The Committee will meet at 10.00 am in Committee Room 5

1. **The General Teaching Council for Scotland Annual Report:** The Committee will note the Annual Report of The General Teaching Council for Scotland and take evidence from—

   Matthew MacIver, Chief Executive/Registrar

   Norma Anne Watson, Convener of Council

2. **Pupil Motivation Inquiry:** The Committee will receive a summary of evidence, will consider an approach paper and will take evidence from—

   Ruth Campbell, Policy Manager, Pupil Support and Inclusion Division, Scottish Executive Education Department

   Lynn Hendry, Project Director, “Determined To Succeed”, Scottish Executive Enterprise, Transport and Lifelong Learning Department

   Martin Verity
   Clerk to the Committee
   Room T3.40, Committee Office
   Ext. 0131 348 5204

The following papers are enclosed for the meeting:

Agenda item 1
GTC Annual Report  ED/S2/05/5/1
Agenda item 2
SPiCe briefing  ED/S2/05/5/2
Summary of evidence  05/09
Approach paper  ED/S2/05/5/3
Scottish Executive briefing paper  ED/S2/05/5/4
1. At its meeting of 26 January, the Committee noted the Annual Reports of a number of Non-Departmental Public Bodies and it agreed to invite the General Teaching Council for Scotland to give oral evidence to brief the Committee on its work.

2. Copies of documents submitted by the GTC(S) are circulated with this paper.

3. Members of the Committee expressed particular interest in teacher supply (particularly regarding Gaelic), school discipline, and teacher qualification.

4. The Committee will also be aware that the Chief Executive/Registrar was appointed earlier this month by the Minister for Education and Young People to chair an action group to tackle the need for more Gaelic medium teachers.

5. The GTC(S) has written to the Committee to give its views on the Pupil Motivation Inquiry and a copy of this letter is attached as Annex 1.

Martin Verity
Clerk to the Committee
Mr Martin Verity  
Clerk to the Committee  
The Scottish Parliament  
Education Committee  
Room T3.40  
The Scottish Parliament  
Holyrood Edinburgh  
EH99 1SP  

Date:  
11 February 2005  

Dear Mr Verity  

The Education Committee, Scottish Parliament  
Call for Evidence – Pupil Motivation Survey  

Thank you for your letter of 14 December 2004 inviting the General Teaching Council for Scotland to submit evidence to the Education Committee’s Inquiry into Pupil Disaffection and Motivation.  

You will appreciate that the Council’s role in Scottish education is defined by Statute and because of that it would be difficult and even improper to comment on many of the Committee’s specific areas of interest. Nevertheless, the Council is naturally interested in this issue and feels that it has a significant contribution to make to the debate.  

Given our remit as the professional body for teachers we come to this discussion from a slightly different angle. One of our principal aims is to contribute to improving the quality of teaching and learning in Scottish classrooms. We do this by working to maintain and enhance professional teaching standards in schools.  

We believe that it is the teacher who makes the difference. A contented and well-motivated teaching force will inevitably lead to motivation and engagement among school pupils. We accept that the Scottish Executive’s contribution and commitment to certain areas of the education system are not only to be welcomed but applauded. We think, for example, of the Induction Scheme for new teachers in Scotland. Each probationer teacher now has a guaranteed place for his/her first year of teaching. That system, with a contribution of £24 million from the Scottish Parliament, is now without doubt the envy of other countries throughout the world. It is an investment in the future of the profession and we welcome that.  

The/...
The introduction of the Chartered Teacher is also to be welcomed. Our first Chartered Teachers have recently graduated from their accreditation process. That has been yet another significant step in the development of Scottish education. The concept of rewarding classroom practice in salary terms is one that is attracting huge international interest and again reflects the commitment of the Scottish Parliament to education.

There is another importance in the philosophy underlying the Chartered Teacher programme. In Scotland we are at the beginning of an era when teachers themselves as a profession can take control of their own professional development and ensure that their own needs are being met. It is indeed time that teachers in Scotland did take control of their own professional destiny. For the last 20 years we have not been trusted as a profession. We have moved from being a “high trust, low accountability” profession to the very opposite, ie, a “low trust, high accountability” profession.

That is why we welcome the Minister’s agenda for action “Ambitious Excellent Schools” which advocates more freedom for teachers in schools. That approach is very much to be welcomed and we hope it will mean more trust in teachers to use their own professional judgement. Much responsibility will be with head teachers in allowing classroom teachers to breathe, create and teach with much more freedom than they have had in the past 20 years.

Head Teachers are critical to creating confidence within the classroom and motivating and enthusing teachers within their schools. If we are trying to create a world class education system then we need to benchmark ourselves against the best in the world. In the Netherlands the Leadership opportunities for Head Teachers includes an overseas (European) study trip which includes:

- Visiting schools;
- Networking with other Head Teachers;
- Looking at how issues are dealt with, etc. etc.

This model seems to work really well. There is a danger in Scotland that we are too insular.

There are more specific areas which could be examined. Why, for example, do aspiring Chartered Teachers have to pay substantial amounts of money to achieve that status while aspiring Head Teachers do not? At the moment around 6,500 teachers have expressed an interest in the Chartered Teacher Programme. For the small sum of c £5 million all these potential Chartered Teachers could have their compulsory Module 1 paid. That would send out such an important message and would undoubtedly raise morale.

Another model might be that Module 1 could be offered to all teachers in, for example, their 6th year of teaching as a way of focusing their professional development. Around 2,000 teachers per year would equate to £1.3 million. This might then help teachers to focus their CPD on Leadership or learning and teaching.

Finally, let me touch on a subject which I feel is of profound importance.

Why do we not make it a policy issue that each national working group on education has to advertise among Scottish teachers for applications to sit on that group? We are a small country and there is now a distinct danger that the “usual suspects” will sit on all the national groups. Teachers feel peripheral to the whole debate and simply feel no sense of ownership of policy decisions. It would actually be quite easy to involve teachers in the decision-making process, given the opportunity. I have no doubt that they would deliver handsomely.

I/...
I hope you will find these comments helpful.

Yours sincerely

Matthew M Maciver
Chief Executive/Registrar

If calling please ask for: Fiona Hands on Direct Dial 0131 314 6027
E-mail: Fiona.hands@gtcs.org.uk
Fax: 0131 314 6001
PUPIL MOTIVATION

KATE BERRY

This briefing has been prepared to assist the Education Committee in its Pupil Motivation Inquiry. The inquiry seeks to identify how all children and young people can be motivated by their school experience to enable them to achieve their full potential. The Committee is interested in finding out what factors influence motivation, how disaffection from school can be identified and what kind of approaches can be used to improve motivation and prevent disengagement and disaffection from school.

This briefing examines how concepts of motivation and disengagement and disaffection have been considered within the context of school education. It considers ideas about approaches that can be used to prevent disengagement and disaffection, including experience from overseas.
KEY POINTS

- Motivation is a complex concept and difficult to define. Researchers have found motivation to be a multi-faceted concept which will vary for individuals depending on different circumstances.

- At a basic level motivational theories distinguish between two different types of motivation, extrinsic and intrinsic, based on the different reasons or goals that give rise to an action.

- A number of underlying psychological variables can be addressed to improve motivation. Key variables that have been suggested include self-efficacy, competence, control, and a sense of belonging.

- There are varying definitions of disengagement and disaffection. Similarly there are a number of manifestations from the more extreme e.g. serious indiscipline and exclusion to the less noticeable “quiet” disaffection.

- Approaches to improving motivation and preventing disaffection have been suggested at a number of levels: individual, classroom, school and wider community. What happens within a classroom is thought to be a significant influence.

- The relationship between teacher and pupil seems to be particularly influential. Students need support and to the need be valued as individuals.

- Motivation is increased when teaching styles are varied, active, related to life experiences and when students have some degree of control over their learning.

- It has been suggested that a varied and flexible curriculum can improve individuals motivation. Vocational opportunities may help to re-engage some students in learning. Such experiences may offer closer relationships with others and a practical based learning opportunity.

- Positive experiences outwith the classroom, for example, extra curricular activities such as sports and arts and out of school hours learning may be used in a way to re-engage students in learning experiences. The voluntary sector and other alternative providers have a role to play in providing such opportunities.

- Creating a positive school ethos and a sense of belonging within schools is important

- Integrated working can help overcome some of the problems particular students may face associated with economic and social inequalities. The Integrated Community school concept is being pursued as a way of delivering more integrated services.

- Domestic situations such as family problems, values and choices may influence disengaged school behaviours. Encouraging greater involvement of parents in their children’s education and improving school home links, for example through home link workers, has been suggested as a way of preventing disengagement.
CONTENTS

KEY POINTS .................................................................................................................................................................................. 2

INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................................................................................. 4

MOTIVATION .................................................................................................................................................................................. 5
  Definitions .................................................................................................................................................................................. 5
  DISAFFECTION AND DISENGAGEMENT ................................................................................................................................. 6
    Manifestations of disaffection and disengagement ..................................................................................................................... 6
  SCALE OF THE ISSUE .............................................................................................................................................................. 7
  CAUSES ..................................................................................................................................................................................... 8

APPROACHES TO TACKLING THE ISSUE .......................................................................................................................... 9
  TEACHER/PUPIL RELATIONSHIP ........................................................................................................................................... 9
  HOW THE CURRICULUM IS TAUGHT .................................................................................................................................. 10
    Use of technology .................................................................................................................................................................. 11
  RELEVANCE OF THE CURRICULUM .................................................................................................................................. 11
  Vocational Education ............................................................................................................................................................. 11
  POSITIVE EXPERIENCES OUTWITH THE FORMAL CLASSROOM ................................................................................................. 13
  PROMOTING A SENSE OF BELONGING ................................................................................................................................... 14
    School Leadership ................................................................................................................................................................. 15
  PEER GROUP INFLUENCE ....................................................................................................................................................... 15
  INTER-AGENCY WORKING ..................................................................................................................................................... 15
  PARENTAL INVOLVEMENT ...................................................................................................................................................... 16

APPROACHES IN DIFFERENT COUNTRIES .......................................................................................................................... 17

SOURCES .................................................................................................................................................................................. 20
INTRODUCTION

The Education Committee decided in summer 2004 to conduct an inquiry into pupil motivation. The inquiry begins in mid-February 2005. The terms of reference are:

“To identify how all children and young people can be motivated by their school experience to enable them to achieve their full potential.

The Education Committee are particularly interested in:

- identifying which factors have a positive or negative impact on pupils’ motivation;
- how pupils’ experience outside school impacts on their level of motivation within school;
- examples of how to identify early signs that particular pupils may be disaffected by their school experience;
- examples of effective teaching approaches, learning styles and personalised learning that have a motivating influence for disaffected pupils;
- examples of approaches which ensure that vocational training and alternative curriculum experiences are recognised and valued appropriately;
- examples of best practice from Scotland and other countries; and
- the effectiveness of existing networks and structures for communicating examples of best practice”.

The inquiry is set within the context of achieving inclusion and promoting higher standards in Scottish schools. The Standards in Scotland's Schools etc. Act 2000, the national priorities for education and the Executive’s recent curriculum review all aim to ensure that every child fully participates and benefits from their school experience. Evidence suggests that attainment, as measured by certification, is increasing. Scotland compares well in international comparisons on attainment¹, attendance is generally good and the proportion of young people entering further and higher education is high. Despite such evidence, it is also clear that there are some students who have low levels of achievement, do not attend school, or are frequently absent without good reason. The Executive’s curriculum review also recognises the need to increase opportunities for challenge, choice and motivation for all pupils.

The Committee is interested in what impacts on pupil’s motivation to learn as they move through the school system. It is also interested in why some become demotivated which may influence disaffection and disengagement from school education and results in associated consequences such as lower achievement, poorer employment prospects and attitudes to lifelong learning.

This briefing outlines some of the key concepts behind motivation, disengagement and disaffection and considers some of the approaches suggested to improving students’ experiences of learning and school life. Given the broad terms of reference of the inquiry this is necessarily a general overview.

¹ Scotland generally scores above average in international surveys such as PISA, PIRLS and TIMMS
MOTIVATION

Definitions

Literature suggests that the term motivation is a complex concept and difficult to define. Researchers have found motivation to be multi-faceted:

“Motivation is not a single entity but embraces, for example, effort, self-efficacy, self-regulation, interest, locus of control, self-esteem, goal orientation and learning disposition.” (EPPI 2002)

At a basic level motivational theories distinguish between two different types of motivation, extrinsic and intrinsic, based on the different reasons or goals that give rise to an action (Ryan and Deci 2000):

Extrinsic motivation: refers to doing something because it leads to a separable outcome. For example, students could be described as extrinsically motivated when they engage in learning purely for the sake of attaining a reward or for avoiding some punishment. School practices that seek to motivate students extrinsically include publicly recognising students for academic achievements and other rewards; and taking away privileges or punishment exercises and may also include, for example, education maintenance allowances. Those who are extrinsically motivated are focussed on performance goals - they compete to be the best rather than concentrating on the quality of the work.

Intrinsic motivation: refers to doing something because it is inherently interesting or enjoyable. It does not depend on external constraints or reinforcements. In this sense a student is motivated from within and will be actively engaged and excited by the challenging nature of an activity. A student who is intrinsically motivated will not need any type of reward or incentive to imitate or complete a task. Those who are intrinsically motivated are focussed on learning goals- they focus on tasks rather than how well they are doing in comparison to others.

Research evidence has suggested that intrinsic motivation is more beneficial to the learning process than extrinsic motivation, but that education has relied too heavily on influencing extrinsic elements. Students who are motivated to complete a task only to avoid consequences or to earn certain grades rarely exert more than the minimum effort necessary to meet their goal. Intrinsically motivated students are more likely to feel confident about their ability to learn new material, persist with tasks and retain information longer (Brewster and Fager 2000). The National Research Council Institute of Medicine (NRCIM) (2003) claims a large body of primarily experimental studies has demonstrated that emphasis on rewards and other extrinsic reasons for engaging in an activity can undermine intrinsic interest, for example reminding students that they need to complete assignments because a passing grade depends on it, rather than pointing out what they will learn focuses their attention on the extrinsic reasons for doing schoolwork and thus promotes the feeling that they are doing it because they have to, not because they want to do it.

However, it has also been argued that this division between extrinsic and intrinsic motivation is too simple to reflect the many complex and interrelated factors that influence a student’s motivation to succeed in school (Brewster and Fager 2000). Actions occur when the internal and external factors work together to engender a particular behaviour. It is therefore likely that
motivation is a result of the interplay of the two. McLean (2003) states that rather than thinking in terms of a dichotomy between intrinsic and extrinsic motivation each form of motivation may also be considered as a separate criteria, each ranging from high to low. For any given activity a student may have a combination of extrinsic and intrinsic motivation.

The NRCIM (2003) also notes that student motivation varies in different environments and it is difficult to characterise any one student as uniformly high or low in motivation. This means that within an individual some types of motivation will be stronger than others. Therefore, there is no single response that will meet the needs of all students. However, there are a number of underlying psychological variables that can be addressed to improve motivation. Key variables that have been suggested include self-efficacy; people’s beliefs about their capabilities to carry out actions required to achieve a confident level of achievement, competence, control, and a sense of belonging. Self-esteem is also a factor mentioned frequently although McLean (2003) claims this low self-esteem is not as a big a barrier to learning as is commonly thought. He believes self-efficacy is more important.

There is evidence that how motivated or demotivated individuals feel affects their levels of engagement with the task and enjoyment of activities. Some would argue that demotivation could lead to disengagement and disaffection from school and consequently the formal learning process.

DISAFFECTION AND DISENGAGEMENT

Definitions

The terms disaffection and disengagement are used widely in existing research. In some research the terms are used interchangeably although in other research a distinction is made. Bailey and Tan (2003), for example, follow Kinder, Kendall and Howarth (1999) in the broad definition of disaffection as “being disengaged and dislocated from ..schooling” In other words, disaffected pupils are those who have negative attitudes to school, and therefore participate reluctantly, if at all. Defined in this way it will include pupils who remain in school throughout the compulsory period, as well as those who are excluded. An OECD report (OECD 2003) suggests that those students that are disengaged from school are those who feel they do not belong at school and have withdrawn from activities in a substantial way.

Manifestations of disaffection and disengagement

Research suggests that disengagement and disaffection is a dynamic and cumulative process (NRCIM 2003). As such there are many manifestations and many of the associated behaviours are not obviously overt.

Riley and Rustique-Forrester (2002) suggest at the most extreme disaffected students are characterised by challenging behaviour and being excluded from school. Bailey and Tan (2003) suggest that this is less common and “may be indicative of a point in school experiences where the risk of disaffection is largely transformed into actual disaffection.” Other signs of disaffection may be students that leave school early and attain little. Other students may avoid formal exclusion but may play truant or “self select” out of education. This group may have inconsistent attendance and work habits and may not participate in lessons and homework.

At the other end of the spectrum is less obvious behaviour. Research by teachers in Norwich Schools Consortium project (Elliott, Zomorski and Shreeve 2002) identified a significant number
of pupils whose disaffection was covert rather than overt. One study revealed less consensus on the characteristics of disaffection than had been initially anticipated. Only behaviours that could be classified as task avoidance strategies commanded high levels of consensus amongst teachers. For example, students who often require reminding about instructions given to the whole class or use delaying tactics in class to avoid work. Another study identified students who were termed RHINOs (really here in name only). These students were passively and quietly disengaged from learning in ways that were invisible to the teacher.

NRCIM (2003) consider it is important to pay attention to mental or cognitive behaviours (eg attention and problem solving) because relying only on observable behaviours as evidence of engagement can be deceiving. It argues that only genuine cognitive engagement will result in learning. Although increasing attendance and reducing drop out rates can mark progress in combating disaffection, ultimately what needs to be achieved is the more ambitious goal of promoting deep cognitive engagement that results in learning.

Research has suggested that disaffection is seen to start in the primary school for many pupils but then “hardens up” on transfer to secondary. Riley and Rustique-Forrester (2002) suggest that primary teachers thought they could tell “right away” whether a child was at risk of disaffection. Children were often “tired”, “confused”, or “not happy”. Kinder, Kendall and Howarth (1999) suggest that the 14-16 age group are particularly vulnerable to disaffection.

SCALE OF THE ISSUE

Given the varying definitions and manifestations involved identifying the scale of disengagement and disaffection with any precision is difficult. To a limited extent the prevalence of disaffection among pupils can be traced through statistics on school exclusion and attendance, although for a number of reasons this can be problematic (Mackenzie 2004). These statistics only give a limited view of the more extreme forms of observable behaviour associated with disaffection. Furthermore they “do not reveal children and young people’s emotional response to school” (McKenzie 2004).

Exclusions

As Table 1 shows the number of exclusions and total removals from registers have been declining which has been in line with previous policy of reducing exclusions. Information in this Table pre-dates a circular issued in 2003 (Scottish Executive 2003) which gave revised guidance and formally informed local authorities that the target to reduce exclusions had been dropped. The most common reason for exclusion over the years has been for “general or persistence disobedience”. Male pupils account for approximately 80% of exclusions.

Table 1: Number of Exclusions and Removals from Register

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total number of exclusions</th>
<th>Total number of removals from register</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1999-2000</td>
<td>38,769</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-2001</td>
<td>38,656</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2002</td>
<td>37,442</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-03</td>
<td>36,496</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source Scottish Executive 2004a.
http://www.scotland.gov.uk/stats/bulletins/00321-01.asp
Note; Total number of exclusions does not relate to individual pupils – a pupil could be excluded on more than one occasion.
Absence

In December 2004 the Executive published results of a new attendance and absence survey (Scottish Executive 2004b). This provides greater detail than the previous surveys and such figures are not directly comparable over the years. In 2003-04 the overall rate of attendance was 93.1 per cent (under the previous definitions it was 92.6 per cent in 2002/03). Attendance rates are slightly higher for primary schools (95.3%) than secondary schools (90.2%) Again unauthorised absence was higher in secondary schools (1.6%) compared to primary schools (0.7%).

As noted earlier indiscipline and behavioural problems may also be evidence of disengagement and a pre-cursor to leaving school. The Discipline Task Force report Better Behaviour Better Learning (Scottish Executive 2001) found that low level, irritating indiscipline was the primary cause for concern amongst teachers. Research by Edinburgh University (Scottish Executive 2004g) suggests this is still the case and that such behaviours are experienced by most teachers within a typical school week. Far fewer teachers experience serious indiscipline although evidence suggests that between 1996 and 2004 the number of secondary school teachers who view indiscipline in their school as serious or very serious has risen by 6% and 19% respectively. There is less concern about serious indiscipline in primary schools. The numbers of primary teachers regarding indiscipline as very serious or serious has risen by 1% and 4% respectively. There may be many explanations for this, for example, it may be that as teenagers are becoming less deferential it is more difficult for teachers to assume authority.

A recent OECD report (OECD 2003) examined student engagement across a number of countries, based on data collected from a sample of 15 year old students in the 2000 Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA). The level of engagement is based on two measures: belonging and participation. Belonging is a subjective measure based on the student’s responses on the extent to which they student “feels at home” in the school community. The second measure, participation, is based on how often students say they have missed school, arrived late or skipped class in the past 2 weeks. It must be noted that there have been reservations about the belonging measure used in the study. Steedman and Stoney (2004) suggest that it does not correspond very closely to the concept of disengagement or demotivation widely used in the UK which is more to do with the identification of goals and values of the school and willingness to engage with its programme of learning.

Bearing such reservations in mind the findings indicate that disengagement from school is not limited to a small minority of students. Seventeen per cent of UK students in the sample were identified as having a low sense of belonging, although this is below the OECD average of 25%. On participation the UK, with 15%, was also slightly below the OECD average of 20%.The study also found that in most countries the prevalence of disengaged students varies considerably within, and among schools, and this variation is not attributable solely to students’ family background. A substantial number of medium to high achievers were found to be disengaged from school. Therefore intervention strategies may also be needed to help students who are not necessarily doing badly at school, although such students can be hard to target.

CAUSES

The school environment including the kinds of learning opportunity within mainstream schools' academic curriculum, the learning situation, learning and teaching styles and the teacher student relationship, have been highlighted as important factors that impact on psychological
concepts relating to motivation (Riley and Rustique-Forrester 2002, Solomon and Rogers 2001). In addition a range of other factors that may influence levels of disengagement and disaffection have been cited. Bailey and Tan (2003) suggest that the risk is unequally distributed, being mediated by a range of social, economic and structural factors such as socio-economic position, gender and area effects. Kinder, Kendall and Howarth (1999) also discuss the significance of home factors and how different types of domestic situations might influence disengaged school behaviours. They also discuss the issue of peer relations and how the ways that individuals socialise can affect the degree, and kind of, school engagement they exhibit.

These points are outlined in more detail below when approaches to prevention and tackling the issue are considered.

APPRAOCHES TO TACKLING THE ISSUE

The existing literature suggests a variety of approaches that are needed to positively influence motivation and prevent disengagement and disaffection. Suggestions have been made in relation to individual, classroom, school and wider society levels. A number of models have also been developed. Just as there are differences in the degree of disengagement and disaffection different approaches may be more relevant at different stages and for different students.

TEACHER/PUPIL RELATIONSHIP

A number of reports (Kendall et al 2001, McLean 2003, Riley and Rustique-Forrester 2002,) suggest that the teacher/student relationship is of key importance. Riley and Rustique-Forrester (2002) note that a teacher's relationship with his or her pupils is “complex arena, dependent upon and shaped by a range of issues, including time, professional development, guidance and leadership from senior management, advice from other colleagues as well as what the young people themselves bring to the situation”

Research with students, some of whom have been identified as “disaffected” has revealed views on the characteristics of teachers that are valued by them. “Good” teachers have been described as helpful and supportive, understanding and they use a variety of teaching styles and innovative approaches. On the other hand “bad” teachers have been described as unfair, judgemental, inflexible and unwilling to help or explain ideas beyond instruction. An interest in the student as an individual is important. A survey in America noted that almost two thirds of students claimed they would learn a lot more if their teachers “personally cared about …students as people” (NRCIM 2004). McLean (2003) suggests that getting to know the student allows teachers to be responsive to student’s needs and give formative feedback: “Demotivating teachers show little interest in students, make it obvious they do not know the students well, jump to conclusions quickly about them and make inappropriate personal comments”.

Munn (2003) suggests that most schools are now more relaxed and friendly places than they used to be. Relationships between pupils and teachers are generally positive, based more on mutual respect than on fear and intimidation. Evidence from the PISA report on a sample of 15 year olds suggests a fairly positive relationship with teachers. Over 70 per cent of 15 year olds in both Scotland and the UK as a whole felt that they got on well with most teachers and almost 90 per cent also felt that if they needed extra help from teachers, they would receive it (Scottish Executive 2004c).
HOW THE CURRICULUM IS TAUGHT

The way in which the curriculum is taught may affect student’s levels of disengagement or disaffection. Kinder, Kendall and Howarth (1999) state that the lack of compatibility in learning and teaching styles may unknowingly contribute to pupils’ experiences of disaffection. Research (e.g. Riley and Rustique-For ester 2002, Careers Scotland 2004) suggests that a common view of disaffected students revolves around the “boredom” of school learning and its irrelevance to life outside of school. The PISA 2000 study found that 56% of the sample in Scotland often felt bored – this was above the OECD average of 48% (Scottish Executive 2004c). However, the fact that students may be disengaged from formal classroom settings does not necessarily signify that they are lacking in motivation to learn in general as they may be actively engaged in learning activities beyond school.

Concerns about how learning is structured in schools has been summarised as follows:

“the dominant learning process pursued in schools is too narrow in that it is highly abstract, verbal, sedentary, individualised, competitive and controlled by others as opposed to concrete, problem orientated, active kinaesthetic, co-operative and autonomous”. (Wehlage et al (1989) as quoted in Kendall et al 2002)

Literature (eg Brewster and Fager 2000, McLean 2003, Hufton, Elliot and Illushin 2002) has identified a number of key conditions which can optimise learning:

- New learning happens best when it is related to what individuals already know, understand and can do.
- Learning is enhanced when students are clear about its purpose and about their specific learning goals. Students who are learning-goal orientated are more likely to be more highly engaged than other students.
- Learning is enhanced when students are enabled to take more responsibility and control, for example, giving students choices between different assignments and letting them decide the strategies they use to complete the work. However, choice still needs to be available within a structure that sets clear expectations.
- Teachers need to have high expectations of students and set high standards. It has been suggested that the amount of effort pupils exert on school learning is more closely related to the expectations of others e.g. teachers, peers and parents. However, standards need to be obtainable in order to develop a sense of competence. Students do not develop self competence when they are given easy work or work that is too difficult.
- Students enjoy and exert more effort when teaching is varied and they are active participants. For example, in sciences over the long term students are more likely to engage when they are asked to conduct, rather than read about, experiments. Rote learning and the repetitive nature of some classes can lead to quiet disaffection. Active, practical and recreational based learning in some cases means that students do not often realise they are learning.
- Appropriate evaluation and feedback can impact on perceptions of competence and attitudes to achievement. Research has suggested that some portion of evaluation should be directed toward individual student effort and progress rather than to standardised tests that compare achievement in relation to other students. Constructive feedback that treats mistakes in a way that encourages students to see them as helpful opportunities for learning is also valuable.
However, achieving these optimal learning conditions is a challenge, particularly in mixed ability classes. As each student is unique not all methods will work with all individuals. Learning therefore needs to be personalised and should be focused on the needs of individuals It requires teachers to assess pupil’s understanding frequently and in different ways and to make informed choices about the most appropriate methods.

**Use of technology**

It has been claimed that Information Communication Technologies (ICT) can help teachers teach in a motivating way, for example, by providing opportunities for innovation, providing structure where the student is in control and by providing support and feedback in a non-judgemental way.

A recent study commissioned by the Department for Education and Skills (DfES 2004) investigated the impacts of ICT on pupil motivation (based on eight measures of motivation). The study found that the use of ICT in the case study schools led to positive motivational outcomes. The most positive outcome was where ICT was used within a framework that considers impacts upon learning, teaching and the management of learning and teaching. To maximise impact the study suggested that schools should focus ICT uses to support internal cognitive processes (eg analysis, reasoning and evaluation) and to encourage pupils to use ICT effectively to become more independent in their learning and to feel more in control. Approaches to classroom management and ethos also need to support this shift.

**RELEVANCE OF THE CURRICULUM**

As outlined earlier a key point to emerge from findings with interviews with students is the need to see the relevance of the curriculum to life outside of school and to future careers. Students enjoy learning more and they learn better when topics are personally interesting and related to their lives. Research by Careers Scotland (2004) suggests that “for the non-academic pupil, in particular, life in school appears difficult to make sense of.” The study identifies the need for greater experience based opportunities (eg work experience) and the importance of having a career goal to work towards.

Examples of positive experiences of making the curriculum more relevant include informal discussions about “real world” topics, school trips and project orientated lessons. It has also been claimed that work experience has the potential to broaden young people’s horizons and provide insights into the opportunities and experiences of life after school. This can be particularly important for young people whose home/family and community contexts are characterised by long term unemployment (Kendall et al 2000).

**Vocational Education**

One aspect of making the curriculum more relevant is making greater use of vocational education. Literature suggests vocational education can make a strong contribution to sustaining or re-engaging learning, particularly for those who are disaffected or who do not engage with the traditional school environment and curriculum (Steedman and Stoney 2004, Scottish Executive 2004d).

The benefits that have been identified include maintaining, or re-introducing, an interest in learning, development of a more positive attitude towards the future, improved attendance and behaviour, and the promotion of a sense of achievement. The issue of accreditation has also
been seen as key factor of effectiveness of vocational education, particularly for those who are unlikely to achieve any formal academic exam qualifications. A lack of accreditation may reduce the worth of vocational opportunities for both the student and potential employers (Mannion 2002).

In Scotland the Scottish Executive has been encouraging flexibility in the curriculum to allow pupils to pursue alternative and more relevant curriculum choices, in some cases, for example through more vocational education. This means there is also a need for tailored advice to students. According to an HMIE report (Her Majesty’s Inspectorate of Education 2004a) used well, flexibility could help increase the motivation and learning and achievements of pupils, but effective advice was a vital ingredient in ensuring that pupils did not make inappropriate choices that might close off options prematurely or result in them being under-challenged or losing out on the development of core areas of learning.

The Scottish Executive’s Partnership Agreement also commits itself to allow 14 to 16 year old pupils the chance to develop vocational skills by opting for further education courses during part of the school week. The Executive has instigated a school-college review to help facilitate this commitment, and published the interim report on 26 November 2004 (Scottish Executive 2004e). The report outlines how the Executive will meet its commitment to allow 14-16 year olds to gain vocational skills by:

- Developing Skills-for-Work courses, in conjunction with the Scottish Qualifications Authority, for pupils in S3/4 and above, as another option choice. Pilot courses, starting in 2005, will be in financial services, early years, construction craft skills, and leisure and recreation
- Ensuring all secondary and special schools have effective working partnerships with at least one further education (FE) college

The intention is to finalise the strategy in spring 2005 with implementation from academic year 2005/06 onwards.

However, there has been some caution expressed about becoming over-reliant on vocational options particularly for disaffected students. While it is recognised that there can be benefits, it has been suggested that some of the outcomes could be achieved without vocational context since the key aspects are about relationships, attitudes and positive engagement. Solomon and Rogers (2001) in a study in England found that practitioners were cautious about a generalised further education/vocational training solution to disaffection. They believe that when it was successful, it was more for non-curriculum based reasons such as good relationships, an opportunity for a fresh start and connections with industry. They suggest that interventions to help disaffected students might be better located in the context of regular schooling, aimed at raising self efficacy in specific curriculum areas. Similarly, other research in England suggested that:

“..although the young people were more positive about their learning experiences at college than at school, the size of the class, the fact that they received more individual attention and the practical nature of the work, were crucially important to that finding. This prompts the question that if they had experienced such individual attention and help at school (of the sort that is now being supplied in many schools by Learning Mentors, for example) and been able to study more vocationally based subjects, would they have been more positive about their learning experiences at school?” (McCrone and Morris 2004).
Although some students may be disengaged from learning within the classroom they do not necessarily suffer from lack of motivation to learn as they may actively engage in learning activities outwith the classroom. It has been suggested that where schools can offer, or facilitate learning experiences outside the classroom, or through informal situations, this can be worthwhile. When students are involved in extra curricular or after school activities that provide a venue where they can relax and show what they can do, they are more likely to develop a sense of loyalty to the school.

An HMIE report on integrated community schools (ICS) notes a range of initiatives to extend the learning and broaden the achievements of children (Her Majesty’s Inspectorate of Education 2004b). A number of these initiatives were focussed on recreation or arts activities. For example, a number of authorities provided children with a wide range of opportunities for outdoor pursuits. These included Duke of Edinburgh Award Schemes offered in partnership with outdoor education units, summer sports leader programmes and Scottish Football Association training courses for coaches. It has been claimed that activities with a recreational focus have been found to be effective, especially those dealing with the most highly disafflicted young people (Kendall et al 2002). Recreational activities were deemed to encourage attendance and participation as young people were seen to want to take part. Consequently, activities of this type could be used as vehicles for developing the social and life skills of young people as a further engagement with learning.

The HMIE report also notes that some authorities have organised master classes in drama, in co-operation with local theatres and universities. One authority was particularly using arts provision. Carefully-planned activities for pupils included summer schools for literacy and dance, digital video activities, and dance and music workshops. Staff ensured that participating pupils, including targeted vulnerable young people, were given challenging but appropriate activities. As a result pupils had grown in self-confidence and in their desire to learn through the positive impact of these activities.

Involvement in arts activities within and outwith the formal curriculum may have positive influences on engagement which may partly be related to the way they are taught. A recent Ofsted report (Ofsted 2003) notes the positive effects of arts (dance, drama, music and arts) education on students. The report was based on a small sample of some of the lowest attaining primary and secondary schools in the country. Despite low attainment in many areas of the curriculum the schools were achieving above national expectations for one or more arts subject. Positive effects included increased confidence, better motivation and more persistence in tackling other subjects. In the best lessons it was found that teachers quickly engaged with students in challenging, subject specific practical work. Teachers developed a strong relationship with their students and the lessons gave more opportunities for students to receive positive feedback from teachers and other students. This was found to have a strong motivating influence.

Voluntary sector involvement

Many of these activities to extend learning opportunities have been developed in partnership with the other agencies and the voluntary sector. For example, the Princes Trust co-ordinates xl clubs in 65 schools in Scotland. The clubs target young people facing difficulties in schools and work with them on a personal development curriculum. The clubs are deliberately informal and aim to re-engage and motivate young people. They are student led with guidance received from an adviser sometimes from the Youth Service or Careers Service. XI clubs are accredited by the Prince's Trust ASDAN xl Award, which gives club members a qualification in the 'Wider Key
Skills' of problem solving, working with others and improving own learning. Some of the positive outcomes identified to date include improved attendance and behaviour, increases in the number of qualifications attempted and increased awareness of the world of work.

Another voluntary organisation, Right Track, offers 2 full time programmes delivered from centres in North Lanarkshire and Glasgow aimed at young people with a prolonged history of non-attendance at school, behavioural issues and/or short term exclusions. The Education Initiative (EI) focuses on S4 pupils and offers programmes of counselling, personal and social development, accredited core skills and raising vocational awareness. The aim is to ensure a positive progression route. The New Generation Education Initiative focused on pupils from S2 on S3. The programme structure is similar to the EI but the aim is to reintegrate pupils back into school. Key practices to the success of the programmes include working in small groups, consistency of staff allowing relationships to be built and a flexible curriculum. Staff aim to develop a “can do” approach amongst young people.

PROMOTING A SENSE OF BELONGING

NRCIM (2003) suggest that although feeling psychologically connected to school is not sufficient for meaningful engagement in academic work, it is probably necessary for many students. Students who feel disrespected at school or socially isolated are not likely to function effectively at school, therefore creating a sense of belonging to both the school and the community is important. In Scotland the idea of a positive school ethos has been promoted. The Scottish Office (1999) identified that a school with a positive ethos will be a school where:

- Expectations are high and achievement encouraged
- Creative learning is developed
- Discipline problems are managed positively
- Pupils are encouraged to rise to challenges and learn how to work in co-operation with others
- There is close monitoring of progress and achievement
- Success is celebrated.

Schools have been encouraged to evaluate their ethos, taking account of the views of pupils, teachers, parents and others to identify aspects for improvement. The Scottish Schools Ethos Network was established to encourage schools to share ideas and experiences about developing a positive ethos. Details of specific projects can be found on the Scottish Schools Ethos Network site at: [http://www.ethosnet.co.uk/](http://www.ethosnet.co.uk/)

Examples of projects carried out include using “buddy systems” whereby older pupils befriend younger pupils to induct them in the school, and reward systems to recognise caring and positive behaviour. HMIE (2004a) have noted that a positive school ethos is essential to ensuring the effective provision of personal support and guidance services to students, particularly those who are vulnerable.

Some schools have also developed pupil councils as a way of involving pupils in decision making processes and some evidence suggests a link between participation and motivation. A report on the implementation of Better Behaviour Better Learning (Scottish Executive 2004f) notes that more than three quarters of authorities report well established and progressing work on developing pupil councils in their schools. HMIE pre-inspection questionnaires find that 91% of primary school pupils and 73% of secondary school pupils felt that they are involved in decision making processes (Scottish Executive 2004g).
However, MacKenzie (2004) notes the degree to which children and young people are participating within schools varies across Scotland. At one end of the spectrum there are pupil councils with tightly controlled agendas—these councils give the appearance of consultation while merely legitimising decisions already taken by school management. At the other end of the spectrum are schools where the vast majority of pupils are actively engaged in decisions on issues such as new building programmes, the purchase of new resources and appointing new staff. In cases where schools genuinely listen to and act on pupils' views, there is a noticeable affect on pupil commitment and engagement. As she states:

“The challenge for those that promote pupil participation is to ensure the right to be heard is also extended to the disaffected, and to issues that particularly concern the disaffected. These pupils are unlikely to be heard unless schools are proactive in seeking their views and ensuring that they are valued and acted upon.” (MacKenzie 2004)

**School Leadership**

The role of school leadership and school policies in creating a positive whole school environment and in promoting a motivating culture is also important. Teachers need support within the school and classroom to implement particular strategies. They also need sufficient opportunities for Continuing Professional Development and for sharing practice within schools and across schools.

There has been an emphasis on leadership as part of the secondary school reform programme and developments such as the Scottish Qualification for Headship (SQH) aim to improve participants' practice as school leaders and managers.

**PEER GROUP INFLUENCE**

Just as the teacher/student relationship is important in schools the relationships between students are also important. However, there seems to be less available evidence on the influences of peers on levels of engagement.

NRCIM (2003) states that peers are often thought of as the enemy when it comes to persuading students to engage in academic work but research suggests that peers can have a positive influence on student's engagement. Similarly Slade and Trent (2000) interviewing boys in New Zealand found that being perceived as clever appears to be socially acceptable and a source of social respect amongst peers. NRCIM (2003) suggests that students who are most at risk from disengaging have too little contact with peers who have strong commitments to education and high expectations for success. Groups of students with similar achievement levels are frequently tracked, formally or informally, into different groups thus isolating relatively low performing and disengaged students. Therefore, they conclude eliminating tracking and encouraging students of different social backgrounds to mix is important.

**INTER-AGENCY WORKING**

While the literature does recognise that schools cannot be expected to compensate fully for problems associated with factors such as economic and social inequalities, it is also recognised that greater integrated working can help overcome some of these problems. The contribution of other agencies, including youth and community services, social work, health agencies, FE colleges, education business partnerships, training providers, police and the voluntary sector providing research and information services to the Scottish Parliament
has been evident in a wide range of initiatives and interventions aimed at re-engaging disengaged young people

In Scotland the integrated community school (ICS) concept has been promoted as way of delivering more integrated services. The ICS approach has been piloted over three phases from 1999 to 2003 and the Executive has set a target for all publicly-funded schools in Scotland to become Integrated Community Schools by 2007.

An HMIE report (HMIE 2004b) on ICS found that overall it was clear that the ICS initiative has been a catalyst for beginning to enhance joint working between schools and other agencies to provide support for young people, particularly the most vulnerable. However, despite many examples of good practice it was clear that the ICS initiative had not been fully successful in its aim of establishing a new over-arching vision and framework for the delivery of education and other children's services, using schools as the hub. ICS initiatives often sat alongside a range of other activities, such as health promotion, out-of-school care and learning and Better Behaviour - Better Learning initiatives, rather than acting to bring together existing activities in a coherent way. There was often very limited awareness amongst mainstream staff in schools and mainstream professionals in other agencies of the vision and ethos underpinning ICS initiatives. This inhibited the extent to which pupils could benefit.

Although the value of integrated working is recognised it is also clear that at a practical level there can be many challenges such as pressures of existing workloads, attitudes of families to other agency input, different priorities of agencies and information sharing and confidentiality issues.

PARENTAL INVOLVEMENT

Although the literature recognises that schools have a significant role to play in facilitating motivation and engagement it is recognised that they cannot do it alone. Many of the factors that shape students' behaviour in schools are based on their experiences outside school.

Research has noted that domestic situations such as family problems, values, events and choices might influence disengaged school behaviours. Teachers interviewed in an English study cited a range of factors that may influence levels of engagement such as a lack of support from parents, disordered home lives, family break up and negative parental attitudes towards school (Riley and Rustique-Forrester 2002). McLean (2003) notes that parents' views on learning and achievement can influence their children’s attitudes towards achievement. Mastery –orientated parents are those who expect their youngsters to achieve success. They encourage their children to try new things and to exercise independence, but they also provide a great deal of nurturing so that their children will acquire the skills necessary for independence. They tend to reward praiseworthy accomplishments and ignore disappointing performance. On the other hand unhelpful parenting styles include failure avoiding parents who react badly to failure and are indifferent to success. Another unhelpful parenting style involves overbearing demands for excellence with limited support to achieve it.

NIRCM (2003) notes that although research suggests that parental involvement in children’s education is valuable studies do not often differentiate between different types of involvement such as volunteering activities at school, helping with out of school learning, encouragement or participating in school decisions. They suggest that communication is probably the first and necessary step to involving parents in their children’s education, although special efforts may be required to communicate with some parents eg from low income groups.
In Scotland, evidence (HMIE 2004b) suggests a range of activities are being developed to provide opportunities for parents to contribute to a purposeful learning ethos. In some instances there have been opportunities for engagement with staff to support children's learning. For example, some ICS clusters have organised adult education classes, based in one or more of the schools, on topics agreed with parents. These include classes on the curriculum and early intervention to support children's learning, and the enhancement of computing, art and parenting skills. Other projects involve parents being involved in paired reading and homework support schemes, or parents acting as volunteer tutors in adult classes. These initiatives have helped parents to become more involved with the school, increased their confidence, knowledge and skills in helping their children learn and helped them to identify more closely with their school.

Elsewhere local authorities have established parent forums and parental advocacy groups. Some schools have combined resources from ICS funding and Changing Children’s Services Fund to enhance the staffing levels of home-school link workers, while other authorities have reviewed the remits of Education Welfare Officers and redeployed them to their home-school link teams allowing greater flexibility in the deployment of staff. Some authorities have developed the posts as inclusion support workers, delivering services within the classroom and to families (Scottish Executive 2004f).

**APPROACHES IN DIFFERENT COUNTRIES**

**USA**

A recent publication in the USA (NRCIM 2003) outlines features required to create “engaging” high schools. It gives details on 12 different reform models. While many of the central design features of the models overlap their process of implementation has been varied. Many of these models are still “works in progress” and assessing their long term impact is difficult. However, they show promise in some indicators of student engagement and learning. A brief summary of some of these approaches is outlined below.


ELOB was established in 1992 as part of the New American Schools network of comprehensive school designs. It is based on two central precepts: students learn better by doing than listening, and developing character, high expectations and a sense of community is as important as developing academic skills and knowledge

It seeks to change school culture by making curriculum more active and by motivating students to go deeper, work harder, and do more than they thought they could. Learning expeditions are long-term in-depth investigations of a theme or topic. Students investigate these subject areas through challenging projects. A typical learning expedition takes most of the school day and last 8 to 12 weeks or more. Expeditions involve academic work, adventure and fieldwork. Students complete the expedition with a performance or presentation to an audience. As students become more invested in their work, the quality improves, their test scores rise and disciplinary problems decrease.

Created in 1993, Expeditionary Learning is now implemented in 115 urban
and rural schools in 29 states in all regions of the country, the District of Columbia and Puerto Rico. Examples of approaches pursued in individual schools can be found on the website.

First Things First
www.irre.org

First Things First (FTF) was developed by the Institute for Research and Reform in Education (IRRE) and first implemented in 1996. It provides a clear but flexible framework for reform that districts and schools can adapt to their specific needs. Using the FTF framework, schools focus on three goals:

- Strengthening relationships among students and adults. IRRE staff and consultants work with schools as they organize into small learning communities (SLC’s) without tracking students by past academic performance. These communities stay together for all three years of middle school and all four years of high school. Keeping SLCs together from start to finish promotes stronger relationships and collective responsibility among students and adults. Families are also involved in the SLCs through the Family Advocate System. This means that adults at home have a personal relationship with an adult at the school who knows their student’s academic needs and has a clear stake in that student’s academic and personal success.

- Improving teaching and learning. Using schedules and staffing to give students more time in language arts and math and to lower student/adult ratios for as much of that time as possible.

- Allocating all resources – budget, staff, time and space – to achieve the first two goals.

The first site, Kansas City, Kansas, began planning FTF for all 43 of its schools in 1996 and began phasing in implementation in 1997. Implementation was district-wide by fall 2000. Early results from Kansas suggest improvements in graduation rates, increase in student attendance and increased gains in reading levels.

High Schools that Work http://www.sreb.org/programs/hstw/hstwindex.asp

High Schools that Work (HSTW) began in 1988 as a pilot project of the Southern Regional Education Board’s Vocational Education Consortium. It is designed to raise the achievement level of career bound high school students by combining the content of traditional college preparatory studies with work. It is based on the belief that students understand and retain academic concepts more readily if they use them in completing projects for their vocational courses.

The following key practices and conditions are pursued:
- teaching a rigorous academic curriculum,
- raising expectations in academic and career/technical studies,
- making instruction relevant to students’ lives,
• using research-based teaching strategies,
• helping students meet elevated expectations,
• providing leadership and professional development to sustain improvement.

It is currently being implemented in more than 1,000 high schools in 31 states. Further information on approaches in particular schools can be found on the website.

**Switzerland**

The ESRC funded a seminar series “How to Motivate (De-motivated) 14-16 Year Olds; with Special Reference to Work Related Education and Training in 2003 (Steedman and Stoney 2003). Part of the series considered approaches to disaffection in Switzerland. There is particular interest in the Swiss system because a high proportion of Swiss youth gain vocational qualifications, unemployment is very low and there is high GDP per head and the well qualified workforce is thought to be a key factor in achieving this. There is arguably evidence that the Swiss are better than many at motivating less academic learners.

The apparent success of the Swiss system (in German speaking cantons) was felt to be associated with these over-arching factors:

- The system maximises success rather than failure
- There are safety nets in the system at different stages
- No choices need to be made by student before they are able to make them
- Training and qualification routes are clear, widely understood and available to almost all students
- Children begin school relatively late, with the kindergarten stage being focused on play and developing pre-requisites for effective learning
- Encouraging all to reach a shared, common, expected standards
- Flexibility in the school education system.

They emphasise special care with the foundation of learning and differential pedagogy as a way of preventing disengagement and underachievement for students who do not attend the academic secondary schools. This translates into a more sheltered school environment (the same classroom and only a small number of different teachers at the secondary stage) and mastery of small learning steps.
SOURCES


providing research and information services to the Scottish Parliament


Slade and Trent (2000). *What the Boys are Saying. An Examination of the views of boys about declining rates of achievement and retention*. International Education Journal Vol1, No.3.


Pupil Motivation Inquiry – Summary of Written Evidence

Introduction

This paper provides a summary of responses to the call for written evidence to the Pupil Motivation Inquiry. A total of 78 responses were received. Twelve local authorities responded as did 4 associations, 2 unions and 22 voluntary organisations and alternative service providers.

The responses indicated a range of opinions and illustrated a range of projects and approaches that are being pursued. There were many common themes throughout the responses. The following is a summary of the key point made in response to each of the points in the Inquiry’s terms of reference. Appendix 1 contains a summary of specific projects.

General

In addition to responses to the specific questions as set out in the terms of reference, a number of general points about the inquiry were made.

Two respondents, East Ayrshire Council and Learning Teaching Scotland (LTS), felt it was important to appreciate the scale of disengagement and disaffection. East Ayrshire Council felt that it is not true that schools are failing to motivate young people, nor are teachers disinterested in finding new and stimulating approaches to learning. Increases in attainment, high levels of participation in charity work and high levels of achievement by young people in the arts and sport were all evidence of this. They did recognise however, that for some motivation and disaffection would be a problem. Similarly LTS suggested that the media tended to focus more on the negative of Scottish education. They felt this impacted on the morale of schools and teachers and on the expectations of students, their parents and wider society including potential recruits.

The Association of Head Teachers in Scotland (AHTS) proposed that the inquiry should be widened to take into account the motivation of all school personnel. They felt it was time to review the picture as a whole, and to recognise that a large section of the workforce were totally disillusioned on a daily basis, “since local authorities have given such scant thought to the regular welfare of all staff in schools”.

Identifying which factors have a positive or negative impact on pupil motivation

There was a consensus amongst respondents that there are a multitude of factors that influence motivation. As Quarriers stated, “there are many diverse
elements which impact on pupil’s motivation, which will differ for each individual child and which require to be addressed using a wide range of approaches and attitudes. The University of Glasgow felt that the idea of “motivational profiles” would be helpful and reflects the complex nature of the subject.

Responses have been grouped into themes.

Climate and ethos in schools

A number of respondents felt that positive school ethos was one of the most significant contributors to motivation. As the Scottish Council of Independent Schools (SCIS) stated, “children who feel valued, respected, safe, cared for and loved are likely to feel motivated, to be receptive to a learning environment and to succeed in their endeavours”. The Anti-Bullying Network and the Scottish Schools Ethos Network said that children who are being bullied will not be able to learn effectively.

SCIS and others, for example, Renfrewshire and Argyile and Bute Councils felt it was important for schools to celebrate achievement in its widest sense, by recognising and valuing different interests and talents in children. Giving pupils the opportunity to be involved in meaningful decision making process within the school was also seen as important to improve motivation by some, for example the World Wildlife Fund and Glasgow City Council.

Part of a positive school ethos is about how peers interact with each other. The Scottish Parent Teacher Council (SPTC) said that research has often highlighted the impact peers can have on young peoples’ motivation to work. The positive side of this is the benefit of getting in with a good crowd when a group of hard working young people can reinforce individual motivation and lift the achievements of youngsters who might otherwise drift if left to their own devices. East Renfrewshire Council though it was important to harness peer dynamics positively, for example, through group work programmes.

Curriculum and pedagogy

A number of points about curriculum and pedagogy were made although many of these points were repeated in the question about teaching approaches and learning styles below. A fuller summary is given under that question.

Positive

- Learning must be driven by the pupil’s needs.
- Pupils need to have freedom to manage own learning
- Enthusiastic teachers
- Action based learning
- Use of creativity
- Intrinsically motivated students (e.g. focussed on tasks and learning goals, find learning meaningful and ask for help when needed) are more likely be engaged than those that are extrinsically motivated (e.g. focussed on performance goals, see learning as a means to an end)
Negative

- Boring, inflexible programmes and authoritative settings
- Aberlour Child Care Trust quoted comments from young people. Negative impacts included: “Teachers who hand out punishment for stupid things e.g. turning round or talking, “sarcastic teachers and "being bullied by teachers”.
- Comments from students in the Glasgow Secondary Student Council Forum included, “lack of attention and encouragement from teachers”, “unfair punishments”, peer pressure, “teachers shouting at you or making you embarrassed”.

One teacher thought that the standard for initial teacher training is too low and there is a need to encourage quality rather than quantity. They thought there was a lack of understanding of the value of thinking skills and how acquisition of thinking skills and promotion of self-efficacy impacts on all areas of the curriculum and effects increased achievement and attainment.

The SPTC thought it was important not to confuse motivation with fun. They stated there are times when life can be boring, unpleasant, dangerous or scary and it is important that children learn how to cope with these situations.

Individual characteristics

Low self-confidence and low self esteem were mentioned a number of times as negatively impacting on motivation. However, according to Alan McLean “schools cannot influence this as much as we think and the most important “feel good” factor is self-efficacy in goal achievement”. A few respondents also mentioned the influence of mental health problems and learning difficulties, including ADHD that will result in particular pupil motivation issues.

East Renfrewshire Council thought it was important to pay attention to children’s emotional well-being. A detailed assessment of emotional development in early education with appropriate intervention strategies can affect motivation in later years. The role of school based youth mental health counsellors, social workers, health co-ordinators etc can have a considerable impact on pupil motivation.

Social factors and external circumstances

Respondents mentioned a wide range of social factors and external circumstances which could impact positively or negatively on motivation. Some of the points made about the influence of parents, and the wider community were similar to points made under the next section so these are considered in more detail there.

The media was also noted as a powerful influence. The Professional Association of Teachers (PAT) noted that children are influence by singers, idols and sports personalities but sometimes the wrong message is sent out
i.e. you do not have to do well at school to succeed. They stated that this is hardly an incentive for young people to be well motivated at school. School should be a place where you are expected to think, to work out problems and write about topics you have been taught about.

**Systematic factors such as government policy**

A number of respondents felt that the “attainment culture” had a negative impact on both the motivation of pupils and teachers. Points were made about the number of assessments and what is assessed and valued.

Children in Scotland cited research by the Prince’s Trust reveals the detrimental effect of being in an environment based on constant assessment where young people who do badly quickly experience a growing sense of failure and decreased expectations. Learning and Teaching Scotland (LTS) thought that pressures on schools from target-setting can transfer to pressure from teachers on students. The number of assessments makes learning less enjoyable – fewer assessments and valuing a wider range of achievement would help.

According to Scottish Secondary Teacher’s Association (SSTA) “The education system in Scotland is not designed to support the development of independent, democratic and responsible citizens because it has removed all responsibility for learning and teaching from pupils and teachers. Pupils are responsible, not for their own learning, but for attaining prescribed outcomes. Teachers are not responsible for their own teaching, but for making sure that pupils meet targets and raise attainment.”

Similarly PAT thought that the Executive’s strategies of raising attainment has meant there is no emphasis on the benefit of education for its own sake and the wider good of society. They also thought it is easier now for pupils to do well in exams; “As it is easier to do well, why try hard in the first place?”

**How Pupil’s experience outside school impacts on their level of motivation within school**

Although a number of experiences outside school were mentioned the most commonly mentioned was children’s interaction with parents and families.

*Parents and Families*

The positive influence of parents was noted, for example, as the Church of Scotland stated, “The single most important influence is the relationship and level of communication between young people and their parents or carers. When relationships and communication are effective, intervention and support are most effective”. Showing an interest in their child and offering praise was mentioned frequently. The NASUWT, amongst others, thought that parents who are keen and enthusiastic will motivate their children.
However, the negative influence of parent’s attitudes was also highlighted. East Renfrewshire Council felt that where parents have had negative school experiences their children are less likely to be engaged in schooling. The PAT felt that many parents indulge their children with material possessions to enable them to have a comfortable, secure life. This reinforces the view that such possessions are easy to come by and that they do not have to work hard at anything, including school. In addition there are a growing number of parents who are not supportive of school and education and this is counter-productive when trying to motivate some pupils.

Some thought there was a need to get parents more involved with schools, for example, through parents associations and school boards. A few responses noted the importance of home link workers to represent the views of parents and the school. Inter-agency work is important in this respect. For example, support strategies in Renfrewshire Council include within the family support service offering groupwork and individual support programmes to disaffected young people which are short term with solution focussed outcomes.

Problems

Some responses noted that if a child was experiencing particular problems outwith school then this may have a negative influence on their motivation. Quarriers, for example, noted that a range of family problems that may impact, for example, bereavement, poverty, parents or guardians with alcohol or drug problems. Aberlour Child Care Trust’s submission included illustrative quotes from young people, for example, “If there are problems at home then I can’t concentrate at school as I’m too worried then I get punishment exercises”.

Skill Force Scotland thought that the impact of external problems varies from pupil to pupil. Some are able to “compartmentalise” negative aspects of their lives as a protection mechanism. But almost without exception the confidence and motivation built up through success or enjoyment in one facet of life permeates into the other. Again they felt that it would be helpful to build relationships between the home and the school and that interagency working was key.

Wider community

The influence of the wider community on motivation and engagement was also mentioned. The EIS thought that low self – confidence related to poverty in the community. Young people in families and areas of social deprivation and poverty are more likely to be disaffected at some point in their school career and are less likely to be able to recover from the effects of disaffection in childhood. It is therefore necessary to consider disaffection as a societal issue.

A number of respondents felt that in general positive involvement within local communities was important to support engagement in education. East Renfrewshire Council felt that Integrated Community Schools can positively
affect community attitudes towards formal education. The Prince’s Trust stated that outside school young people have the chance to share positive experiences about school, which can reinforce enthusiasm and cultivate it in others. Interfaith Scotland also thought that there is currently too much of a gap between the generations and that children need to interact with people of all generations.

A number of responses felt that activities such as sport and culture, out of school learning activity and supported study can contribute positively to community involvement. An awareness of a range of providers is needed for this. Glasgow City Council, amongst others, listed some partnership activities they are involved in promoting extra curricular activities for example the creation of a study support centre at Rangers FC which uses football to motivate young people and contributes to anti-sectarian society and the GOALS project –widening access to Health Education and lottery funded programmes targeting sports activities. Voluntary sector and alternative providers have a role to play in such initiatives.

The role of teachers in recognising the wider context of a child’s life was also highlighted. Quarriers stated, “It is important that teacher training and ongoing learning reflects proper understanding of the way in which the whole context of a child’s life can undermine the personal and learning relationship which is fundamental to a child’s development. Ensuring that teachers are encouraged to take a holistic view of the child would help to address this issue."

Examples of how to identify early signs that particular pupils may be disaffected by their school experience

Respondents felt there was range of signs that may indicate pupils were disaffected by their school experience.

Some respondents cited more obvious manifestations such as poor or non-attendance, general lack of interest, a reduction in achievement and behaviour problems, verbal and physical abuse of teachers and peers, inability to make friendships with peers, difficulties in coping with work and not participating in social events. Exclusion was seen as a serious indicator of disaffection.

However, a couple of respondents were cautious as interpreting behavioural issues as signs of disaffection. Children 1st, for example thought that signs such as being disruptive in class, bullying and truancy may sometimes indicate that it is something else in their life which needs to be addressed e.g abuse or neglect. East Ayrshire Council also thought that signs of behaviour difficulties such as ADHD or autistic spectrum disorders should not be typed as necessarily disaffected by school. For such children a multi-disciplinary approach is important.

Skill Force Scotland noted that a more widespread problem is the quieter disengagement that sees many pupils increasingly withdraw in the classroom
and produce bare minimum work. The SSTA also mentioned the type of pupils those that become “ghost-like”. They blend into the background, giving no particular cause for concern but they withdraw from classroom interactions and avoid drawing attention to themselves. This technique is more subversive, more worrying because of the greater difficulties in identifying such pupils. Skill Force Scotland also thought that this is arguably the most significant challenge, as it is often overlooked. Under-achievement is often targeted at the lowest performing 20%, but what about those who do not fall into this category, but are still under-achieving.

Identification Strategies

One teacher suggested knowing pupils well allows for easy recognition of early signs of disaffection. Many respondents felt there was a need for monitoring, for example, of attendance and responding with early intervention.

The Church of Scotland Committee on Education felt that Home Start and pre-school staff are ideally placed to identify early signs of potential to be disaffected from school. They recommend that action in response to concerns from existing pre-school staff should be made the highest priority and resources made available. Renfrewshire Council’s Extended Support Team (EXT) comprising a core group of key professionals such as school staff, educational psychologists, home link workers and social workers were thought to be important in monitoring early indicators of disaffection. By the end of the school session every school in Renfrewshire will have an EXT.

Examples of effective teaching approaches, learning styles and personalised learning that have a motivating influence for disaffected pupils

There were many points. There was a consensus that there is no overall one approach is suitable and that a variety of approaches should be used. Again responses have been grouped into particular themes.

Qualities of individual teachers

- Teachers who are creative
- Teachers who work out of a strong ethos of respect for each individual, and show signs that pupils and their contribution are valued
- Nothing can replace the inspirational teacher as the best motivator for children. (SCIS)
- The teacher’s enthusiasm for his/her subject or for teaching for its own sake has a motivating effect (Angus Council

Comments made by pupils in the Glasgow Secondary Schools Forum about qualities that were valued included, “Teachers with a sense of humour and fun”, “allowing high level of participation in classes”, “a genuine interest in pupils and their work”.
While it was clear personal qualities of teachers were important it was also recognised by some, for example, Angus Council, that teachers needed to be motivated and supported in what could sometimes be a stressful role. The EIS thought improving motivation requires school staff who are themselves confident and who are respected by their employers. The implementation of *A Teaching Profession for the 21st Century* both will be a key factor in promoting the re-professionalisation of teaching in Scotland.

*Structure of Curriculum*

One issue that arose in relation to the curriculum was the need for flexibility. According to Children in Scotland the National Debate for Education highlighted a desire for more innovative approaches and more balance in the school day between desk based learning, sporting and cultural activities and leisure time. Equally important is a school’s ability to be sufficiently flexible to respond to individual needs. East Ayrshire Council thought that flexibility had facilitated a range of activities such as outdoor learning and youth strategy placements. Skill Force Scotland thought that subjects and programmes must offer relevance, progression, challenge and to certain extent kudos to maintain interest and enthusiasm.

The NASUWT thought that pupils are not motivated when they are presented with work that is too difficult for them and questioned the need for such a broad curriculum. They thought more time must be spent on the basics.

*Teaching Approaches*

- Learning by doing
- Need for pupils to be involved in decision making –to feel like they have some kind of influence and control.
- Recognition of pupil’s success. Self recognition is also important – increased confidence and reduces pupil’s nervousness about tackling new tasks.
- Creativity and the arts. The Scottish Arts Council thought that the arts can provide stimuli and encouragement for children to learn and understand subjects across the curriculum as well as enhancing personal skills such as self-esteem, self expression and teamwork.
- Connect the learning as far as possible with real purposes in real contexts. For example, Angus Council gave the example of writing an e-mail to a pupil in a partner school. This is a central concern of the Critical Skills programme.
- Approaches to teaching which are overly didactic, with the teacher on transmit all the time, concerned mainly with giving of information/subject content are demotivating for all pupils but more especially boys.
- Teaching should be based on a thorough assessment of needs using a multi-professional approach.
- Design activities that enable learners to experience a sense of accomplishment.
- Collaborative working/peer group work
• Need for children to be involved
• Smaller classes, that are small enough to give children the individual attention, they need.
• A few respondents mentioned the use of “Circle Time” – this is a group activity in which any number of people sit down together with the purpose of furthering understanding of themselves and of one another.
• After school recreation programmes
• Need to feel in control of their lives and of their learning. Development of self – efficacy is significant in preventing disaffection
• Use of learning mentors

Assessment

A few respondents noted the importance of how pupil’s work is assessed and the need for formative assessment approaches. An individual response stated that, “assessment should be inclusive of the multiple intelligences, taking account of emotional intelligence or whatever the child found to be the real focus of that learning opportunity. This brings a sense of value and meaning for the time this child has spent. It does not allow the teacher to tick boxes or justify accountability easily.”

A teacher noted that formative assessment is a key driver, “Learners learn best when they understand what they are trying to learn and what's expected of them; get feedback on the quality of their work and how to make it better and are involved in deciding what's to be done next and who can give them help. The key principles are; sharing learning intentions; effective questioning; self and peer assessment; providing effective feedback”.

Individual approaches

The Association of Head Teachers Scotland stated that teacher’s use of pupils’ Personal Learning Plans allows children to become more involved in their learning, stimulates learning (and teaching) and gives parents the opportunity to be part of the process. They also noted that since ICT is well proven in the stimulation of pupils, they do respond better if the PLP in online and there are several interactive versions in existence. Renfrewshire Council noted that Individual target setting allows a better match to the pupils’ wishes and their learning activities.

Specific examples included:
• Angus Council and the Critical Skills Programme,
• Glasgow City Council Support groups operating in a number of secondary schools e.g. “vulnerable” girls/boys groups, anger management groups e.g. Lochend Community School; St Paul’s High School, Collaborative working between Royston Stress Clinic and Springburn Academy with very positive results e.g. small group work with vulnerable groups/ stress management groups
• Stiener curriculum which emphasis small classes and creativity
Examples of approaches which ensure that vocational training and alternative curriculum experiences are recognised and valued appropriately

A couple of respondents noted the importance of valuing alternative experiences. The SPTC stated that one important change is to allow more diverse ways of recognising success. Youngsters must not be given a single version of the successful pupil. Renfrewshire Council noted that a clear steer from the LA that vocational education is as valued as academic success-policy guidance helps here.

SkillForce Scotland thought a vital aspect of the curriculum review will be to develop a structure through which vocational awards achieve nationwide recognition among employers and FE institutions and count towards school targets. Skill Force, for example, said they offer ASDAN awards that are recognised by UCAS, strongly regarded by employers but are not currently accredited by SQA. However, it is important that any future developments should not burden teachers. The Prince’s Trust xL club advisers thought that if the full benefits of alternative curricula are to be seen then we need to encourage further marketing and active support within the school environment.

A few respondents, including LTS, thought it was important that vocational opportunities were available to all and should not just be targeted on disaffected pupils. The EIS thought that initiatives such as skills for work courses or college experience must not be seen as solutions targeted at lower attaining or challenging pupils. Similarly, Renfrewshire Council felt there was a need to have vocational choice as an opportunity for all pupils and not just a “dumping ground”.

Particular examples

- Orkney Islands Council - Individual application to attend the local training centre has to be made for each pupil and reviews are held thereafter to ensure that the experience is benefiting the pupil in order for it to continue. These reviews provide and excellent opportunity for both school and centre staff to examine the pupil’s progress and identify links which can be built on to improve motivation at school. One pupil, having become more motivated whilst attending the centre, decided that he would like to try harder to become more motivated whilst attending the centre, decided that he would like to try harder to achieve academic qualifications. The introduction of Scottish Progression Awards has made it possible for pupils to start on a vocational pathway whilst still at school and, following a successful pilot, this will be opened out to further areas. Work experience can provide worthwhile links with employers for the pupil provided that careful placing of the pupil is carried out. This has on occasion led to the pupil progressing onto a skillseeker programme with the employer.
• East Ayrshire Council - the authority has a clear policy on the flexible curriculum. Links have been established with FE colleges. For the most disaffected pupils a tailor made learning package is assembled through the Authority’s Youth Strategy which includes input from social services, vocational learning and outdoor learning. There is a contract with an external provider for a limited number of vocational education placements. Schools are making increasing use of the variety of accredited course that are available from SQA and other bodies. The introduction of intermediate and access courses into S3 and S4 is also becoming more common.

• ASDAN (Award Scheme Development and Accreditation network) is an educational charity which provides a range of vocational packages for students, ranging from late primary to pre-university. Skill Force students for example, study for the Bronze and Silver Awards.

• East Renfrewshire Council – In 2005 East Renfrewshire proposes vocational courses for pupils from S3-S6 ranging from Int1 to Higher covering for example construction, Health and Fitness, Hospitality, Hair and Beauty, and Music Technology. It is very important they are given credit for their achievements. For those pupils who are successful in completing their course, they are guaranteed interviews for the next level of progression with either training providers or local employers.

• Glasgow City Council- vocational training in conjunction with Building Services, pre-vocational courses and vocational and careers information. Gateway has developed a range of programs and web-applications aimed at motivating young people to achieve their best at school by demonstrating the opportunities that await them post school. Key applications include PlanIT Plus which is a website which provides users of all ages with vocational and careers related information, enabling them to make informed decisions about their future. EVIP (Enhanced Vocational Inclusion Programme) supports vulnerable young people in vocational training in partnership with training providers and Duke of Edinburgh’s Award.

• South Lanarkshire Council – Pupils from a selection of High Schools in South Lanarkshire took part in a pilot vocational development programme. The pupils attended either Motherwell College of South Lanarkshire College to study various apprenticeship trades. An evaluation shows that the programme appears to have been a great success.

Examples of Best Practice from Scotland and Other Countries

A number of submissions gave examples of Best Practice, however not all gave detailed information. Below is a brief summary of some of the more detailed examples. Other submissions gave examples of particular projects
and initiatives but not in response to this particular question. Some of these are summarised in Appendix 1.

- East Ayrshire Council - the authority has led the way with approaches such as Framework for Intervention in Scotland. The Learning Partnership approach to the delivery of integrated services for children and young people within a single Department of Educational and Social Services has also been recognised as good practice in meeting needs.

- Highland Learning and Teaching Policy and Toolkit - Produced in 2003 it argues that the quality of learning and teaching has a major effect on pupil motivation and that to have maximum effectiveness it should be informed by current research on the psychology of learning and on pedagogies for diversity. The toolkit to accompany the policy contains resources for reflection and for associated CPD activity. Of particular interest are the support activities for probationer teachers. The council aims to strengthen CPD resource banks. Other examples given include assessment is for learning project, the Highland Council’s Support for Learning Framework and the ICS programme.

- NESTA – The National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts was established by the National Lottery Act 1998 to pioneer ways of supporting and promoting talent, innovation, creativity in science, technology and the arts. 640 awards have been made through the programmes with over £33m invested. Their submission details a number of model which piloted different ways to give pupils contact with external experts: models which use technology to engage with young people and models which develop opportunities for learning outside the classroom.

- Careers Scotland – highlighted a number of programmes around promoting awareness of industry and supporting pupils in post-school choices such as “Work Net” - a structured programme of modules with an underlying business orientated philosophy, designed to motivate and equip young people with skills and practical tools they can use to improve their personal employability.

- Angus Council – Teacher training opportunities in Positive Approaches to Management; Solution Focused Approaches; pupil involvement in paired learning- “checking Chums” – an approach to pupils predicated on formative assessment and other meta-cognitive frameworks. Other examples mentioned include Critical Skills practice in various subjects. Teacher are being trained in this practice.

- Glasgow are developing new learning communities which combine the main features of the national New Community School and a local parallel development Learning Communities ; joint working by the key agencies providing services for children and families within a structure consisting of a secondary school, its associated primary and pre-5 establishments. They are also developing the Engagement in Learning
Framework (SELF) which is a typology of how learners engage with, adapt to and assert themselves in the learning climate, in particular how they engage with teachers and peers.

- Springburn Academy have a full time department of Pastoral Care who develop and deliver programmes to all pupils on a weekly basis in a number of areas including personal relationships, communication skills, financial management and training for vocational education. The department are closely linked with the Attainment and Agenda and focus on eg individual target setting, solution focused therapy, emotional literacy and group work which raise aspirations.

Effectiveness of existing networks and structures for communicating examples of best practice

More comment was made about particular examples of networks and structures that already exist rather than views on their effectiveness.

Renfrewshire Council thought there are a number of very effective networks within Scotland for sharing good practice.

The Prince’s Trust thought that existing national structures at which people can discuss and exchange possible ways of dealing with the issue of motivation within the classroom are limited. Quarriers felt though that there had been some concern expressed about the ability of education authorities to ensure that best practice is shared between schools.

Skill Force Scotland welcomed the proposed establishment of a pupil inclusion network by the Scottish Executive to provide a forum for alternative skills providers. However, they thought the sheer number of initiatives that have emerged from the Executive in recent years has provided local authorities with both opportunities and challenges. Many of these initiatives would benefit from more cross-cutting co-operation between departments both within the exec and within local authorities. Centrally provided information about on-going best practice and successful service providers would help facilitate this greater level of cohesion. The Church of Scotland Committee on Education thought that LTS are best place to co-ordinate communication. However, the way in which the myriad of different but related projects undertaken by LTS at the request of the Scottish Executive are funded and organised makes it very difficult to co-ordinate.

Various Networks and ways of sharing best practice identified included:

- HMIE,
- LTS,
- The Ethos Network,
- ADES Inclusion network.
- Local authority staff
- Anti-Bullying network
• Job Shadowing which allows other members of staff to shadow others in different schools, co-ordinators networks
• Inter-agency seminars
• As from session 2004-05 each teacher will have more time out of the classroom. Therefore, with the help of the recently appointed local CPD co-ordinators, local authorities have more time and opportunities to promote the sharing of good practice on a developmental basis.
• In-service training sessions
• Gateway has developed websites which promote the sharing of experiences and good practice amongst agencies that work in the education, training and employment field. Glasgow is a core partner. Key websites are www.socinc.net and www.socinc-glasgow.net. Many of the Soc Inc projects are aimed at motivating young people at risk of social exclusion who require additional support to remain in learning and training.
• In East Lothian learning teams exist in the Musselburgh and Prestonpans clusters who consider research and have Celebrating success – an authority wide event

Kate Berry
SPiCe
15 February 2005
Appendix 1: Written Evidence Specific Projects

**SkillForce Scotland:** UK wide programme which places ex Armed Forces instructors into schools to allow pupils, usually aged 14-16 to undertake awards/qualifications (Duke of Edinburgh/ASDAN) and learn new skills (first aid/sports leadership) and undertake new experiences (volunteering/expeditions/teamwork tasks). The programme is in its forth year of operation in North Lanarkshire and is scheduled to expand to a further four local authority areas from August 2005.

**CSV Education for Citizenship:** promotes and supports active citizenship in schools, universities, colleges and communities throughout the UK. Activities include award schemes. A prime example of this is the Barclays New Future. For the past 10 years schools have been able to apply to BNF for a grant to undertake student led, community focused projects. Projects have included inter-generational and sports activities, multi-cultural schemes, environmental and arts programmes. Some of the key indicators are attendance, improved behaviour and improved standards. The benefits of being involved include: improved organisational and teamwork skills; enhanced confidence and self esteem; improved communication and ICT skills.

**Prince's Trust Scotland:** Youth charity enabling 14-25 year olds to maximise opportunity, develop self-esteem, improve life skills and get into work. The Trust designed and manages the UK wide xL network which is designed for 14-16yr olds who are underachieving and in danger of exclusion. Xlerate with xL programmes is managed by the Prince’s Trust in partnership with Young Enterprise Scotland, local authorities and schools. It is a 2 year programme for young people in S3 and S4, which they usually complete in place on one standard grade. With support of teachers and community education workers, each xL club of 12-15 young people works as a team. Through completing the programme each young person has the opportunity to gain an ASDAN xL award, or young people can work towards SQA Higher Still Units in Personal and Social Education. There are 106 xL clubs running in 21 different local authority areas.

**Whole School Mental Health Project in Calgary** is aimed at ensuring that students have emotional resiliency built into their whole school approach to help offset and prevent later mental health problems, alcohol and drug misuse and disengagement from post 16 and further education. The fundamental aims are ensuring from a very early age that children are safe, valued and connected and that the schools systems and structures are directed to achieving that aim. Every school is different and facilitators work with schools to deliver appropriate solutions within a framework. There is also a firm commitment to ensure that teaching staff and parents are involved and work together.

**Perth & District YMCA Smart Young People Project:** YMCA has worked very closely with secondary schools and other partners in developing the project. The project is a preventative/intervention project designed to support potentially excluded young people reengage with formal education; make the
transition from formal education to employment or training of further education and thence to stable independence. The project structure includes a residential course in Skye and work placements with local employers. Young People work on a variety of challenges which lead to the opportunity to achieve an ASDAN certificate as a student enrolled at Perth College. This is a vital aspect of the project giving students a sense of achievement.

The YMCA describe the impact of the project as “immense”. Young people participating seem happier with improved confidence and positive about the work they have done. Schools they have worked with are keen to progress the work as an integral part of how they deliver education to those who have been disengaged from formal education.

**Eco – Schools Scotland** is a programme that directly involves children and young people in decision making and in taking action to tackle environmental and sustainable development issues in the school and wider community. Children and young people must sit on the school’s Eco Committee and be involved in all aspects of the school Eco Schools activities. This empowerment gives the pupils a voice and can have a beneficial and positive effect on pupil motivation, confidence and self esteem, on discipline and on whole school ethos. By involving pupils and giving them a ‘voice’ and responsibility, the young people feel valued and respected and this can have a knock-on effect in all sorts of ways. The benefits are particularly noticeable amongst disaffected young people, pupils with learning difficulties and the less academically able. To date, 1673 Scottish schools are now registered on the Eco Schools programme.

**WWF Linkingthinking** resource contains practical ideas, tools and activities that teachers can use to develop and use this fresh and highly relevant way of looking at the world. The materials are already being incorporated into initial and chartered teacher training in partnership with Strathclyde and Dundee universities. Aims to develop thinking skills and the ability to think systematically and identify the relationships between issues. (See website for more details: [http://www.wwf.org.uk/filelibrary/pdf/wwf_linkingthinking_doc.pdf](http://www.wwf.org.uk/filelibrary/pdf/wwf_linkingthinking_doc.pdf))

**Right Track** - offers 2 full time programmes delivered from centres in North Lanarkshire and Glasgow aimed at young people with a prolonged history of non-attendance at school, behavioural issues and/or short term exclusions. The Education Initiative (EI) focuses on S4 pupils and offers programmes of counselling, personal and social development, accredited core skills and raising vocational awareness. The aim is to ensure a positive progression route. The New Generation Education Initiative focused on pupils from S2 on S3. The programme structure is similar to the EI but the aim is to reintegrate pupils back into school. Key practices to the success of the programmes include working in small groups, consistency of staff allowing relationships to be built and a flexible curriculum. Staff aim to develop a “can do “approach amongst young people.
Royal Lyceum Theatre Company is currently undertaking 3 strands of work – schools programme, youth theatre and community programme. The schools programme comprises various strands that aim to encourage schools to link with the work of the theatre company. eg Stages: a 3 stage work programme to support four productions each season, work experience placements and education resources. Programme supported by SAC, City of Edinburgh Council, ESPC and Arts Business.

Chess Development in Aberdeen’s Primary Schools: a 3 year NOF programme of Out of School Hours activities which focussed on the development of chess coaching for P4 pupils and chess after school clubs. Evaluation found that the most significant difference that chess made to classroom life was in terms of the nature of social adjustment, particularly for those pupils identified by the class teacher at the outset as exhibiting poor behaviour. It was the chess coaching input – a social relationship forged with teachers, parents and pupils that acted as a catalyst for educational development.

Scottish Storytelling Centre- based in Edinburgh it has a network of 100 full time or part time professional storytellers spread across the country as well as community volunteers and local storytelling projects. There are a number of ways that storytelling is integrated into classrooms e.g. through education authority wide festivals for children as tellers. Some councils have also funded storytellers to work side by side with teachers in developing activities together. There are signs that there is an eagerness by teachers to take up a more flexible interactive approach. Many teachers report that storytelling has transformed the culture of the classroom building trust and confidence that contributes across the school day to several different curriculum objectives. Observation suggests that storytelling enhanced thinking, listening and co-operation skills.

Steiner Waldorf Schools: Begin formal learning at age 6. When children are given an extra year in Kindergarten, or are given a curriculum that is similar to that of a kindergarten or nursery in Primary 1, they have more time to learn social skills and language and pre-literacy skills and to live in their imaginations without the need to focus on intellectual skills. Their motivation therefore remains high. The Steiner curriculum encompasses a Lower School which spans from 6 – 14. Children are therefore older when they move into Senior School and more ready to cope with additional challenges.

The Steiner curriculum places creativity at the centre of its learning experience. All subjects are presented in a creative way and wherever possible children are encouraged to learn by doing. The Steiner curriculum places equal emphasis on the practical and the academic for all pupils. The Edinburgh Steiner School is currently taking part on a Scottish Executive funded FLAT project which centres on creativity and multi-sensory learning in primary school and explores how the Steiner approach to these areas can be implemented in a mainstream context, in this case in Balgreen Primary School. Results so far are very encouraging with teachers reporting a higher
level of attainment in multiplication tables and a heightened enjoyment in stories and in art.

**Save the Children: Citizenship and Participation** Save the Children teamed up with two secondary schools in Glasgow, with funding from the British Gas ‘Here to Help’ scheme, to pilot participatory approaches to citizenship education. Working in schools with pastoral care staff, Save the Children has developed a range of opportunities to engage young people in and outside the classroom. The project aims to demonstrate how children can take responsibility for their own learning and make positive contributions to their school and wider community, including tackling the negative impact of poverty on their lives and others. The project has three specific elements: an effective student council, staff development and the dynamic youth awards. The scheme has a motivating effect on pupils facilitated by the approaches used in the scheme which involve: participation collaboration, ownership of learning, the learning environment, and group choice.

**Church of Scotland Committee on Education:** Ballikinrain Include Me In Services. Ballikinrain School looks after children and young people. The school aims to develop a policy of inclusiveness, work with other agencies, develop a flexible child centred approach. Developing individual learning plans focusing on the “whole” child with a “whole school approach” working with other agencies helps to engage and motivate young people. The school has key teachers and key teams which guarantee a parent like recognitions and encouragement, as well as support during times of stress or failure. The school also has a community support team which aims to ensure that young people are returned home to live in their communities as soon as it is practicable to do so and a family support team to provide support to families.

**Imaginate** – their main project is the Bank of Scotland Children’s International Theatre Festival. This is the children’s equivalent of the Edinburgh International Festival, with the finest performing arts from around the world performing to children across Scotland.

**GirlGuiding Scotland** – Guiding allows every girl to achieve her potential through a fun, stimulating and motivating experience. The programmes are developmental and encourage confidence, self-reliance and inter-personal skills. They foster responsibility, citizenship and maturity through activities such as mountaineering, community action and international experiences. During each session the girls are given their say in the running of the unit. All badge work is done to each girl’s ability and can be presented in many different ways –not just written. Badges reward the girls’ participation rather than achievements.

**The Big Lottery Fund:** Out of School Hours (OSHL) Learning Programme was launched in 1999. Grants were awarded between 1999 and 2001 and will run through to 2005 and in some cases to 2007. The programme was intended as a one off opportunity to set up, improve and develop out of school hours learning activities. The main aim is to provide learning activities that encourage and motivate pupils, build their self esteem and help them reach
higher standards of achievement. The intention is to particularly benefit those who suffer from disadvantage and who would benefit most from help and raise achievement. An evaluation published in 2004 found there were positive effects on young people’s attitudes to learning and some evidence of increased motivation and self-esteem. Out of School Hours Learning was particularly successful in making it easier for children to make the transition from primary to secondary school. NOPES was launched by the NOF in Scotland in 2002 consists of 2 programmes: Activities Programme- this supports out of school hours activity and Active Steps which funds activities designed to promote the role of sport in diverting children from crime or behaviours likely to lead to crime. A draft evaluation of NOPES initiative across the UK is being carried out by the Loughborough Partnership. This has been supplied for information.

The Big Lottery Fund is about to embark on the second phase of a major consultation on what the future grant programme in Scotland will be. The findings of the Committee’s inquiry could inform the development of grant programme, within a national framework of particular themes, by ensuring that appropriate means and methods are used to motivate children and young people to make these improvements.

The Scottish Arts Council Education Department is dedicated to the promotion of the arts in education in both its formal and wider senses. It supports a number of initiatives within schools and local authorities such as Creative Link Officers who are based in local authorities and access local, national and international professional arts experiences. Cultural Coordinators work closely with schools and facilitate a wide range of activities which might include visits by artists, trips to museums and opportunities for children to create and perform. Their submission also outlines 6 case studies of specific projects. In partnership with the Future Learning and Teaching team from the Executive they are also piloting an Arts Across the Curriculum Project. This is based on a model developed in Chicago where teachers plan and teach alongside artists, delivering the curriculum using the creative process of the arts to act as a catalyst for learning. Pilots in 7 local authority areas are due to start in August 2005.

Fairbridge is a national charity that enables young people from disadvantaged urban areas to develop the self-belief, confidence and skills they need to enjoy a fairer chance to succeed in life. The under 16s programme is made up of young people who have difficulty engaging with the classroom environment. They use a variety of means to motivate them either to re-engage with school or to progress into training and employment. Core programme: combination of personal support and practical learning experienced – 5 day access course that culminates in a 3 day residential excursion. There is a range of follow on courses which can last for one afternoon to 12 weeks.

Philosophical Inquiry (submission from Catherine McCall) is a method of philosophical reasoning. It develops the individuals own critical and reasoning skills. East Renfrewshire have begun a project Confidence to Earn to develop
PI materials, train staff and implement Philosophical dialogue in order to increase creativity, risk taking and citizenship.
EDUCATION COMMITTEE

Pupil Motivation Inquiry

Introduction

1. There were 78 responses to the call for evidence associated with the Committee’s inquiry on pupil motivation. These have been circulated to members and are available on the Education Committee’s website. A summary of the evidence received is included in the papers for this meeting (ED/S2/05/5/2).

2. This paper proposes possible approaches to the next phase of the inquiry based on the evidence that has been submitted to the Committee.

3. The terms of reference for the inquiry are:

To identify how all children and young people can be motivated by their school experience to enable them to achieve their full potential.

The Education Committee are particularly interested in:

- identifying which factors have a positive or negative impact on pupils’ motivation;
- how pupils’ experience outside school impacts on their level of motivation within school;
- examples of how to identify early signs that particular pupils may be disaffected by their school experience;
- examples of effective teaching approaches, learning styles and personalised learning that have a motivating influence for disaffected pupils;
- examples of approaches which ensure that vocational training and alternative curriculum experiences are recognised and valued appropriately;
- examples of best practice from Scotland and other countries; and
- the effectiveness of existing networks and structures for communicating examples of best practice.

Possible approaches and timetable

4. The approach proposed here is to conduct a programme of visits and evidence sessions based on four key groups involved with pupil motivation: children and young people, teachers, parents and employers.

5. There is a degree of uncertainty about the parliamentary timetable beyond the Easter recess and it will also be necessary to assign a significant amount of Committee time to consideration of the Additional Support for Learning code of practice and associated subordinate legislation which is anticipated in April/May.

6. The first option in terms of a timetable is predicated on two factors:

- conduct main witness sessions and visits after mid May to avoid possible scheduling difficulties;
• complete and publish report before the summer recess.

7. It is envisaged that four Wednesday sessions are to be allocated, two of which could be visits and two of which would be evidence sessions. The dates for these four sessions are 11 May, 18 May, 25 May and 1 June (with the last session to incorporate evidence from the Minister). These would be complemented by a final workshop (8 June) to include a facilitated discussion with people who the Committee had visited and heard evidence from plus invited representatives from the Scottish Youth Parliament. This would allow the report to be drafted, considered by the Committee and completed prior to the summer recess.

8. However, this option allows for only two sets of visits and two witness sessions taking three panels each, including the Minister. Although a reasonable number of visits may be achieved on the two days allocated by organising two or more visits concurrently, members may wish to allocate more time for witness hearings and also allow for more time for questioning of witnesses at each meeting by having two rather than three witness panels. This would require some four evidence sessions in total.

9. This could be achieved either by:
   • visits taking place on non-business days, so that a pair of visits and a meeting are held in the same week; or
   • extending the timetable for the completion of the inquiry, so that the report is published after rather than before the summer recess. This would enable the programme of visits and the programme of evidence hearings to take place consecutively. Under this option, visits would be organised on 11 and 18 May; oral evidence would be taken on 25 May, 1, 8 and 15 June (with the last session to incorporate evidence from the Minister) and a final workshop on 22 June (as discussed above in paragraph 7). This would be followed by a formal committee discussion on the scope of the report, either on that day or on 29 June (the final meeting before the summer recess).

10. This last option would have implications for the second part of the Committee’s early years inquiry which would be deferred to the autumn term.

11. On the basis of the written evidence submitted, it is proposed that the clerks explore possible visits and witnesses for oral evidence hearings and return to the Committee with specific proposals on 16 March. These might include the following.
   • A visit to Glasgow to discuss with teachers and young people their attitudes to, and strategies for, handling pupil disengagement and motivation. Visits to individual schools could also be arranged.
   • Visit to another local authority eg South Lanarkshire Council which has a range of projects that could demonstrate how out-of-school activities can contribute to motivating pupils and how parents are involved.

12. In terms of formal evidence sessions, the teaching unions, alternative providers (e.g. Fairbridge, Right Track, Prince’s Trust), uniformed organisations together with young people, the Scottish Arts Council together with staff from relevant projects, the SPTC
(for parents) and the Association of Directors of Social Work (for the importance of the non school context) may be relevant. The Committee has already indicated that it would like to hear from Learning Teaching Scotland and the final evidence session would take evidence from the Minister.

SMART Project

13. There is an option for the Committee to make the best use of its time by conducting some work on this inquiry on a date which is available before the Easter recess. The SMART Young People Project works with groups of young people who have become disengaged from the formal education system (see Annex 1). The clerks have spoken to the chief executive of Perth and District YMCA (which coordinates the project) and it would be possible to meet some young people involved with the project while they are on their work placements on 23 March and also to meet young people who have been through the scheme before.

Action

14. The Committee is invited to:

- AGREE that there should be a programme of visits and evidence sessions based around the four key groups: children and young people, teachers, parents and employers (see paragraph 4);

- DECIDE whether to:
  - organise two sets of visits and two evidence sessions of three panels each, including the Minister and complete the inquiry before the summer recess, or
  - organise two sets of visits and four evidence sessions of two panels each, by holding visits on non-business days in the same week as formal meetings and complete the inquiry before the summer recess, or
  - organise two sets of visits and four evidence sessions on consecutive Wednesdays and take the draft report of the inquiry after the summer recess;

- AGREE, on the basis of the written evidence received, the approach to organising visits and witnesses for oral evidence outlined in paras 11-12 above and ASK the clerks to explore possibilities and report to the Committee by 16 March;

- AGREE to hold a final workshop with people who the Committee had visited and heard evidence from, plus invited representatives from the Scottish Youth Parliament;

- AGREE to visit the SMART Young People Project in Perth on 23 March.
SMART YOUNG PEOPLE PROJECT

A preventative/intervention project designed to support potentially excluded young people reengage with formal education; make the transition from formal education to employment training or, further education, and thence to stable independence.

The SMART Young People Pilot Project works with groups of 15 young people from Perth Secondary Schools who had been identified by School and YMCA staff as disengaging with formal education.

Project Partners:

Young People Parents Schools Staff Perth College
Local Employers Perth and District YMCA (Lead Partner) Local Rotary Club

Perth and Kinross Council Education and Childrens Services Department
Columba 1400 Community and International Leadership Academy
Funders – these have included Communities Scotland, Scottish Executive, Perth and Kinross Council, Scottish Enterprise Tayside, Scottish Drugs Challenge Fund, Rotary Club of Perth St Johns and local Churches.

Project Structure

1. Set up: YMCA and School staff identify young people who could benefit from the project. The young people are interviewed by YMCA staff with a view to making it clear to them what they would receive from the project and what they would be expected to put in to the project.
2. Phase One: Pre-residential
3. Phase Two: Residential
4. Phase Three: Post Residential

Phase One:

♦ YMCA staff have four structured meetings with the group prior to their visit to the Columba 1400 Centre in Skye. These are held out of school at the operational bases of four local employers.

♦ On each of the visits to these local employers the group have the use of a Board/Training Room; they receive a buffet lunch; a senior member of the management team of the organisation speaks with them briefly; they have a guided tour of the operational base; they have the continuing use of the Board/Training Room for the remainder of the day to do basic group work, team building etc. this allowed the group to begin to build a sense of cohesion.
Phase Two:

♦ Four YMCA Youth Work Staff accompany the group to the Columba 1400 Centre for an eight day residential. Here the young people participate in the highly successful Columba 1400 Leadership Academy which is an “inwardbound course” encouraging the young people to
  i) articulate their own dreams for their future
  ii) identify the strengths which they have which will assist them in realising those dreams
  iii) identify those areas where they need help and support and consider where they could access that support

This has a dramatic effect on the self esteem of the participants

The Columba 1400 Centre was recently visited by the First Minister.

Phase Three:

♦ On their return to Perth the young people enter into pre-arranged work placements in two five day blocks with local employers. These work placements have a profound impact on the young people and motivate many of them to re-engage with formal education: some participants have asked if instead of doing 8 standard grades could they do four or five and spend some time at College. Several have attended College as an alternative to school.

♦ Each young person has a simulated job interview which, along with the work placements, provides a great opportunity and a real “buzz” amongst the group.

♦ In addition to their work placements the young people continue to meet as a group with YMCA’s staff to ensure their ongoing motivation and to address personal issues. The group visits Careers together to familiarise them with the building and staff encouraging their future use of this local resource.

♦ YMCA’s staff are also available for the young people to contact directly in the event of any crisis in their ongoing development both during the immediate course follow up period and thereafter. YMCAs Youth Work staff continue to be available to them in school both at agreed times and informally. They can also access YMCA staff at any time in the course of YMCAs ongoing programme.

Perth College Involvement:

During the lifetime of the project each young person works on a variety of Challenges which lead to the opportunity to achieve an ASDAN certificate (similar to an SVQ but more portfolio based) as a student enrolled at Perth College. Again the sense of achievement which this gives to the young people cannot be over estimated, it was a vital part of the project.

Project Impact:

The Depute Rector of one school said: “the young people are happier, their confidence in communicating with adults has greatly improved. They seem a bit more satisfied with life and very positive and communicative about the work they have been doing in the project. They are so excited about it. It shows in what they say and do. I don’t want to loose this”
Scottish Executive Education Department and Enterprise, Transport and Lifelong Learning Department

Subject: Pupil Motivation - briefing for the Education Committee

Date: 17th February 2005

Introduction

In Scotland, education is directed to the development of the personality, talents and mental and physical abilities of children and young people to their fullest potential (Standards in Scotland’s Schools etc Act 2000). Our national priorities for education promote achievement and attainment, and learning for life. The motivation of children and young people to learn and to engage with opportunities for their personal and social development is central to the Scottish Executive’s agenda for education.

The Scottish Executive is undertaking a range of programmes of work to enable schools to become environments which help to motivate pupils; and to provide learning experiences and opportunities which motivate pupils, and which increase their motivation for the future. Four main programmes are outlined here. Further information is provided on the particular interests outlined by the Education Committee.

Main programmes providing a framework for schools to motivate pupils

Ambitious Excellent Schools

Ambitious Excellent Schools sets out an agenda for Scottish education which builds on the vision of the National Priorities. Key features of the agenda which will impact on schools’ capacity to provide experiences that motivate pupils are the commitment to greater choice and opportunity for pupils to help each of them realise their own potential; and more freedom for teachers and schools to tailor the learning to the needs of individual pupils.

Through this agenda, there will be greater recognition of young people’s broader achievements in their talents and interests, and their contribution to their schools and communities. There will be greater access to specialists in subjects such as music, art, drama and PE.

Opportunities will be developed between schools and colleges to provide new learning opportunities and qualifications, and different learning environments. More out of school hours opportunities will also be developed, including residential experiences, to develop skills and confidence.

Learning will become personalised, involving pupils and their parents in planning learning and reviewing progress.

Curriculum for Excellence

The Curriculum for Excellence provides a broad framework in which young people’s understanding, values and capabilities are enhanced, as well as academic skills. The framework of the Curriculum for Excellence requires that schools enable all young people to become successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors. It explicitly requires that among the outcomes we see in pupils, they are enthusiastic and motivated learners; have self respect and respect for others; have an enterprising attitude and ambition.
Determined to Succeed

Determined to Succeed is about providing pupil-centred, active approaches to learning, including enterprise and entrepreneurial activities and work-based vocational opportunities for pupils over 14 years, supported by careers guidance.

Supporting pupils

It is clear that educational outcomes are poorer for some groups of pupils, and that some pupils become disaffected early in their school career. Determined to Succeed is responding to evidence that pupil-centred approaches can help to reduce the disaffection of those pupils engaged on enterprise programmes or other personal development programmes.

The increasing personalisation of learning also requires a high level of responsiveness to pupils’ support needs. The Scottish Executive recently reported on the national review of guidance in schools, *Happy, Safe and Achieving their Potential (2005)*. Ten standards of personal support for pupils now describe expectation that all pupils must receive the support they need, when they need it. Help to overcome challenges and difficult circumstances is essential to ensure that pupils can gain the most from their learning and other opportunities in school and in their communities.

Further examples of initiatives relevant to pupil motivation

Identifying factors that promote motivation or lead to disaffection

The Scottish Executive is ensuring that pupils’ own views and experiences inform policy development. The Trojan Project is a virtual network of young people disengaged from school, supported by projects providing alternative programmes of education. Around 15 organisations around Scotland support young people to respond to questions posed by Scottish Executive policy makers. Replies are posted in formats chosen by the young people and shared on a website.

Research evidence is continually gathered to inform policy making and new initiatives, such as the Prince’s Trust XL programme, are evaluated. Examples of current research includes an investigation of links between mental and emotional health and behaviour in schools.

Anecdotal information from education authorities suggests that the Education Maintenance Allowance for pupils over 16 is helping to improve attendance for this age group.

Early identification of disaffection

The Scottish Executive is supporting a pilot in Glasgow City Council of SELF (Social, Emotional Learning Framework). SELF is an assessment school which will help schools identify in individual pupils the wide range of factors that may enhance or become barriers to their learning. This pilot will complete in 2006, when the Executive will consider national dissemination.

Effective Teaching and Learning

The Scottish Executive is supporting a range of pilots. A number of pilots focus on the promotion of positive behaviour in schools, to reduce conflict and disaffection. These include a curriculum resource to develop personal and social skills (Cool in School, Fife); a teacher skills training course (Teacher Empathy Project, Edinburgh); restorative practices in schools (Fife, Highland and North Lanarkshire).
Two pilots in particular are developing approaches which aim to build a positive ethos in the whole school environment. The Motivated School has been developed by Alan Maclean and as well as being further developed in conjunction with the pilot of SELF in Glasgow, it is being presented as a 'training for trainers' opportunity for national dissemination in the summer. Solution Oriented Schools is a whole-school approach being piloted in Moray, which involves staff and schools in solution-focused skills.

The Future Learning and Teaching programme (FlaT) is supporting a number of pilot projects:
- Mindscape and Young Enterprise Scotland and piloting the Entrepreneurial Spirit Programme in five secondary schools
- Multi-sensory learning and creativity project in Edinburgh, to explore the transfer of Steiner approaches to mainstream education
- Activating Children’s Thinking Skills project in East Ayrshire
- Learning for Living and Earning in Glasgow
- A range of projects exploring new approaches to Curriculum Flexibility
- A range of projects exploring creative use of ICT to enhance learning and teaching and curriculum flexibility

[www.flatprojects.org.uk](http://www.flatprojects.org.uk)

The School/College review is highlighting good practice around Scotland where positive collaboration between schools and colleges is leading to a wider range of learning opportunities for pupils, and the introduction to a new learning environment for some pupils, which is enhancing motivation for learning.

The Xlerate programme has been developed by Determined to Succeed, in partnership with the Hunter Foundation, the Prince’s Trust and the Prince’s Scottish Youth Business Trust. It builds on the success of the XL Programme (now operating in over 60 clubs in schools throughout Scotland), and introduces enterprise and entrepreneurial activities into XL’s personal and social development programme. The XL programme has been shown to improve attendance and increase pupil’s motivation in other aspects of school life, as well as providing pupils with accreditation of their achievement through the ASDAN scheme.

**Dissemination of Good Practice**

All of the pilot projects and initiatives supported by the Executive are disseminated through a range of websites and publications targeted at the education community. We are exploring new approaches such as Round Table events for headteacher to headteacher sharing of practice; education authority – led consultancy and support to other authorities to implement new approaches; in addition to conferences and seminars.