial services to consumers.

The public sector's support to Scottish industry for international trade, exports and the attraction of inward investment
6. The Committee's new inquiry for the coming year focuses on how well the public sector supports Scottish companies to internationalise their operations as well as how we support inward investment. This inquiry was launched in March 2010 and is expected to conclude by the end of June 2010.

Budget scrutiny
7. The Committee also completed its scrutiny of the Scottish Government's draft budget for 2010-11.

Bills

Arbitration (Scotland) Bill
8. The Committee also completed its consideration of the Scottish Government's Arbitration (Scotland) Bill. The Bill clarified, consolidated and updated Scottish arbitration law. The Bill completed its passage through Parliament in November 2009 and became law in January 2010.

UK legislation
9. During the year, the Committee considered two legislative consent memoranda for the Energy Bill and the Constitutional Reform and Governance Bill respectively. In both instances, the Committee recommended that the Scottish Parliament gave its consent to the UK Parliament to alter the executive competence of Scottish Ministers and/or make changes to devolved powers.

Subordinate legislation
10. In this parliamentary year, the Committee also considered the draft Renewables Obligation (Scotland) Amendment Order 2009 and its successor for 2010, and the draft Census (Scotland) Order 2010. Both instruments were recommended for approval.

Petitions
11. During this year, no petitions were considered by the Committee.

Innovation/Networks/Miscellaneous
12. As part of its efforts to engage with key groups, the Committee jointly hosted a seminar with the STUC looking at the challenges facing the economy and public sector finances from a trades union perspective; held on

3 The remit and terms of reference are available at: http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/s3/committees/eet/inquiries/Trade/Tradeinquiry.htm
4 Available at: http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/s3/committees/finance/reports-09/fir09-07-vol2-01.htm#annd#annd
12 May 2010. The Committee also co-organised – along with the Scottish Government – the 5th Business in the Parliament Conference on 18-19 June 2009\(^5\).

**Equalities**

13. The Committee has ensured that any meetings and events it organises reflect the Parliament’s guidance on these issues and endeavours to ensure that equalities issues are covered in any scrutiny of legislation or as part of any inquiry undertaken.

**Meetings**

14. During the parliamentary year (from 9 May 2009 to 8 May 2010), the Committee met 34 times, one meeting was entirely in private and 12 were partly in private. Of the 13 meetings where some or all items were in private, all were to consider draft reports or discuss the appointment of an adviser.

15. All formal committee meetings were held in Edinburgh during this parliamentary year.

---