Public Petitions Committee – a template for public petitions

Should you wish to submit a public petition for consideration by the Public Petitions Committee please complete the template below. Please refer to the Guidance on submission of public petitions for advice on issues of admissibility before completing the template. You may also seek advice from the Clerk to the Committee whose contact details can be found at the end of this form.

Details of principal petitioner:

*Please enter the name of person and organisation raising the petition, including a contact address where correspondence should be sent to, email address and phone number if available*

Marilyn de Blieck

Text of petition:

*The petition should clearly state what action the petitioner wishes the Parliament to take in no more than 5 lines of text, e.g.*

*The petitioner requests that the Scottish Parliament considers and debates the implications of the proposed Agenda for Change legislation for Speech and Language Therapy Services and service users within the NHS*

Petition by Marilyn de Blieck on behalf of Ayrshire Voices calling on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Executive to develop a coherent national policy in relation to the teaching of singing and in particular to ensure adequate provision of vocal tuition for young people across Scotland.

Additional information:

*Any additional information in relation to your petition, including reasons why the action requested is necessary, should not be included here. However, it may be appended to the petition and will be made available to the Public Petitions Committee prior to its consideration of your petition. Please note that you should limit the amount of any additional information which you may wish to provide in support of your petition to no more than 4 sides of A4.*
Action taken to resolve issues of concern before submitting the petition:

Before submitting a petition to the Parliament, petitioners are expected to have made an attempt to resolve their issues of concern by, for example, making representations to the Scottish Executive or seeking the assistance of locally elected representatives, such as councillors, MSPs and MPs. Please enter details of those approached below and append copies of relevant correspondence, which will be made available to the Public Petitions Committee prior to its consideration of your petition.

John Scott MSP

Request to speak:

Petitioners may request to appear before the Public Petitions Committee in support of their petition, although it should be noted that requests to speak will only be granted if the Convener considers that a brief statement from the petitioner would be useful in facilitating the Committee’s consideration of the petition. Due to the large volume of petitions being considered the Committee will usually only hear presentations on up to 4 new petitions at each meeting.

Please indicate below whether you wish to request to make a brief statement before the Committee when it comes to consider your petition.

Yes / 

*Delete as appropriate

Signature of principal petitioner:

When satisfied that your petition meets all the criteria outlined in the Guidance on submission of public petitions, the principal petitioner should sign and date the form in the box below. Other signatures gathered should be appended to this form.

Signature

Date 22/05/08

Please note that any additional information, copies of relevant correspondence and additional signatures should be appended to this form and submitted to:

The Clerk to the Public Petitions Committee,
The Scottish Parliament,
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP
Tel: 0131 348 5186    Fax: 0131 348 5088
e-mail: petitions@scottish.parliament.uk
Dear James,

Thank you for your letter of 30 June in which you ask for our response to petition PE860 by Marilyn de Blieck, on behalf of Ayrshire Voices. The petitioner has called specifically for a ‘coherent national policy in relation to teaching of singing’ and for the Scottish Executive to ensure adequate provision of vocal tuition for young people in Scotland.

The Scottish Executive regards the voice in the same way as any other musical instrument. The Scottish Arts Council therefore offers support for vocal music in partnership with local authorities in the light of sector and community needs and aspirations.

The Executive is committed to ensuring that children and young people in Scotland are given access to music tuition (here, again, we refer to both instrumental and vocal tuition) and a diversity of music-making activities. We are working with the Scottish Arts Council, representatives of the youth music sector and our partners in local authorities towards achieving this goal. In 2003, the Scottish Executive provided £17.5 million towards the establishment of the Youth Music Initiative (YMI) with an associated target to ensure that ‘by 2006, all schoolchildren should have had access to one year’s free music tuition by the time they reach Primary 6’. A further £20 million has since been committed to enable this target to be maintained to 2008.

In addition to achieving and sustaining the P6 target, YMI resources are intended to help local authorities to innovate and improve their music services for children and young people, both within and outwith schools. In terms of encouraging national coherence, funds are available to address the barriers to participation and weaknesses in provision identified in the Scottish Arts Council’s What’s Going On? A National Audit of Youth Music in Scotland (2003).

The Scottish Executive is aware that singing is one of the ‘provision gaps’ identified within What’s Going On? We believe that steps are being taken to address this through the YMI. The Scottish Arts Council is responsible for the management of the YMI and will provide a detailed response to the
references that the petitioner makes to this initiative in relation specifically to singing provision and the development of infrastructure supporting music tuition generally.

Turning to the specific queries raised at your meeting of 6 June, the Committee has asked for details of the current position of singing in the school curriculum. Decisions on what, how and when to teach are for local authorities and schools within the context of the National Priorities for education. The importance of providing all pupils with opportunities to experience music and music-making within timetabled class music lessons is highlighted in the 5-14 Expressive Arts curriculum guidelines. The guidelines also offer general guidance on attainment targets and programmes of study, including voice, to assist teachers in teaching and learning music in the school.

Initial teacher education courses for primary teachers devote a considerable amount of time to the teaching of the expressive arts. Beyond that, all teachers are now required to undertake 35 hours of professional development each year, the nature of which is to be agreed between each teacher and her or his line manager in the light of the teacher’s personal development needs and school, local authority and national priorities.

In terms of future provision, Ambitious Excellent Schools sets out Ministers’ agenda for the most comprehensive programme of modernisation of education in Scotland for a generation. The process of testing individual areas of the curriculum against the principles and purposes in A Curriculum for Excellence has begun. The intention is to ensure that the broad outcomes we look for from school education are achieved through subject teaching and more cross-subject activity. Music can make a major contribution to achieving the National Priorities for education and can also play a key role in developing every young person as a successful learner, confident individual, responsible citizen and effective contributor. This important contribution will be taken into account in the detailed review of expressive arts.

The petitioner asserts that there are both health and social benefits to be had from singing, and the Committee queries whether there is specific research available which ‘shows the benefit of singing in building confidence and self-esteem’. The attached paper (Annex A), prepared by Janet Ruiz, Principal Research Officer within the Analytical Services Unit of Tourism, Culture and Sport Group, summarises available research findings which have looked at the wider benefits and impacts of music and singing. It is difficult to pinpoint a convincing body of evidence on the benefits of singing per se. However, The Power of Music 2001 (Professor Sue Hallam, for The Performing Rights Society) is the largest of the projects cited and this reviews research evidence produced over the last twenty years on the health, educational and social benefits of music, including singing.

The Scottish Executive takes such evidence seriously. We recognise the potential benefits that participating in music can bring to children and young people in terms of their wellbeing and development, as well as in supporting their education and contributing to the Executive’s wider priorities. Projects funded by SEED’s Future Learning and Teaching programme (FLAT) include a pilot music comprehensive in North Lanarkshire, where new ways of using participation in music to improve ethos and attainment and to build self esteem are being piloted. Arts Across the Curriculum is a major 3 year FLAT project being piloted across 7 local authorities. This will adopt a multi-disciplinary approach exploring both the contribution that the arts – including music – can make to subjects across the curriculum as well as the wider impact on pupil, teacher and artist in terms of collaborative and creative working. St Mungo’s Learning Community in Glasgow are piloting Arts and Minds, which will establish programmes to demonstrate the scope of music to improve listening, language and literacy skills, to promote students’ creativity and shared enterprise and to raise and sustain aspirations for achievement and attainment for those involved. A year long pilot in Dumfries & Galloway, Instrumental Music Lessons Through Videoconferencing, will examine the
effectiveness of this medium in providing opportunities for pupils in more remote locations to have greater access to music lessons.

Finally, SEED’s *Schools of Ambition* programme is designed to raise the ambitions of schools, instil belief and ambition in pupils, extend their opportunities, transform their life chances and engage the local community in this process. A selection of schools accepted onto the first round of this programme have focused their individual plans on arts and music as one way of achieving this.

I trust the Committee will find this information useful.

Yours sincerely

SIMON FORREST
Private Secretary
EDUCATION AND SOCIAL BENEFITS FROM MUSIC

1. THE BENEFITS OF SINGING (SPECIFICALLY)

1.1 Health

- Active singing can have benefits in terms of enhancing mood, active coping with chronic pain, and reducing pain; research findings suggest that active singing may be more effective than passively listening to singing in chronic pain patients and, like exercise, is a simple, cost effective intervention in vulnerable and depressed groups (Impact of Group Singing on Mood, Coping and Perceived Pain in Chronic Pain Patients Attending a Multidisciplinary Pain Clinic, Journal of Music Therapy, Fall 2004).

- Research on the benefits of a university college choral society found that 84% of participants perceived improved lung function and breathing, improved mood and stress reduction (The perceived benefits of singing: findings from preliminary surveys of a university college choral society: Cliff S M, Hancox G, Centre for Health Education and Research, Canterbury Christ Church University College, in National Library of Medicine, PubMed, 2001).

1.2 Social

- In the choral society research (above) a large majority of respondents agreed they had benefited socially and emotionally (meeting new people, feeling more positive, more alert and spiritually uplifted).

- Strong social bonds are developed through music and songs beginning in preschool (Promoting Literacy Through Music, Laura Woodall and Brenda Ziembro, in Songs for Teaching: Using Music to Promote Learning).

1.3 Education

- Singing in preschool encourages toddlers to begin to experiment with grammatical rules and various rhyming patterns in songs and other written text – research has shown that this can improve memory skills and increase aural discrimination (Chong & Gan, 1997).

- Listening skills are key in singing, language and expressive movement, and later reading and writing (Wolf, 1992).

- Singing and songs put to print can expand children’s vocabulary and knowledge of story structure (Clay, 1993).

- Effects of music (and singing) on the brain and thinking are demonstrable – an electroencephalogram shows that music can change brain waves and make the brain more receptive to learning (Davies, 2000).

2. GENERAL

The findings below reflect the findings of national and international research carried out over the last 20 years, and reported in the report “The Power of Music” 2001 (Professor Sue Hallam, for The Performing Rights Society). The study draws together available research into the strengths of music's influence on people’s lives - its proven positive effects on wellbeing and its ability to trigger emotions.

2.1 MUSIC (INCLUDING SINGING) AND FORMAL EDUCATION:

- Music lessons designed to develop auditory, visual and motor skills have benefited reading skills.
• Learning to play a musical instrument has been shown to produce small temporary effects on spatial reasons, but not on other aspects of cognitive functioning.
• Studies exploring the effects of increasing the amount of classroom music within the curriculum have found that children who received extra music lessons kept up with their peers in language and reading skills despite having fewer lessons.
• Taking music is positively related to better performance in other subjects (although this does not necessarily mean that it is the cause of it).

2.2 MUSIC AND EFFECTS ON PERSONAL DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL SKILLS:
• There are demonstrable positive effects of involvement with music on children’s personal and social development.
• Children receiving additional or regular classroom music lessons have shown increased social cohesion within class, greater self-reliance, better social adjustment and more positive attitudes – these effects are particularly marked in low ability, disaffected pupils.
• Children of low economic status receiving individual piano lessons have also exhibited increases in self-esteem compared with control groups.
• Music can increase social inclusion.
• In a UK study of the impact of arts in education, in music there were perceived effects relating to awareness of others, social skills, well-being and transfer effects.
• Some students in the study perceived the benefits of music classes in listening to music and the development of musical skills; others referred to the sheer enjoyment and therapeutic nature of music, how it gave them confidence to perform in front of others, how it facilitated group work and how it enabled them to learn to express themselves.
• Those who played instruments mentioned an increase in self-esteem and sense of identity.
• Research with instrumental music teachers shows that they believe that the benefits of learning to play an instrument include the development of social skills, gaining a love and enjoyment of music, developing team-work, developing a sense of achievement, confidence and self-discipline, and developing physical co-ordination.
• Learning music can also develop a range of transferable skills including those related to creativity and critical thinking.

2.3 MUSIC AND HEALTH BENEFITS
• Music can be used to reduce anxiety in waiting areas before surgery, promote pre-operative relaxation in a burns unit, and calming patients.
• Music has proved very effective in maintaining the motivation, psychological well-being, physical comfort and exercise endurance of bone marrow transplant patients.
• Anxiety has been reduced in patients who have had heart attacks, receiving chemotherapy, patients with tumours and those undergoing treatment for addiction.
• Muscle relaxation has been aided in general and in relation to chiropractic interventions.
• Music has proved useful in assisting the reduction of anxiety in children and across a range of patients in dentistry.
• Music can reduce pain, the benefits appearing to be greater for women than men, and for children and adolescents than for adults and infants.
• Music can ameliorate some of the effects of Alzheimer’s disease, improving social behaviour, vocalising, reducing restlessness during meals, reducing agitated behaviour, improving reality orientation and face recognition.
• Some of the negative effects of schizophrenia have been alleviated by music therapy and children with psychotic symptoms have benefited from music playing in the background when engaged in learning.
Music therapy can help children with learning difficulties to focus their attention, increase their concentration span and over time, improve vocalisations, looking behaviour, imitation and initiation of ideas. It can also develop communications skills.

Music can be effective with children with learning difficulties when it is offered as a reward for particular behaviours, eg to develop attention, reading or numeracy skills or reduce the incidence of aggression or maladaptive behaviour.

Summary compiled by:
Janet Ruiz
Principal Research Officer
Analytical Services Unit
Tourism, Culture and Sport Division

July 2005
Ref: MP/ PP

Dr James Johnston
Clerk to the Public Petitions Committss
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Dear Dr Johnston

Petition No PE860 - Response from the Scottish Arts Council

Petition No PE860 - Petition by Marilyn de Blieck on behalf of Ayrshire Voices calling on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Executive to develop a coherent national policy in relation to the teaching of singing and in particular to ensure adequate provision of vocal tuition for young people across Scotland.

Introduction
The Scottish Arts Council welcomes this petition from Mrs de Blieck and is very encouraged by the committee’s interest in the Youth Music Initiative and the promotion of vocal tuition.

Singing and vocal tuition play an important role in the Scottish Arts Council Music Department’s policy and work plan. The Scottish Arts Council supports a number of professional singers and vocal groups along with organisations which support singing in the voluntary sector such as the National Youth Choir of Scotland and Making Music Scotland, whose membership includes 110 choral societies across Scotland.

A number of choirs and singing groups have benefited from lottery funding directly through the Scottish Arts Council and through the National Lottery Awards for All scheme which is funded by the Scottish Arts Council. Many smaller projects are funded through National Lottery funding which is aimed at widening access to the arts. However, the short term project funding which lottery grants support, creates a difficulty in continuity of service and longer term funding.

Background to the Youth Music Initiative
The Scottish Arts Council manages and distributes funding for the Scottish Executive’s Youth Music Initiative (YMI). The Initiative draws upon many of the recommendations from the report What’s Going On?. (A copy of What’s Going On? can be found by following this link http://www.scottisharts.org.uk/1/information/publications/1000326.aspx)

The initial three year YMI programme has received staged funding of £2.5m in 2003, £5m in 2004 and £10m in 2005. (A breakdown of the funding given to South Ayrshire local authority is given as an appendix).

Response from the Youth Music Manager 21sept 05
Funding has been channelled through curricular activity (formal sector) and non curricular (informal sector) channels.

Local Authorities were asked to balance their judgement and understanding of local conditions, needs and priorities with the identified national priorities in What's Going On? One of these priorities was singing and Local Authorities were asked to consider how vocal instruction could be given parity with instrumental instruction when submitting proposals for funding.

From YMI funding, the majority of Local Authorities are delivering singing provision. Many of these Local Authorities have strong partnerships with the National Youth Choirs of Scotland (NYCoS).

Many Local Authorities have recognised the need to continue provision into further years and have not limited the access to one year.

The Youth Music Initiative has also developed a National Strategy and Development Plan which is currently awaiting final approval from the Scottish Executive. The Strategy and Development Plan are inclusive of all instruments, voice, styles and genre.

There will be an independent evaluation of the initial 3 years of the YMI. The specification for this is now complete and will be put out to tender.

The Keynote Trust
The Keynote Trust has made three successful lottery applications to the Scottish Arts Council in the past. These are summarised below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Funding</th>
<th>Description of grant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>£135,051</td>
<td>Towards the cost of three year programme of development of Keynote Trust's educational work with young singers in Ayrshire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03/04</td>
<td>£3000</td>
<td>Towards the cost of staging a children's opera &quot;The Piper of Hamelin&quot; by John Rutter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03/04</td>
<td>£4000</td>
<td>Towards the cost of producing Michael Norris's opera for young people &quot;Tam O'Shanter&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An unsuccessful application to the Youth Music Initiative by the Keynote Trust was referred to in the committee's discussions. The Scottish Arts Council would like to clarify the following points about this application.

- The application referred to was made in the first round of the 'Informal' fund which had a closing date of July 5th 2004 and not in the most recent round (October 11th 2004) as stated in the meeting.
- The application referred to was made by the Keynote Trust.
- The application was unsuccessful, with the following explanation given in the decision letter:

  I am sorry to disappoint you, but your application for YMI funding was unsuccessful on this occasion. Applications exceeded the available funds within this round of funding and it was only possible to award funds to those which best fulfilled the criteria for the scheme.

  Your proposal was seen as an ambitious project backed with considerable artistic and educational experience. However, since it focused on the development of a single production it was not seen as either strategically significant or sufficiently sustainable in the longer term. The proposal did not rate highly against the scheme criteria.

Response from the Youth Music Manager 21 sept 05
You may wish to consider whether the project would justify an application to SAC and other open funds which are more open to stand alone projects than the YMI funding.

From the above you will see that the application was for a single production and not for the sustaining of the Keynote Trust as an organisation.

The criteria applying to all applications from the 'informal' sector were:

The Scottish Arts Council, advised by the Youth Music Initiative Reference group, will assess each application. Each application will be judged on:

- the artistic quality of the proposal;
- its ability to make a significant and sustainable contribution to widening access to music to young people;
- how well the project will be managed (operationally and financially) and delivered;
- the likelihood of the proposal being realised as described in the proposal.

At no time during the application and feedback process did the Scottish Arts Council or YMI state that Ayrshire Voices was an unsustainable organisation.

The next deadline for informal funding applications is 10 October 2005.

Yours sincerely

Graham Berry
Chief Executive
Youth Music Initiative Funding used towards vocal tuition in South Ayrshire

Formula Funding and Strategic Funding

South Ayrshire Council already provides vocal instruction as part of its Music Service, including access to one on one teaching, group teaching, and choirs. The Youth Music Initiative funding has given it the opportunity to expand its provision of vocal tuition in particular. In schools, it has also allowed it to extend its specialist music teachers to cover many more schools in the local authority, and this teaching includes vocal elements. The proposals for the second year of the Formula Funding specifically focussed on the provision of vocal tuition in the local authority, creating sustainable structures. The proposals for year 3 of Formula Funding includes a partnership with Drake Music to enhance provision for young people with special needs.

With funding from the Strategic Development Fund, South Ayrshire aims to modernise its music curriculum through partnerships with three organisations during 2005-2006, one of which is Scottish Opera. The project encapsulates training for staff, and workshops and performances for pupils. The partnership with Scottish Opera centres on vocal and choral work using a range of vocal techniques, and incorporating both contemporary and traditional styles. The Council aims to make this modernisation sustainable through Formula Funding.

Year 1 Formula Funding (2003-2004)

Total to South Ayrshire: £44,897 (from £2m pot)
- Vocal: £4,075: extra 0.6 FTE vocal instructor
- £30,000: to ‘re-align’ the service, and ‘abolish all fees paid by pupils receiving music instruction’, including vocal instruction

- Expansion of existing provision, including an extra 0.4 FTE vocal instructor. (source: application form)
- Vocal instruction given parity with instrumental instruction (source: assessors’ report)
- This first year of funding ‘is allowing the instrumental and vocal instruction to be mainstreamed into the curriculum provision.’ (source: assessors’ report)

Year 2 Formula Funding (2004-2005)

Total to South Ayrshire: £89,794 (from £4m pot)
- Vocal: £12,339: extra 0.4 FTE vocal instructor (continuation)
- £49,693: 1.6 FTE music specialists in schools, of which 1 FTE includes singing as part of the overall delivery (£31,058)
  - (both amounts include extra CPD training)

- Vocal tuition ‘at the core’ of year 2.
- Extra CPD training for all instructors, including vocal instructors.
Year 2 Strategic Development Funding (2004-2005)

Total to South Ayrshire: £30,000 (from £0.5m pot)

- Partnership with Ngoma, StreetSMART and Scottish Opera: 4 training days for staff, 20 full-day workshops for pupils followed by approximately 6 performances.
- Scottish Opera partnership: focus on vocal and choral work using a range of vocal techniques, and incorporating both contemporary and traditional styles.
- Sustainable through Formula Funding.

Year 3 Formula Funding (2005-2006)

Total to South Ayrshire: £179,588 (from £8m pot)

Vocal:
- £33,295: extra 1 FTE vocal instructor (continuation)
- £57,877: 1.6 FTE music specialists in schools, of which 1 FTE includes singing as part of the overall delivery (£36,173)
- (both amounts include extra CPD training)
- £10,000: partnership with Drake Music

- Continuation of years 1 and 2, plus a new partnership with Drake Music to enhance provision for young people with special needs.

Summary (Formula and Strategic Development Funding)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fund</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Fund total</th>
<th>South Ayrshire allocation</th>
<th>Specific Vocal Tuition</th>
<th>Other areas including vocal activity</th>
<th>Total contributing to vocal instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formula Funding</td>
<td>2003-2004</td>
<td>£2m</td>
<td>£44,897</td>
<td>£4,075 (0.6 FTE vocal instructor)</td>
<td>£30,000 (Music Service realignment)</td>
<td>£34,075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2004-2005</td>
<td>£4m</td>
<td>£89,794</td>
<td>£12,339 (0.4 FTE vocal instructor, incl. CPD training)</td>
<td>£31,058 (1 FTE music specialist with singing as part of overall delivery, incl. CPD training)</td>
<td>£43,397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2005-2006</td>
<td>£8m</td>
<td>£179,588</td>
<td>£33,295 (1 FTE vocal instructor)</td>
<td>£36,173 (1 FTE music specialist with singing as part of overall delivery, incl. CPD)</td>
<td>£79,468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Vocal tuition contribution</td>
<td>Amount granted</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drake Music Project</td>
<td>2004-2005</td>
<td>'To develop high quality opportunities for music-making by young people with special needs', incl. singing.</td>
<td>£28,155</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSAMD</td>
<td>2004-2005</td>
<td>'To research, develop, and pilot a template for training community musicians, initially in Scottish Music' but potentially adapted for use in other genres</td>
<td>£5,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Music</td>
<td>2005-2006</td>
<td>'To develop and run youth programmes with adult music societies', incl. singing (applied for £29,944)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>£33,155 (£63,099)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This does not include the ongoing support offered by the Scottish Arts Council to organisations such as the National Youth Choirs of Scotland.
### Summative Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fund</th>
<th>Fund total</th>
<th>Specific to vocal tuition in South Ayrshire</th>
<th>Other areas contributing to vocal activity in South Ayrshire</th>
<th>Total contributing to vocal tuition in South Ayrshire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formula Funding 03-04</td>
<td>£2m</td>
<td>£4,075</td>
<td>£30,000</td>
<td>£34,075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formula Funding 04-05</td>
<td>£4m</td>
<td>£12,339</td>
<td>£31,058</td>
<td>£43,397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formula Funding 05-06</td>
<td>£8m</td>
<td>£33,295</td>
<td>£46,173</td>
<td>£79,468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Development Funding 04-05</td>
<td>£0.5m</td>
<td>~£10,000</td>
<td>£30,000</td>
<td>~£40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Development Funding 05-06</td>
<td>£1m</td>
<td>no applications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal Sector Funding 03-04</td>
<td>£0.5m</td>
<td>no relevant applications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal Sector Funding 04-05</td>
<td>£0.5m</td>
<td>£0</td>
<td>£33,155</td>
<td>£33,155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal Sector Funding 05-06</td>
<td>£1m</td>
<td>£0</td>
<td>(£29,944)</td>
<td>(£29,944)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>£17.5m</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Approximate total from YMI funding contributing to South Ayrshire vocal tuition 2003-2006: £59,709 (£160,386 (£190,330) £220,095 (£250,039)

### APPENDIX: Breakdown of YMI funding 2003-2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>TOTAL SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE FUNDS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One - 2003/04</td>
<td>£2m</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>£500K</td>
<td>£2.5m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two - 2004/05</td>
<td>£4m</td>
<td>£500K</td>
<td>£500K</td>
<td>£5m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three - 2005/06</td>
<td>£8m</td>
<td>£1m</td>
<td>£1m</td>
<td>£10m</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
08 August 2005

Dr James Johnston
Clerk to the Public Petitions Committee
TG.01
Parliamentary Headquarters
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Dear Dr Johnston

Scottish Parliament Public Petitions Committee – Consideration PE860

I refer to your letter of 30 June 2005. VOCAL has campaigned for a long time for more to be done to widen access to cultural opportunities. We welcomed the Scottish Executive’s Youth Music Initiative and we recognise that a case can be made for extending tuition to singing as well as playing musical instruments. Several councils such as Renfrewshire have supported the teaching of singing but others consider they do not currently have sufficient resources.

Although there is merit in developing a consistent national approach to singing tuition we have reservations about promoting particular art forms in a piecemeal fashion. There needs to be a more strategic approach to increasing participation and fostering talent based on cultural rights and entitlements. As you will be aware Ministers are currently considering a very detailed report from the Cultural Commission. It would be appropriate to consider plans to support the teaching of singing within the context of the broader plans to promote culture proposed by the Commission.

Yours sincerely

Rodney Stone
Secretary
VOCAL - The Voice of Chief Officers of Cultural, Community and Leisure Services in Scotland
Dr James Johnston  
TG.01  
Parliamentary Headquarters  
Edinburgh  
EH99 1SP

Our ref: DGN/PG  
14 July 2005

Dear Dr Johnston

Scottish Parliament Public Petitions Committee – Consideration PE860

Thank you for your invitation to comment on petition PE860, which I will do on behalf of HMIE.

In schools, singing activities take place in class music lessons and extra-curricular choral groups. There are many examples of very high quality provision in this area, often resulting in public performances for parents and others. Almost all pupils of primary school age experience some singing, as advised in 5-14 national guidelines, although the frequency and quality of their experience is variable. At the secondary stages, exposure to singing is determined largely by individual choice, exercised within a broad approach which enables pupils to choose the performing skills they wish to pursue. Few schools take an approach where singing is a mandatory component. Some schools encourage high participation, whereas in other schools participation might be very low. Some schools use singing as an important context for teaching musical skills, knowledge and understanding, whereas others would use other performing contexts for these purposes. Overall it would be fair to say that provision is variable and often determined by local interest and the motivation of individual teachers.

Some pupils benefit from additional, often individual, singing lessons with visiting singing tutors, provided by education authorities on the same basis as other instrumental music lessons. Other contributors to your response will no doubt be well placed to comment on the overall size of this provision. However, HMIE inspection evidence shows that visiting singing tutors are to be found in schools less frequently than is the case with other instrumental groups. Encouragingly, there are signs in some areas of increased activity in this area, including the active promotion of singing through activities organised by partners such as the National Youth Choir of Scotland.

At a recent HMIE effective practice conference in music, delegates shared several examples of effective singing teaching, including a school where all pupils take part in choral singing as part of their examination courses. In this example, the school timetable had been adjusted to enable all music examination classes at different levels to join together on a Friday morning. Another example showed the use of singing in a modern popular idiom being used very effectively as an inclusive education strategy.

Aberdeen • Dundee • Edinburgh • Glasgow • Inverness
Overall, it is fair to say that approaches across schools vary and, whilst there is some outstanding work in some schools, in others one would not detect a strong culture of singing.

Yours faithfully

Graham Norris
Assistant Chief Inspector/National Specialist Music
10 October 2005

Richard Hough
Asst Clerk to Public Petitions Committee
Scottish Parliament
TG.01
Parliamentary HQ
EDINBURGH
EH99 1SP

Dear Mr Hough

SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT PUBLIC PETITIONS COMMITTEE
CONSIDERATION PE860

Thank you for your letter of 2 September 2005 giving COSLA the opportunity to comment on the above-mentioned Petition.

I note that the Committee intends to seek views directly from a number of our member councils – East, North and South Ayrshire – and I am confident that the responses will demonstrate the wide range of activity and commitment to vocal tuition that exists at the moment.

On this occasion, therefore, COSLA does not feel it appropriate to comment as this is regarded as an operational matter for our member councils, falling outwith our key remit of focussing on issues of a political nature.

Could I emphasis that this should not be construed as a lack of support for vocal tuition? The importance of all cultural activities in a school setting is fully recognised by COSLA and I would refer the Committee to that section of our response to the Cultural Commission relating to the role of education (copy enclosed).

Yours sincerely

Anna Fowlie
Team Leaders
Children & Young People Team
The foreword to "Ambitious, Excellent Schools" states that in such establishments "young people get the best opportunity to reach their full potential."

And there is a strong argument that if we want to achieve a step change in creating a confident cultural Scotland, we must start with a new generation of children and young people.

The National Priorities for Education acknowledges the importance of encouraging creativity, ambition, self-reliance, initiative, and an ability to work collaboratively.

These modern skills must be recognised as having equal value to the traditional acquisition of qualifications.

Scotland is a land of huge contrasts not just in its rural and urban geography or the gulfs between affluence and deprivation, but between those specially gifted and those with significant additional needs.

Local cultural strategies need to work with that reality and address social problems including poor health, low self esteem and the poverty of aspiration. They need to give the presently disempowered a real opportunity to re-engage.

We know that young people learn through multiple intelligences and effective schools respond with a variety of opportunities to motivate, stimulate, and raise achievement.
In that context, culture and creativity are of paramount importance.

Research has shown us how the creative child becomes a confident adult open to life long learning opportunities.

Demonstrated too is that cultural and creative activities play a key role in supporting social inclusion and regeneration, and raising both achievement and the level of aspiration.

We now have an opportunity to apply these lessons, particularly at primary school level.

This means a less cluttered more holistic approach to curriculum. It means that cultural entitlements must thread through the formal and informal curriculum and out of school learning.

We believe the route to this lies in bringing together the concepts of the community, health promoting, and effective school recognising the potential and unique talents of every child.

In this way the local cultural strategy becomes not another free-standing initiative, but an ethos within which all schools use a range of approaches to develop self esteem, self confidence and creativity.

There will, however, be some common characteristics of the school which aims for excellence:

- A balanced curriculum which develops multiple intelligences.
- An ethos recognising and nurturing the innate creativity of all children.
- A commitment to the importance of the arts, creativity sport and P.E.
- Contemporary cultural practice in the expressive arts.
- Learning Scottish history and culture while fostering pride in diversity.

- Engagement with local and professional artists and with arts and sports organisations to develop pathways from school into the community.

In addition, local authorities working in partnership with their schools, should develop a range of specific entitlements. Opportunities such as:

- Learning a musical instrument.
- Participating in musical and other artistic experiences.
- Attending a public performance of an artistic nature.
- Learning to swim.
- Becoming involved in physical activities.
- Joining team sports.
- Being offered a range of school activities including shows, concerts, trips award schemes and outward bound experiences.
- Developing his/her talent in a particular aspect of the expressive arts or sport.

Integrated community schools offer a good example of such experiences being fully integrated rather than added on.

Similarly, excellent schools would embed culture throughout the curriculum and have their cultural and creative activities evaluated as part of HMIE school inspections and Scottish Executive benchmarking, that would reflect the National Priorities for Education's emphasis on broader definitions of achievement than straightforward attainment.
Our Ref: FL/CH

26 August 2005

Dr James Johnston
Clerk to the Public Petitions Committee
The Scottish Parliament
TG.01
Parliamentary Headquarters
EDINBURGH
EH99 1SP

Dear Dr Johnston

Scottish Parliament Public Petitions Committee – Consideration PE860

Thank you for your recent letter inviting comment regarding the development of a coherent national strategy on the teaching of singing across Scotland.

In recent years this Council has greatly welcomed focused funding for the youth music initiative. This injection of finance has allowed instrumental instruction provision, including singing, to be expanded. Also, I am sure that those who are involved at national level in taking this and complementary initiatives forward will be conscious of the need to develop a national framework for vocal tuition. It is there that the strategy can be developed and taken forward.

In East Ayrshire, we are supportive of choral music within our arts in education initiative, Creative Minds.

In your letter you asked for information regarding ‘provision of music tuition’ and I attach a copy of our comprehensive programme of activity. I hope that this is of assistance to you.

If I or any of my colleagues can be of any help to you in taking this matter forward, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Thank you for your invitation to comment.

Yours sincerely

Fiona Lees
Chief Executive

Enc
Scottish Parliament Public Petitions Committee – Consideration PE860

The delivery of a quality vocal and choral experience for young people in East Ayrshire is integral to the Creative Minds arts and education strategy.

Background

The Arts in Education are vital to the intellectual and personal development of young people. They are powerful in developing the whole person, and can promote and enhance self-esteem, self-confidence and increase motivation.

It is the Authority’s aim to provide a cohesive and strategic raft of arts opportunities and activities across the Authority addressing, in particular, areas suffering from geographic isolation and socio-economic deprivation through providing access and opportunity for all our young people.

East Ayrshire continues to support and encourage the arts and in particular music education. The recent Inspection of the Education Function (Published February 2003) by Her Majesty’s Inspectorate of Education reported: “A notable feature of the Council’s support for its schools was the very strong emphasis it placed on encouraging and celebrating pupils’ wider achievements, particularly in the arts.”

Initiatives

Youth Music Initiative (Formula Fund)
The application for year three formula funding has been successful. The Reference Group Members “welcomed the fact that this was an excellent plan with considerable attention to detail”.

Main points:

- Instrumental Provision has been increased by 2.4 FTE - 0.6 Strings; 0.6 Percussion; 0.6 Vocal; and 0.6 Guitar.
- Increase number of available instruments - Guitars, drum kits, percussion, cellos, double basses and brass instruments
- Support Summer School Development. The annual programme offers courses in Jazz, Brass, Woodwind, Primary Choral, Strings, Vocal and Piping. Around 160 young people participated in these courses in 2004 which were led by instrumental tutors and visiting musicians from National Organisations e.g. Scottish Opera Orchestra.
- Support continued Primary Choral Development
- Support continued out of school hours string tuition
- Drake Music Project Scotland supporting music education in Special Schools
- Offer enhanced staff development opportunities and explore new methodologies: Kodaly; Conducting and Training; Jazz Improvisation; and Creativity
- Develop Scottish Traditional Music Saturday Morning Centre in Auchinleck in partnership with RSAMD

Youth Music Initiative (Strategic Fund)

As part of a YMI Strategic Consortium Award the council received additional funding to develop creativity in middle primary in partnership with ABC Creative Music Enterprises.
Partnerships

The development of strong partnerships with national music organisations is central to the authority's commitment to quality, equality, access and partnership.

Scottish Chamber Orchestra: Masterworks
Number of participants: 305
The aim of 'Masterworks' is to introduce key works from the chamber orchestra repertoire to secondary school audiences, particularly those pupils who are studying music.

Monster Music Project in partnership with the Royal Scottish National Orchestra. The culmination of teacher workshops and pre-lessons for pupils was a series of three concerts in the Grand Hall, Kilmarnock when the RSNO performed an interactive concert featuring Peter and the Wolf to over 1400 four year olds.

Burns as a Song Writer Initiative. A series of interactive workshop sessions delivered to all schools focussing on the works of Robert Burns and the musical instruments of Scotland.

Scottish Opera: Auntie Janet Saves the Planet
Number of participants at 8 performances: 339
An interactive children's opera for early years with a bio-diversity theme.

International collaboration with pupils from Georgia USA, Sandefjord Norway, Bauzen Germany and East Ayrshire in a performance of a specially commissioned Mini Opera in partnership with Scottish Opera.

International collaboration through Concert Tour to Norway. The Tour included 4 concerts. The first concert took place in Sandefjord and was supported by Mayor Per Foshung and Director of Education Raymond Skoglund. Other venues included the Bøgeskogen Band Stand in Larvik, the Oslo Bymuseum and the Rådhuset, also in Oslo.

Children's Classic Concerts:
Number of participants at 2 concerts: 191
East Ayrshire was invited by CCC to participate in an education outreach programme for schools in 'areas of particular geographic disadvantage'.

Scottish International Piano Competition:
Schools' workshops, recitals & masterclasses
Number of participants: approx 40
East Ayrshire was asked to host an area workshop for senior pupils studying piano.

Rock School sessions in partnership with the School of Music and Recording Technology bring the opportunity for young rock stars to work with professionals from this genre.

BBC Sound Town – BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra school visits, masterclasses and concert.
Annual Concerts and Music Events

XtrArts Out of School Hours Arts Programme supported by the New Opportunities Fund. Opportunities for cello/double bass instruction in string ensemble playing; primary vocal workshops; Jazz workshops and master classes; and a new commissioned work for Brass Band and Senior Choir by Goff Richards.

XtrArts Xtravaganza Concert where all our young people participating in the out of school hours programme get the opportunity to perform to an audience of c.900.
- Primary String Orchestra
- Primary Schools’ Choir
- Three area Primary choirs
- Big Band

East Ayrshire Schools’ Showcase. This gives our young performers the opportunity to perform a wide range of items from selections from musicals to scenes from professional theatre environments. The 9th Schools’ Showcase in May 2004 once again exemplified the high level of achievement in the performing arts throughout the authority with almost 700 pupils from 16 primary and secondary schools participating in 19 performances. Since the first Showcase in 1996, over 4,000 pupils have participated and greatly benefited from the experience of performing on a theatre stage to capacity audiences.

Instrumental Service Gala Concert featuring brass, jazz, vocal, woodwind, keyboard, guitar and vocal performances by pupils receiving instrumental instruction. Over 450 young musicians, representing all Learning Partnerships.

East Ayrshire Schools at Christmas Concert in the Grand Hall, Kilmarnock.

Range and Scope of Provision in Schools:

- **Instruments for which tuition is provided:**
  Tuition is provided in Brass, Woodwind, Strings, Voice, Highland Bagpipes, Percussion, Guitar and Keyboard (including Piano).

- **Number of tutors:**
  7 Brass Instructors (FTE 5.4)
  2 Woodwind Instructors (FTE 2.0)
  2 Percussion Instructors (FTE 1.6)
  1 Highland Bagpipe Instructor (FTE 1.0)
  4 Voice/Piano/Keyboard Instructors (FTE 3.2)
  3 String Instructors (FTE 1.7)
  2 Guitar Instructors (FTE 1.6)

- **Number of pupils receiving instruction:**
  - C.400 primary pupils Brass, Woodwind, Strings, Voice, Highland Bagpipes, Keyboard and Percussion.
  - C. 650 primary pupils receive voice tuition.
  - C. 750 secondary pupils receive tuition in Brass, Woodwind, Strings, Highland Bagpipes, Percussion, Guitar and Keyboard (including Piano).
  - C.220 secondary pupils receive voice tuition.
Main Points

- The Council funding supporting free instrumental instruction across the authority (over 17 FTE)

- The diversity of opportunity available – bands, choirs, ensembles, jazz, Scottish Traditional Music, rock music, sound-beam technology, sound engineering, d-j-ing, song-writing, creative music making, show productions and foreign concert tours.

- The large number of partnerships developed:
  - Local Authorities – Edinburgh, Shetland, North Lanarkshire, Dumfries and Galloway, Fife and North Ayrshire
  - National Organisations – RSNO, SCO, BBC SSO, Scottish Opera, Drake Music Scotland, Tapestry, Scottish Arts Council and Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama
  - International Collaborations – Sandefjord Kommune (Norway), Bauzen – Germany, Atlanta Georgia (USA) and Chicago (USA)

- The significant support to pupils living in areas suffering from geographic, social and economic deprivation through providing:
  - Free transport to rehearsals, courses and concerts
  - Free out-of-school hours activities
  - Free music summer school programme

- The Authority operates a NO CHARGE policy for instrumental instruction.

Summary

Council funding continues to support free instrumental at point of contact and to develop performance experiences and opportunities locally, nationally and internationally. Funding through the Youth Music Initiative enables the Authority to develop summer school and out of school hours learning opportunities for all and to provide a diverse programme of activities. Support from the Scottish Arts Council has enabled the authority to specifically enhance primary choral work and offer exciting new experiences relating to Scottish Traditional Instruments and our indigenous musical heritage.
23 August 2005

Dr James Johnston
Clerk to the Public Petitions Committee
The Scottish Parliament
Parliamentary Headquarters
EDINBURGH
EH99 1SP

Dear Mr Johnston

SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT PUBLIC PETITIONS COMMITTEE – CONSIDERATION PE860

Thank you for your letter of 30 June 2005 in which you request comment on the issues raised in the petition and an indication of how North Ayrshire Council supports the provision of musical tuition.

I enclose a paper setting out our comments and providing the information requested.

Yours sincerely

JOHN TRAVERS
Corporate Director (Educational Services)

Enc
Introduction

North Ayrshire Council is a strong supporter of musical tuition in general and vocal tuition in particular.

Against the background of a well-resourced, high quality music service, singing has always been given due prominence at both school and authority level, and the numbers of children participating have been significantly enhanced by the Youth Music Initiative. All children are able to participate in both curricular and extra-curricular singing activities.

While recognising the work of organisations such as Ayrshire Voices, we take the view that the flexibility to shape our own music provision has resulted in enhanced opportunities for young people in North Ayrshire.

Provision of Musical Tuition in North Ayrshire

North Ayrshire is recognised nationally for its support of music provision. Last year it received the Diploma of Merit of the National Music Council, a UK body supported by DfES. The Council’s policy of not charging for instrumental lessons, the free use of authority instruments and the extensive provision of singing tuition encourages many young people to develop their musical skills. In 2003, over 2300 young people had access to tuition from the North Ayrshire Music Service. The addition of new funding from the Youth Music Initiative allowed more than 1600 additional young people to be included in 2003/04 and 2004/05.

The Instrumental Service is centrally funded and managed by the Music Service Manager. Staff and resources are deployed on a school cluster basis.

Working in partnership with local, national and international agencies enables innovative programmes to be developed which would normally be outwith the capacity of the Service. Since 1996, a number of important and challenging initiatives have been developed with partners. These include:

- Projects with Scottish Opera and the Royal Scottish National Orchestra.
- A string instrument tuition programme in partnership with the Royal Scottish Academy of Music.
- Links with local groups such as the Ayrshire Music Festival, Feis Arrain, Ayrshire Voices and North Ayrshire community choirs.
- Partnership working with East Ayrshire Council to produce high quality musical theatre productions in collaboration with Scottish Opera. North and East Ayrshire Councils were invited by Her Majesty’s Inspectorate to present details of these projects at a recent Best Practice in Music conference.
- European projects developed with international partners in Spain, Finland, Sweden, Norway and Germany.
Opportunities for Pupils & Students

Tuition in a diverse range of singing and instruments is available. Instruments available include:

Violin, Voila, Cello, Double Bass
Flute, Clarinet, Oboe, Bassoon, Saxophone
Trumpet, Comet, Horn, Trombone, Baritone, Euphonium, Tuba
Guitar, Bass Guitar, Piano, Singing
Tuned Percussion, Drum Kit
Traditional Instruments, Scots Fiddle, Clarsach, Bagpipes, Pipe Band Drums.

Instrumental lessons are free, as is the use of an instrument. When sufficient progress has been made, children learning an instrument are expected to join a school and/or North Ayrshire ensemble.

The establishment of bands, choirs and orchestras at North Ayrshire level has increased the opportunities for young people to perform at local, national and indeed international level.

North Ayrshire music groups participate in a wide range of festivals and concerts both here and abroad. Weekend courses and master classes enhance the school programme. Special programmes are held during holiday periods, weekends and after school for Rock Music, Traditional Music, Bands, Choirs and Orchestras.

Local competitions such as North Ayrshire Young Musician of the Year, North Ayrshire Young Singer of the Year, North Ayrshire Young Chorister of the Year and North Ayrshire Young Traditional Musician of the Year are now well established as focal points for excellence.

Instrumental Music Service

Instrumental Music staff play a key role in encouraging and developing music in North Ayrshire and are recognised nationally for their excellent tuition. In three of the last four years, staff from North Ayrshire have won the Scottish Instrumental Teacher of the Year award.

A recent development has been the employment of a music specialist to work with young people with additional support needs. This teacher works in both special and mainstream establishments, helping students develop their creative skills using a range of techniques suited to the needs of the pupils.

Vocal and Choral Work in North Ayrshire

In North Ayrshire vocal/choral tuition and programmes are delivered by North Ayrshire Music Service staff or by class teachers.

All primary schools in North Ayrshire implement a three year rolling programme in music. These programmes reflect the 5 - 14 Guidelines which identify one of the main strands as 'using the voice'.

The Youth Music Initiative has resulted in the delivery of additional vocal programmes in 20 schools at Primary 5 and other vocal initiatives at different stages are being piloted.

A large number of schools have choirs which regularly perform within the school, the local community and also further afield at Music Festivals, etc.
Within Ayrshire there are vocal solo competitions available to all primary and secondary school aged children. These are frequently over-subscribed and entry numbers have to be limited.

North Ayrshire has an ongoing extra-curricular vocal programme.

- Secondary pupils have had, on three occasions, the experience of performing a large choral work with professional soloists and orchestra. This is an ongoing programme which will continue.

- Pupils in North Ayrshire have had considerable experience of musical theatre, most particularly with the collaboration of Scottish Opera.

  _Turn of the Tide_ involved 1,000 upper primary pupils in a specially commissioned opera which was themed on the history and culture of the area. Children from Finland were also involved.

  _The Tale o' Tam_ involved almost 200 upper primary pupils from North and East Ayrshire in a specially commissioned opera about Robert Burns.

  _Auntie Janet Saves The Planet_ involved 4,000 pre-five children in a specially commissioned music theatre piece which had an environmental theme.

  _The Mysterious Maiden of Loch Katrine_ involved 80 senior pupils from North Ayrshire, Sweden and Spain in a specially commissioned opera. This is part of a successful ongoing collaboration with these countries.

- A programme of masterclasses is arranged for senior pupils.

- An innovative initiative to encourage boys with unchurred voices to participate in singing will begin shortly. An intensive rehearsal weekend, followed by weekly rehearsals, and culminating in a performance has, thus far, encouraged 100 boys to sign up.

**North Ayrshire Schools Concert Band, Choirs & Orchestra**

There are a number of opportunities for pupils to participate in music at an authority level.

**Junior Choir**

The Junior Choir was established in 1999. A total of 104 pupils are now involved.

**Intermediate Choir**

The Intermediate Choir was established for all pupils from S1 to S3 in the ten secondary schools across North Ayrshire in 2000. In 2004 a total of 71 pupils were involved in the Choir. Auditions are due to take place in October for the 2005 choir.

**Senior Choir**

The Senior Choir was established in 1999 for S4 to S6 pupils. This choir has gone from strength to strength and now has 129 pupils involved.

**Boys Choir**

Auditions are scheduled for this academic year with the first performance early in 2006.
Senior Concert Band

The Band was established in 1999 and currently has 58 pupils involved.

Training Band

The Training Band was established in 2000 and currently has 66 pupils involved.

String Orchestras

The String Orchestra was established in 2003 and currently has 103 participants. A junior string orchestra has also been established.

Symphony Orchestra

The Symphony Orchestras was established in 2004 and currently has 70 participants. Pupils from the Senior String Orchestra and Concert Band work together to form our first symphony orchestra.

North Ayrshire Schools Traditional Music Programme

In response to a perceived gap in traditional music provision, a rolling programme of teaching chanter, fiddle, clarsach and pipe band drumming has been arranged. A total of 105 pupils are currently studying traditional music in North Ayrshire and this will be expanded with the support of the Youth Music Initiative.

Pipe Band

The North Ayrshire Schools Pipe Band was established in 2002 and has 15 members playing bagpipes and drums.

Scottish Fiddle Group

The North Ayrshire Schools Scottish Fiddle Group was established in 2004 and has 45 participants.

Festival of Juvenile Solo Piping

This annual festival is the only one of its kind and attracts competitors from across Scotland.

Traditional Music Showcase

This event highlights the diversity and excellence of our traditional music programme.

Conclusion

The petition set out in PE860 is to be commended in seeking adequate vocal tuition for young people. We believe, however, that the provision which is already in place in North Ayrshire ensures that music tuition, including vocal tuition of a high and consistent quality, is available to all young people in our schools.
If phoning or calling ask for: Patrick Whelan

Dr James Johnston
Clerk to the Public Petitions Committee
Parliamentary Headquarters
EDINBURGH
EH99 1SP

Dear Dr Johnston

SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT PUBLIC PETITIONS COMMITTEE
CONSIDERATION OF PETITION PE860

I refer to your correspondence of 30 June 2005 to Tom Cairns, Chief Executive regarding Petition PE860 submitted by Marilyn De Blieck on behalf of Ayrshire Voices, which has been passed for my attention.

The Petition called on the Executive to develop a coherent national policy in relation to the teaching of singing, and in particular to ensure adequate provision of vocal tuition for young people across Scotland. It would be inappropriate for South Ayrshire Council to make comment on how other local authorities address this issue across Scotland. However, the Council is pleased to comment on the issues raised in the Petition, and in particular how this Authority supports the provision of musical tuition for young people in this area. In this regard, I am pleased to make the undernoted comments.

South Ayrshire Council has worked in partnership with The Keynote Trust since 1999, during which period that organisation has received total funding amounting to £333,000. The breakdown of funding is shown in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>South Ayrshire Council Funding to Keynote Trust (all figures in 000)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image" alt="Table" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 2004 as part of a rationalisation of Council budgets, funding to Keynote Trust through the Education budget was identified as one of a number of savings throughout the Education Service and the Council generally.

As evidenced by the investment in voice tuition over a significant period of time, this Council has shown, and continues to show a commitment to vocal music, and has demonstrated the value it places on its partnership with Keynote Trust. Funding for Keynote Trust through a Service Level Agreement will continue until 31 March 2007, at which point it will be reviewed as part of a fundamental review within South Ayrshire Council. However, the Council may also wish to consider a tendering process to
ensure that all appropriate organisations have access to this arrangement and all applications would be subject to standard assessment procedures to determine the extent of any future funding.

In addition to the support of vocal music for children and young people through Keynote Trust, the Council employs 6.7 FTE Primary Music Specialists, all of whom teach vocal music as an integral part of the school curriculum. Recently, through Youth Music funding from the Scottish Arts Council, the Council has taken the opportunity to further strengthen its support of vocal music with the appointment of 1.6 FTE dedicated to class singing.

In support of the overall music tuition of young people, the Council funds the Music Instruction Service. Investment in this service in the current financial year amounts to £524,146. The Music Instruction section provides services to P4-S6 pupils, a total of some 1,150 young people. The staffing compliment is 14.6 FTE, which has recently been increased through Youth Music funding to include an additional 2.2 FTE.

The consequence of additional youth music funding is that every pupil in P6 within South Ayrshire now receives 39 weeks of 45-minute classes with a specialist music teacher.

South Ayrshire Council has a healthy music infrastructure at school level. Each of the nine Secondary schools has at least one large-scale group such as a band, choir or orchestra, examples of which include Mainholm Academy Jazz Band, Belmont Academy Concert Band, String Orchestra, Symphony Orchestra, Woodwind Ensemble; Prestwick Academy has a particularly successful Jazz Band which has achieved recognition at national level.

At a South Ayrshire level there are two schools orchestras, one Junior and one Senior, comprising of some 250 pupils. There is also a South Ayrshire Jazz Band and Guitar Orchestra. The later involves some 25 P7 pupils in the Carrick cluster in rural primaries in the Maybole area.

The Council supports a range of Music Festivals, including the Ayr Music Festival and Kirkmichael Guitar Festival, which have successful youth education dimensions and outcomes for young people. The Council also supports young musicians through its Voluntary Grant Scheme to develop their musical talents through national music bodies, including National Youth Orchestra, National Youth Jazz Orchestra and National Children’s Orchestra.

In summary this Council has shown a commitment to vocal music, and whilst we believe we have the balance of provision broadly correct in terms of meeting local need within the resources available to us, would support the broad tenet of the Petition for a national policy on teaching singing, and guidance on the provision of vocal tuition for young people across Scotland. This would be particularly welcome as part of a Best Value regime, which sought quality services responsive to local need and which sought to provide services which were efficient, and effective yet inclusive and sustainable.

Yours sincerely,

Patrick Whelan
Head Of Lifelong Learning
Petition by Margaret Scott calling for the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Executive to resolve the current critical problems in the provision of wheelchairs and specialist seating services within the NHS by both an immediate increase in funding and through a review, which in consultation with users, will address minimum standards, the scope of equipment provided and the delivery of services.
Public Petitions Committee – a template for public petitions

Should you wish to submit a public petition for consideration by the Public Petitions Committee please complete the template below. Please refer to the Guidance on submission of public petitions for advice on issues of admissibility before completing the template. You may also seek advice from the Clerk to the Committee whose contact details can be found at the end of this form.

Details of principal petitioner:
Please enter the name of person and organisation raising the petition, including a contact address where correspondence should be sent to, email address and phone number if available

Margaret Scott,

Text of petition:
The petition should clearly state what action the petitioner wishes the Parliament to take in no more than 5 lines of text, e.g.

The petitioner requests that the Scottish Parliament considers and debates the implications of the proposed Agenda for Change legislation for Speech and Language Therapy Services and service users within the NHS

The petitioner requests that the Scottish Parliament......
Resolve the current critical problems in the provision of wheelchairs and specialist seating services within the NHS by both an immediate increase in funding and through a review, which in consultation with users, will address minimum standards, the scope of equipment provided and the delivery of services.

Recommend a strategy for the integrated provision of all equipment for people with physical disabilities

Additional information:
Any additional information in relation to your petition, including reasons why the action requested is necessary, should not be included here. However, it may be appended to the petition and will be made available to the Public Petitions Committee prior to its consideration of your petition. Please note that you should limit the amount of any additional information which you may wish to provide in support of your petition to no more than 4 sides of A4.
Action taken to resolve issues of concern before submitting the petition:

Before submitting a petition to the Parliament, petitioners are expected to have made an attempt to resolve their issues of concern by, for example, making representations to the Scottish Executive or seeking the assistance of locally elected representatives, such as councillors, MSPs and MPs. Please enter details of those approached below and append copies of relevant correspondence, which will be made available to the Public Petitions Committee prior to its consideration of your petition.

1. Initiated independent Scottish survey on children’s wheelchair provision—(1998)
2. Carried out consultation with young wheelchair users (Playback) 1998
3. Results of both of these presented to Health Minister 1998
4. Presentation carried out to 25 MSP’s by young wheelchair users highlighting issues (2001)
5. Collection of stories of individual circumstances presented to Scottish Executive May 2003
6. Many contacts by parents throughout Scotland with Individual MSPs

Request to speak:

All petitioners are given the opportunity to present their petition before the Public Petitions Committee. The Convener will then make a decision based on a number of factors including the content of the petition and the written information provided by the petitioner as to whether a brief statement from the petitioner would be useful in facilitating the Committee’s consideration of a petition.

Please indicate below whether you wish to request to make a brief statement before the Committee when it comes to consider your petition.

Yes

*Delete as appropriate

Signature of principal petitioner:

When satisfied that your petition meets all the criteria outlined in the Guidance on submission of public petitions, the principal petitioner should sign and date the form in the box below. Other signatures gathered should be appended to this form.

Signature

Date 7/12/04

Please note that any additional information, copies of relevant correspondence and additional signatures should be appended to this form and submitted to:

The Clerk to the Public Petitions Committee,
The Scottish Parliament,
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP
Tel: 0131 348 5186 Fax: 0131 348 5088
e-mail: petitions@scottish.parliament.uk
Disability Rights Commission
1st Floor, Riverside House, 502 Gorgie Road, Edinburgh EH11 3AF

Richard Hough
Assistant Clerk
Public Petitions Committee
Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

26 September 2005

Dear Mr Hough

PE798

Many thanks for you letter of 16 August 2005. The DRC welcomes the opportunity to respond to the committee as part of its consideration of PE798.

The DRC notes the response of 19 April 2005 to the Committee from the Deputy Minister for Health and Community Care, and welcomes the commitment of an additional £1.9 million in the current financial year to reduce waiting times for specialist seating and wheelchairs to acceptable levels. The DRC also welcomes the independent review of the NHS wheelchair service. DRC staff attended the recent Reinventing the Wheelchair conference in Edinburgh on 12 September, which looked at the current limitations in wheelchair provision in Scotland, identified the principles which should inform future policy and looked to the experience of Norway. The DRC looks forward to the outcome of the review.

As background for the Committee, it may be useful to briefly touch on a major initiative currently being undertaken by the Scottish Executive Health Department (SEHD) and the DRC. This initiative, known as Fair for All - Disability will focus on improving access to health services for disabled people under Part 3 of the DDA 1995. The project will work with SEHD, and all NHS Boards, including NHS QIS, to increase their understanding of the Disability Equality Duty and through a partnership approach. The
project will assist Boards to develop effective disability related best practice at both strategic and practitioner level.

The initiative is part of Fair for All (FFA) the Wider Challenge initiative being implemented by SEHD. It will focus on mainstreaming disability issues by developing work programmes utilising the FFA framework set out below:

- **Energising the organisation** – leadership development and disability equality action planning
- **Demographic profiling** – understanding disabled peoples needs
- **Access to Services** – patient focussed services, change in attitudes and behaviour, acceptability, flexibility and appropriateness of services and information provision; supporting cultural change
- **Workforce issues** – recruiting, training and learning plans, staff skills and knowledge development – by linking to the work of the Disability Task Force (SEHD)
- **Community Development approaches** – involving and engaging disabled people in a meaningful way

The FFA Disability initiative specifically aims to enable NHS Scotland to address issues in relation to the provision of Goods, Services and Facilities (DDA 1995 Part 3) in order to develop best practice that reaches beyond a DDA compliance model. Our objective is to improve the rights, independence, choice and inclusion of disabled people through ongoing development of the equality and diversity approach to disabled people in NHS Scotland.

The DRC is pleased with progress in the work being undertaken by the DRC Scotland Built Environment Reference Group (BERG), and is now evaluating the impact of the seminars held with the six Scottish Schools of architecture in 2003 and 2004. Following this, we will look to make further recommendations on developing awareness of inclusive design for architecture students and students and practitioners of other disciplines relating to the built environment. The Committee may be encouraged to learn that in some instances, work undertaken thus far has led to changes in the curriculum at architecture schools.
I hope this response is of use to the Committee. If you require any further information, please do not hesitate to get in touch.

Yours sincerely

Adam Gaines
Director, DRC Scotland
RE Petition no PE 798

Eileen Martin,
Public Petitions Committee Assistant
Dear Eileen,

Thank you very much for sending the responses from the Ministers regarding our Petition. We are very heartened with progress so far -- in particular the interim funding as promised, as well as the steps which have been taken to carry out an independent National Review of Wheelchair Services.

Consultation with service users across Scotland
From what we have seen ourselves, the quality of the Consultations which have been carried out across Scotland as well as the National Conference held in Edinburgh a fortnight ago has been excellent.

Of special interest at the Conference was the speaker from Norway who described the all encompassing nature of provision in his country, not only of wheelchairs and special seating systems but of all forms of assistive technology which are provided from a one-stop centre.
As you will see from our original Petition, we believe that this must also one of the aims of the Scottish Executive.

The interim report on the findings from the National review are to be published in October and are to be widely circulated. We await the report with great interest.

There are two further points to make:

While we fully recognise the importance of being able to access buildings, we are concerned that, subsequent to discussions within the Committee, this issue is being referred to in connection with our Petition.
We feel it is important to carefully focus again on the content of our Petition which relates purely to provision of equipment

We are delighted that our Petition remains open, and are hoping that it will remain so until such time as recommendations become enshrined in policy, (with special mention of minimum standards of Care) and that the Scottish Executive makes sufficient funding available to implement the recommendations from the National Review.

Finally, it is well recognised that the problems which we identified in the additional information to our Petition, are widespread throughout the UK.

There is no doubt that Scotland can be proud that it will be leading the way once these issues are addressed, especially since two big disability organisations are about to a mount a major campaign on wheelchair provision particularly for children, across the UK

Yours sincerely,
Margaret Scott
Public Petitions Committee – a template for e-petitions

Should you wish to submit an e-petition allowing signatures to be gathered online on the Public Petitions Committee e-petitioner web pages please complete the template below. Before submitting your e-petition please consult the Guidance on submission of public petitions for advice on what is and is not admissible. You may also seek advice from the Clerk to the Committee whose contact details can be found at the end of this form.

Details of principal petitioner:
Please enter the name of person and organisation raising the petition, including a contact address where correspondence should be sent to.

Sheena Borthwick,

Text of petition:
The petition should clearly state what action the petitioner wishes the Parliament to take in no more than 5 lines of text, e.g.

The petitioner requests that the Scottish Parliament considers and debates the implications of the proposed Agenda for Change legislation for Speech and Language Therapy Services and service users within the NHS

The petitioner requests that the Scottish Parliament urges the Scottish Executive to upgrade the Southern Section of the A77 between Ayr and Stranraer including providing passing places every six miles and developing a bypass at Maybole.

Period for gathering signatures:
Please enter the closing date for gathering signatures on your petition, which we would usually recommend is a period of between 4-6 weeks

Closing date: Friday 27 May 2005

a template for e-petitions, July 2004
Additional information:

Please enter any other information relating to the issues raised in your e-petition, including the reasons why the action requested is necessary. The text entered in this field should not exceed 2 pages. However, you may wish to provide further sources/links to background information.

Within the proposed passing places, it is planned to place appropriate West FM/West Sound/South West Sound FM radio frequencies poster sites. The passing places, Maybole Bypass and signage have been specifically designed to save lives and alleviate driver frustration. The ability to tune in for "real time" dedicated A77 traffic & travel information is only offered by West FM, West Sound & South West Sound FM being the commercial radio licence holders for Ayrshire, Dumfries & Galloway. For full details of this petition follow the link to www.a77campaign.co.uk.
### Action taken to resolve issues of concern before submitting an e-petition:

Before submitting a petition to the Parliament, petitioners are expected to have made an attempt to resolve their issues of concern, by for example, making representations to the Scottish Executive or seeking the assistance of locally elected representatives, such as councillors, MSPs and MSPs. Details of those approached should be entered.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nicol Stephen</td>
<td>Minister for Transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cathy Jamieson</td>
<td>Minister for Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Scott MSP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members of the A77 Working Group</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various local councillors from South and East Ayrshire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dear Dr Johnston

SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT PUBLIC PETITIONS COMMITTEE – CONSIDERATION PE859

Thank you for your letter of 24 June, inviting comments on the issues raised in petition PE859.

I think it would be helpful in the first instance to clarify a particular term expressed in the petition, specifically the reference throughout to 'passing places'. This is taken to mean properly designed overtaking opportunities, which are typically one to two kilometres in length.

The Scottish Executive has committed considerable resources to the A77 both in the interests of safety and as a reflection of the economic importance of the route. On 21 February 2003 the First Minister announced a package of road improvement schemes for the A77 between Ayr and Stranraer. These are as follows:-

i. A77 Ardwell to Slockenray (dedicated northbound overtaking lane)
ii. A77 Park End to Bennane (dedicated northbound ard southbound overtaking lanes)
iii. A77 Glen App (opportunistic overtaking northbound and southbound)
iv. A77 Haggstone Climbing Lane (dedicated northbound overtaking)
v. A77 Drummuckloch to Innermessan (dedicated southbound overtaking lane)
vi. A77 Burnside Improvement (opportunistic overtaking northbound and southbound).

In addition the Executive is also currently committed to a significant (£4.9M) improvement at Whittlelets Roundabout at Ayr. To the north of Ayr the route has also been subject to significant investment in recent years.

The decision on the Executive investment in schemes (i) to (vi) above was linked into the move by Stena from the ferry terminal at Stranraer to share the ferry terminal at Caimryan with P&O. The ferry operators propose to invest some £30m in developing the shared Caimryan terminal and the related road improvements were developed in co-operation with these operators.
The current programme, which sees a construction start on the majority of these schemes in 2006, is attached at Annex A. In addition a Climbing Lane at Turnberry (£2.4m) was completed in 2004 and presents a further overtaking opportunity on the route. The frequency and location of these schemes provides, on average, a separation distance of approximately 7 miles between overtaking opportunities. The benefits of these schemes are expected to reduce 'platooning' and hence reduce driver frustration and enhance safety. These schemes originally formed part of a public presentation on 24 June 2004 and will be the subject of a detailed programme of consultation commencing in October 2005. This programme of works would, therefore, appear to broadly meet the requirement of Ms Borthwick's petition in respect of the call for improved overtaking opportunities on the route.

You also asked for an update on the study examining transportation issues in and around Maybole. The Executive is well aware of the very strong support for a Maybole bypass and, last year, appointed W S Atkins Consultants to undertake a Part I STAG (Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance) assessment of these issues and to consider a range of possible solutions, including options to bypass Maybole. A part one STAG report will be produced by Atkins in the autumn. If a bypass is the recommended intervention in the STAG assessment then Atkins' commission permits further work to be undertaken to consider whether the alignment previously proposed by the former Strathclyde Regional Council (SRC) in the 1980s is still appropriate.

To date, Atkins' work has mainly focussed on data collection, traffic modelling and public consultation. In fact there has been extensive public consultation on the study and a copy of the Consultation Strategy and the Report of Public Consultation are attached.

In parallel with the engineering programme referred to above the Executive has been instrumental in the creation of the A77 Safety Group which has the aim of bringing together road safety stakeholders in the area with a view to raising safety awareness throughout the area by integrating and publicising the work of the various safety strategies. This group has been in existence since early 2004 with a formal launch in June of that year. The aims, message and strategies of the group were the subject of public consultation with communities in the area with community presentations in Ayr, Girvan and Stranraer. The engineering improvements planned for the route have been well publicised both within the group and to the wider community.

Stakeholders in the Group include the Scottish Executive, Strathclyde Police, South Ayrshire Council, Strathclyde Safety Camera Partnership, Amey Infrastructure Services and West Sound Radio. Ms Sheena Borthwick, the Managing Director of West Sound and the petitioner, represents West Sound on the Group. Dumfries and Galloway Constabulary, Dumfries and Galloway Council and Mr Alan Gordon of Stena have also, on occasion, been invited to attend Group meetings but have not taken up the invitation. At its most recent meeting on the 26 July the Group considered the issue of wider representation and as a consequence it has been agreed that wider local and business involvement should be encouraged, including Stena and the Freight Transport Association. Public involvement is also encouraged and the A77 Safety Group has its own website (www.a77safetygroup.com).

Recent major strategies facilitated by the Group include the implementation on 14 July of the first SPECS time/distance safety camera system in Scotland. This system covers a 46 kilometre length of the A77 from Bogend Toll, north of Ayr, to Girvan. This system is specifically intended to deal with the dispersed nature of speed related accidents on this route.

As far as Trans European issues are concerned, the importance of the A77 as a trunk road serving the ferry services into Loch Ryan is recognised. That commitment is clearly demonstrated by recently completed schemes and the additional schemes that are in the Executive’s current investment
programme. Nevertheless, it has not been possible to access the TENs (Trans European Network) programme to support these schemes for a number of reasons, amongst them the relatively limited nature of the funding and its focus on large scale infrastructure schemes.

West Sound has raised on a number of occasions the possibility of erecting exclusive billboards on the A77. These billboards are intended to reflect West Sound’s highly rated ‘Guardian Angel’ road safety campaign. Whilst the West Sound campaign is very laudable and its quality is recognised, the Executive does not consider that the erection of billboards of this nature on the trunk road is either appropriate or necessary. I attach for your information a copy of a recent letter from the former Minister for Transport to West Sound indicating the Executive’s formal position on the billboards.

West Sound has, however, now been invited to apply for the standard roadside radio information signs. These signs would inform travellers of the station’s radio frequency and would, therefore, appear to meet Ms Borthwick’s general requirements. We await West Sound’s application.

Yours sincerely

JACKIE MCCAGG
Private Secretary
ANNEX A

Scheme Timetable

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scheme</th>
<th>Cost (£m)</th>
<th>Draft Orders Due</th>
<th>Start Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Whitletts Roundabout Improvement</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Summer 05</td>
<td>Spring 06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ardwell - Slockenray</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Autumn 05</td>
<td>Winter 06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Park End - Bennane</td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>Autumn 05</td>
<td>Winter 06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glen App</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Winter 05/06</td>
<td>Spring 07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haggstone</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Autumn 05</td>
<td>Winter 06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drummuckloch - Innermssan</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Winter 05/06</td>
<td>Autumn 08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burnside Improvement</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>Spring 06</td>
<td>Autumn 06</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dear Sheena,

Thank you for your enquiry, regarding the possibility of erecting ‘Guardian Angel’ billboards at two roundabouts on the A77 trunk road outside Ayr.

I would like to congratulate West Sound on its Sony Radio Award for the Guardian Angel Campaign. This is clearly recognition of the quality of the campaign and the imaginative use of the road safety message. I have no doubt that this message has contributed to road safety awareness in your radio area.

Whilst the positive promotion of the road safety message in such a way has some merit, I have some concerns over the use of the proposed billboards on the trunk road network. We generally resist the placing of promotional billboards alongside the trunk road network throughout Scotland for reasons of road safety, that is to avoid distraction for drivers driving in a high speed or busy environment, and to avoid undue sign clutter.

I have concerns over safety issues arising from the need to erect, maintain and service structures of this nature in the middle of, or adjacent to, busy high speed routes: it would be difficult to access such sites without unduly interfering with the free flow of traffic.

While I understand the case for erecting billboards with a specific safety message, to allow such posters will create a precedent for others who may wish to associate their business within the context of a road safety message. As an example, the arguments which you promote on the A77 could be applied equally well across much of the area of Scotland served by your parent company’s traffic information resource as proposed in association with the Executive’s NADICS.
In view of the above I am unable to authorise the use of your proposed signs on the A77 trunk road. However, as agreed at our recent meeting, I am prepared to allow signs which meet the specific requirements set out in national guidelines. If West Sound wishes to proceed along these lines, any application will be processed as soon as possible.

I am grateful for your continued involvement in road safety issues on the A77 and for your continued commitment to the Safety Group. It appears that the initiatives put in place by the Safety Group, including your own campaign, are already reducing the number of accidents on the route.

Kind Regards,

NICOL STEPHEN
Dear Mr Hough,

Scottish Parliament’s Public Petitions Committee – Consideration of PE859

Thank you for the opportunity to contribute to discussions on the above petition.

The RAC Foundation for Motoring is an independent organisation, formed in 1991, to campaign on a variety of matters of general interest to responsible motorists. The RAC Foundation is separate from and independent of RAC plc. Our policies and views may differ from theirs.

In general the RAC Foundation supports the case for the upgrading of the A77 between Ayr and Stranraer.

This route is unusual in that it fulfils two very distinct purposes:

It is a busy and important “local” road serving the communities situated along its length, accommodating agricultural traffic from the area and providing a lifeline for residents to work, leisure, health and educational opportunities. It is also likely to be a key factor in attracting more investment to create further employment locally.

The A77 is a vital part of Scotland’s, and indeed the UK’s, roads infrastructure too – of strategic consequence to business, industry and tourism. The significance of this link between the busy ferry ports of Stranraer and Caimryan and the central belt of Scotland is indisputable and will increase as the investment in the ports develops together with the consequent growth in traffic using them.

Recent improvements to the northern section of the road between Ayr and Glasgow have improved journey times and road safety, while reducing the likelihood of delay and congestion. The section south of Ayr, however, is now exposed as a “missing link”.

Roads account for 92 per cent of all passenger travel in the UK and the cost of congestion to business and industry on our roads nationally is now reckoned to be around £20 billion p.a. according to the most recent research. There is no doubt that largely unimproved roads like the southern stretch of the A77 contribute to those figures.
The geography of this road is unusual - hugging the coastline and following at times, fairly circuitous lines and steep inclines. This, when combined with a mixture of slow and faster moving vehicles, and the “bunching” effect which results from ferry derived traffic being discharged at the same time, frequently leads to bottlenecks, delays and frustrations which can have serious cost and safety implications.

Given that it is a UK Government and Scottish Executive objective to reduce deaths and injuries on our roads by 40 per cent by 2010, the RAC Foundation would suggest that improvement to the A77 between Ayr and Stranraer, should be a priority.

While the RAC Foundation considers that calls for a motorway route in place of the existing road are unjustified on traffic flow, safety or environmental grounds, we would certainly back its upgrading to a separated dual carriageway. As no funding has currently been identified to implement such improvements, however, we would urge sympathetic consideration of the proposals outlined in this petition.

While we are only too aware that every community in Scotland regards their particular route as a priority, relatively low cost solutions like those suggested by the petitioners could provide casualty reductions on the southern stretch of the A77.

It would certainly be useful to see more detailed research undertaken into causes of accidents on this road but it is recognised from reports of collisions that driver frustration as a result of the conditions described certainly contribute to them and lead to travelling too close (tailgating), inappropriate overtaking and the misjudgement of distances along with loss of control.

Providing increased opportunities for safe overtaking could alleviate some of those behaviours. The RAC Foundation has no detailed knowledge of the most beneficial intervals between these suggested passing places but would urge that any construction be undertaken in a phased fashion so as not to exacerbate existing problems.

One of the biggest sources of delay, bottleneck and frustration along the route, however, is the town of Maybole. Heavy and concentrated volumes of traffic passing through streets unsuited to it bring unacceptable consequences for local residents in the forms of noise, congestion, safety threats, pollution and visual disturbance as well as difficulties for local traders when customers find it difficult to park or access their premises. The route through the town also causes delay and problems for traffic travelling through.

The RAC Foundation was consulted on the issue of a possible by-pass and our response was supportive of its construction. We would certainly like to see an urgent resolution to this situation.

If there is any aspect of this response which is unclear or about which you would like further information please call (0141 226 3305 or e-mail: sjnicholson@rac.co.uk).

—Sue Nicholson
Eileen,

For lodging please

Jim

-----Original Message-----
From: Greig, Neil [mailto:Neil.Greig@TheAA.com]
Sent: Friday, September 23, 2005 3:10 PM
To: Johnston JD (James)
Subject: Petition PE859

Apologies for the delay in replying.

The AA Motoring Trust fully supports and endorses the approach to safety on the A77 outlined in PE 859 by Sheena Borthwick and the A77 Safety Campaign. Currently 6% of the deaths on Scotland’s roads take place on non-urban roads. Speeding, poor driver behaviour and badly designed roads all combine to make long distance single carriageways such as the A77 south of Ayr far more dangerous than they need to be. Education and enforcement can only do so much - only by engineering out as many accidents as possible will the number of deaths be markedly reduced.

High speed head on accidents due to driver frustration at the low number of overtaking opportunities nearly always produce fatalities. The Scottish Executive already know how to cure this - more crawler lanes, more 2+1 sections and extended lengths of dual carriageway will lead to fewer head on accidents.

Brutal side impacts at junctions and private access points on to the A77 are also a major source of death and serious injury. A route based approach to reduce the number of access points, widen junctions and provide safe right turning areas is required.

Finally the people of Maybole have suffered for far too many years from heavy traffic, congestion, noise and pollution as long distance trunk traffic tries to pass through their town. Vehicles stopped to service shops in the town centre frequently cause long delays. A Maybole bypass offers the ideal opportunity to remove traffic from a sensitive area and provide a new and much safer stretch on the A77.

Thank you for allowing the AA Trust the opportunity to respond to this petition.
Message

Hough R (Richard)

From: Johnston JD (James)
Sent: 23 August 2005 16:25
To: Hough R (Richard)
Subject: FW: Petition PE859

For lodging please

Jim

-----Original Message-----
From: Elizabeth Lumsden [mailto:ELumsden@ROSPA.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 23, 2005 2:01 PM
To: Johnston JD (James)
Subject: Petition PE859

: Johnston

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the issues raised in the above petition. I would like to submit the following:

"ROSPA fully supports the provision of passing places on the Southern Section of the A77. If sufficient opportunities are available to enable slower vehicles to pull in and allow others to overtake, then this will go along way to reduce driver frustration - a factor which can lead to accidents. ROSPA also advocates that any engineering measures are backed up with appropriate ways of educating road users about the purpose of the laybys and of the dangers of suffering from frustration whilst driving on the roads."

I have no objection to this statement being made public.

Yours sincerely

Road Safety Manager
ROSPA Scotland

elumsden@rospa.com

ROSPA's aim is to improve lives by preventing accidental injury at work, on the road, in our homes and in leisure.

Visit us at:

www.rospa.com
www.rospa.com/drivertraining
www.youngdriver.org
www.youngworker.co.uk
www.childcarseats.org.uk

23/08/2005
This email is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual to whom it is addressed. Any views or opinions presented are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of RoSPA. If you are not the intended recipient, be advised that you have received this email in error and that any use, dissemination, forwarding, printing, or copying of this email is strictly prohibited. If you have received this email in error please contact the sender.
Scottish Parliament Public Petitions Committee—Consideration PE859

I refer to your email/letter of the 30 June regarding the above petition and to which I am responding in my role as the chair of the A77 Safety Group.

The A77 Safety Group was set up in early 2004 as a response to ongoing safety concerns on this route, particularly the section south of Ayr. It was felt that the creation of such a group would assist in providing an integrated road safety approach to problems in this area. The stakeholders in the group consist principally, but not exclusively, of the Scottish Executive (led by myself as Branch Head of Accident Investigation and Prevention, Trunk Road Network Management Division), Strathclyde Police, South Ayrshire Council, Westsound radio and the Strathclyde Safety Camera Partnership. Although invited to participate Dumfries and Galloway Police have not so far been present. The MD of Westsound, Mrs Borthwick, the petitioner, is the representative from Westsound. Mr Gordon of Stena has also on occasion been invited to attend and I, personally, extended this invitation.

At its meeting on the 26 July the Safety Group considered the issue of wider representation and as a consequence it has been agreed that wider political, local and business involvement should be encouraged, amongst them Stena, Freight Transport Association etc. Public involvement is encouraged by, amongst other means, an A77 Safety Group website (www.a77safetygroup.com). The website also includes details of the proposed engineering improvements and news of the ongoing programme.

The group was publicly launched in Ayr Town Hall on the 23 June 2004 with an extensive presentation setting out the work of the stakeholder partners and forthcoming improvements to the route. The presentation and the aims were also the subject of public participation exercises in Girvan and Stranraer.

Since then the Group has met generally on a three monthly cycle. In between this cycle sub groups meet on an ad hoc basis to discuss and agree specific aspects of the group’s business with a view to reporting back to the main body.

The aim of the group is to reduce casualties on the route by means of engineering, education and enforcement strategies while at the same time delivering a programme of involvement in road safety events in the area. amongst other benefits this is intended to raise the profile of the road safety investment and strategies in the area and consequently improve road safety awareness throughout the
community. There is no conclusion to its work as such involvement is ongoing and requires continual commitment and a progressive programme.

The main financial commitment to the improvements of the route is, of course, the Executive’s £20M+ commitment to the engineering schemes. You will have received details of these schemes via the Head of ETLLD. By means of Press Releases and the website the group has extensively promoted the safety benefits which will result from these improvements.

The partners have also delivered increased enforcement along the route and specific education programmes aimed at the younger driver. We continue to develop programmes for the dissemination of road safety information. These are generally aligned with specific events in the area, for example, motorcyclists en route to the Northwest 200, young person reading week etc. We are currently in the process of developing specific A77 safety information material utilising the A77 ‘Brand’ and ‘strap line’ which I have attached at Annex A.

In conjunction with Westsound the group is also now in the process of developing a radio message to be regularly broadcast on this station. This would follow on from Westsoumds ‘Guardian Angel’ campaign which has certainly assisted in giving the road safety message on this route a high profile. Westsound radio has played a very positive role in the delivery of the road safety message and their efforts are to be lauded. The petitioner, Mrs Borthwick, seeks, on the back of this message, to erect related hoarding messages on this trunk route. While I recognise the potential benefits of such a medium there are clearly concerns on behalf of the trunk road authority which I support and have made clearly known to the petitioner.

Recent major strategies facilitated by the Safety Group include the implementation on the 14 July of the first SPECS time/distance safety camera system in Scotland. This system measures the time taken for a vehicle to transit a particular length of road and by measuring the time against the distance then determines the average speed. Penalties are, of course, forthcoming should the speed limit be exceeded. It covers a 46 kilometre length of the A77 from Bogend Toll, north of Ayr to Girvan. This system is specifically intended to deal with the dispersed nature of accidents on this route. The scheme has been installed initially on a 12 month experimental basis but experience with similar systems in England would suggest that significant road safety benefits will accrue. Early observation would, indeed, suggest that significant reductions in vehicle speeds are already taking place.

The stakeholders within the group have at all times been kept informed of all work being undertaken on the route and in the area. It is clearly in the group’s interest to ensure that their own road safety strategies can at all times be integrated with the work of other members of the group.

The next meeting of the full group is on the 25 October in Ayr Police Station when you and/or a representative of the Petitions Committee is welcome to attend.

I will be happy to discuss any aspect of the Groups work as required.

Yours sincerely,

Hugh McCafferty
SE-ETLLD
TRNMD-7
Victoria Quay
(Area 1-D)
To the Scottish Parliament:

PETITION CALLING FOR THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT TO SUPPORT THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE GOLDEN EAGLE (Aquila chrysaetos) AS THE NATIONAL BIRD OF SCOTLAND FOLLOWING A CAMPAIGN AND READER VOTE IN THE SCOTSMAN NEWSPAPER.

For all its stunning native and migratory birds, rich ornithological history, spectacular wildlife reserves and world leading efforts to preserve and reintroduce species, Scotland has never had a national bird.

Given the great affection in which birds are held in Scotland, their rich social and cultural associations and many historical links, it is strange that we do not have a national bird as one of our country's emblems to accompany the Lion Rampant, the Scottish Thistle and the Saltire.

This year is the 100th anniversary of the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds (RSPB) working in Scotland to protect and conserve the country's rich diversity of birds and other wildlife, and the precious habitats which serve to support them.

For three weeks in August The Scotsman ran a national campaign to get the public to vote from a list of 12 native Scottish birds, drawn up by experts at the RSPB. Each bird was "championed" by a television, film or radio personality, wildlife presenters, sports stars and some of your MSP colleagues.

The champions included: Annable Goldie MSP, Robin Harper MSP, Wendy Alexander MSP, Sophie Stafford (Editor of BBC Wildlife magazine), Fred MacAulay, Chris Paterson (captain of Scottish Rugby Union Team), Billy Boyd, Rab McNeil, Kirsty Wark, Stuart Housden, Simon King and Vanessa Collingridge.

Readers were able to vote via a dedicated telephone line number, mobile phone texts, email or letter for their choice from
Michael McMahon MSP
Convenor of the Public Petitions Committee
Parliamentary Headquarters
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Your ref:
Our ref:
16 September 2005

Dear Michael

Scottish Parliament Public Petitions Committee – Consideration PE783

I am sorry for the long delay in responding to the Public Petitions Committee’s request for comment on petition PE783 by James Reynolds, on behalf of The Scotsman newspaper, concerning the establishment of the Golden Eagle as the national bird of Scotland.

There being no established procedure for the designation of a national bird, officials have undertaken research to provide some background on how it has been approached in other countries, the results of which you will find in the attached paper. The paper aims to ascertain what precedent there is for the adoption of a bird as a national emblem and to give examples of what processes might be involved.

The Executive does not have an established policy on a national bird for Scotland, and I note that in many cases the choice in other countries has been made by the legislative arm of government. I will not therefore venture an opinion on the proposal on behalf of the Executive. I trust however that the Committee will find the information we have been able to gather of interest and use.

TOM McCABE
RESPONSE TO SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT PUBLIC PETITION COMMITTEE
NATIONAL BIRD FOR SCOTLAND – CONSIDERATION PE783

Background:

Following a campaign and reader vote, James Reynolds, on behalf of The Scotsman, submitted a petition in October 2004 calling for the Scottish Parliament to support the establishment of the Golden Eagle (aquila chrysaetos) as the national bird for Scotland. Given that 2004 was the 100th anniversary of the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds (RSPB) in Scotland, The Scotsman believed that there was a good case for Scotland to adopt its first national bird. Their proposal was that the national bird could be a valued accompaniment to other emblems of Scotland, such as the Lion Rampant, the Scottish Thistle, and the Saltire.

Listed in support of the petition is Stuart Housden, Director of the RSPB Scotland.

The Scotsman Readers’ Campaign

The Scotsman’s shortlist of twelve birds received 1,666 votes in total, and the Golden Eagle was the winner with 406 votes. The other short-listed options were: the Red Grouse, the Capercaillie, the Osprey, the Puffin, the Gannet, the Sea Eagle, the Peregrine Falcon, the Crested Tit, the Peewit, the Scottish Crossbill, and the Ptarmigan.

Golden Eagles:

Protected in the UK by the Wildlife and Countryside Act (1981), the Golden Eagle is listed as a UK Species of Conservation Importance. The species also features under Annex 1 of the EC Birds Directive and is classified as a Species of European Conservation Concern (SPEC 3-rare).

There are estimated to be approximately 400 pairs of this eagle in the UK at present. Most of these pairs are found in the Scottish Highlands, with a substantial density located in the Hebrides; more recently a few birds have returned to the Lake District, Cumbria. In Scotland, it appears that the population of the birds is stable, with numbers remaining essentially unchanged since 1992.

The Golden Eagle’s global range spreads through the Palaearctic region, includes mountainous parts of Europe, and extends as far as northern Africa and south-east Asia. The species also occurs in North America. At present, the Golden Eagle is not used as a symbol to represent any national group.

UK Precedent for the Adoption of a National Bird:

Despite some assertions to the contrary, it seems that the United Kingdom does not have an official national bird. The European Robin (erithacus rubecula) is frequently listed as Britain’s most popular bird, and is a favourite for use on items such as postage stamps, however it has never been submitted to an official process of recognition and has at no point received UK parliamentary support.
Having said this, the European Robin has previously been promoted as the "national bird" by the British branch of the International Council for Bird Preservation (ICBP). In October 1960, responding to a resolution from the ICBP, its chairman wrote a letter to The Times asking for the views of readers on the subject of choosing a bird for Britain. After reviewing readership response, the Robin was deemed to be overwhelmingly the most popular UK bird with all sections of the community. In accordance with the perceived public will, the British branch of the ICBP sought for the Robin to be adopted as the "Bird for Britain", and the organisation itself began to use the Robin as its official logo. Despite initial public interest, the European Robin was never submitted for recognition as the UK’s official national bird, and no branches of government became involved in its promotion as a national symbol. After continuing to represent the British branch of the ICBP for some years, it seems that the Robin was ultimately dropped from use.

**International Precedent for the Adoption of a National Bird:**

Internationally, there are many precedents for the adoption of national birds; depending on the source used, it appears that there are between 80 and 90 countries which can be said to have some type of national bird. Among the best known national birds are the Bald Eagle of the USA and the Kiwi of New Zealand.

In addition to birds being used to represent sovereign countries, it is also not unknown for them to be used as emblems of sub-state/ regional entities. For example, Australian states and Canadian provinces are represented by local birds, while each of the 50 states of the USA has also identified itself with a particular species.

**Process of Adoption:**

There is no international organisation that registers national birds and, in terms of the process that needs to be undertaken to adopt a national bird, there does not seem to be one definite procedure that can be simply replicated. As such, below is presented an overview of how some other countries and regions have approached the issue.

**United States**

As already mentioned, the United States has one of the most recognised national birds – the Bald Eagle (haliaeetus leucocephalus) – which is closely associated internationally with the image of the USA. For Americans, the Bald Eagle forms part of the nation’s founding myth, and owes its connection to the American state to its connection to one of the first battles of the Revolution. Accounts of the battle recount that the eagles, having been woken by the sounds of fighting, soared over the battlefield, where their rauous cries were taken to be “shrieks in support of the patriots”. Consequently, the Bald Eagle became a national emblem of the USA in 1782, when its image was officially incorporated into the great seal of the United States.

**New Zealand**

In contrast to the case of the United States, the Kiwi of New Zealand (Apteryx australis) has never received official recognition or legal protection as the country’s emblem and national bird. Although remaining unconfirmed by the nation’s institutions and absent from state
insignia, the Kiwi has developed strong recognition as New Zealand’s unofficial national bird.

New Zealanders first came to be known as “Kiwis” during the First World War, a trend that is believed to have been started by the adoption of the bird as a symbol by their army’s 2nd South Canterbury Territorial Regiment in 1911. Since this date, numerous of the country’s sporting teams have used the emblem, although in recent times it has increasingly been replaced by the silver fern. Furthermore, the use of the Kiwi as a national symbol seems to have gained additional currency by means of the willingness of New Zealand people to describe themselves with reference to the bird.

Germany

The national bird of Germany has come to be recognised as the White Stork (Ciconia ciconia), although again this has not been confirmed by the nation’s legislatures. Instead of receiving official backing, the cause of the White Stork has predominantly been promoted by the German Society for Nature Conservation (NABU). This organisation named the species as the Bird of the Year in 1994, and has subsequently sought to accelerate conservation efforts for the species, undertake an accurate census of the bird, and to develop an effective public awareness campaign about the White Stork.

Alberta, Canada

The province of Alberta in the West of Canada uses the Great Horned Owl (bubo virginianus) as its official provincial bird. This process of adoption was initiated by the provincial government in 1977, who invited the area’s school children to take part in a province-wide poll to select the new bird of choice. The responsibility for protecting and promoting the province’s emblems now lies with Alberta Community Development, a branch of the provincial government.

Washington State, USA

Similar to the Canadian example, all US States also have a state bird. In the case of Washington State, this is the Western or American Goldfinch (carduelis tristis). In 1951, a special election among the State’s school children resulted in the choice of this species. A previous election in 1928 had designated the Meadowlark as the state bird, but it was deemed necessary to select a new symbol as the Meadowlark already represented seven other states. The State Legislature officially anointed the Goldfinch as the state bird for Washington in 1951.

North Carolina, USA

In 1943, the North Carolina General Assembly adopted the Cardinal (cardinalis cardinalis) as the official state bird. This was not an unusual move for a State Legislature that has become well known for its long history of adopting state emblems. Beginning in 1893 and continuing to the present day, with the latest adoption occurring in 2003, North Carolina has officially recognised many state symbols, including: a motto, a song, a flower, a bird, and wildflower.